# India's

# Third Universal Periodic Review 2017

# Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh

Vice chancellor, National Law University Delhi

# Dr. Aparna Chandra

Assistant Professor, National Law University Delhi



# National Law University Delhi

Sector-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110078, India

॥न्यायस्तत्र प्रमाण स्यात्॥



Published by
National Law University, Delhi Press
Sector-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110078
+91-11-28034991; +91-11-28034255
Website: http://www.nludelhi@ac.in

© NLUD Press 2018

(For Private Circulation Only)

ISBN: 978-93-84272-14-2

No part of this publication can be reproduced in any form or by any meanswithout prior permission of the Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi

Note: Due care and diligence has been taken while editing and printing thisbook. Neither the author nor the publisher of the book holds any responsibility for any mistake that may have inadvertently crept in.

The publisher shall not be liable for any direct, consequential, or incidental damages arising out of the use of this book.

In case of binding mistake, misprints, or missing pages etc., the publisher's entire liability, and your exclusive remedy, is replacement of this book within one month of purchase by similar edition/reprint of the book.

Printed and bound in India by
Tanuj Process
A-21/27, Naraina Industrial Area
Phase-II, New Delhi-110028
+91-99-1001-7080; +91-98-9142-7908

# **CONTENTS**

S.No.	<b>Particulars</b>	Pg. No.
1.	Introduction	5
2.	India's National Report for UPR III	11
3.	Compilation of UN and Treaty Body Reports on India by OHCHR	63
4.	Summary of Stakeholder Submissions on India	93
5.	NHRC's Submission for UPR III	137
6.	Opening Statement of Attorney General for India at the Third Universal Periodic Review of India	157
7.	Statement of Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh Vice Chancellor, National Law University Delhiat the Third Universal Periodic Review of India	169
8.	Report of the Working Group on India's UPR with List of Recommendations for India	173
9.	India's Response to Recommendations made at UPR III	225
10.	The Universal Periodic Review Process: A Critical Appraisal	237

# **INTRODUCTION**

#### INTRODUCTION

Since its inception in 2006, the UN Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review ("UPR") has become the central arena for international evaluation of each UN member state's human rights record. This international peer review mechanism is based on a periodic self-assessment by each country of its human rights record, achievements and challenges, supplemented by reports from UN human rights experts, entities, treaty bodies, national human rights institutions, and civil society organizations. The UPR mechanism is a consultative, co-operative, dialogue - oriented platform that emphasizes broad based stakeholder involvement in the preparation and follow up to national reports.<sup>2</sup>

Once every four years, each country presents its report to the Human Rights Council, and every other country has the opportunity to ask questions, make comments or provide recommendations to the State under Review ("SuR"). These non-binding recommendations can either be accepted by the SuR or may be noted (but not accepted) by it. In subsequent rounds of review, each country has to report back to the Human Rights Council on "the implementation of the accepted recommendations and the development of human rights situations in the State under Review."

- The Basis of Review as per Resolution 5/1, annex IA is as follows:
  - "1. The basis of the review is:
    - (a) The Charter of the United Nations;
    - (b) The Universal Declaration of Human Rights;
    - (c) Human rights instruments to which a State is party;
    - (d) Voluntary pledges and commitments made by States, including those undertaken when presenting their candidatures for election to the Human Rights Council (hereinafter "the Council").
- In addition to the above and given the complementary and mutually interrelated nature
  of international human rights law and international humanitarian law, the review shall
  take into account applicable international humanitarian law."
  - See e.g., HRC Resolution 5/1 and HRC Resolution 16/21.
- Follow up to Human Rights Council resolution 16/21 with regard to the Universal Periodic Review, A/HRC/DEC/17/119, dated June 17, 2011.

7

#### Introduction

As per the Human Rights Council Decision 17/119, dated 17/6/2011, the general guidelines for preparing the UPR reports state the following requirements:

- A. Description of the methodology and the broad consultation process followed for the preparation of information provided under the universal periodic review;
- B. Developments since the previous review in background of the State under review and framework, particularly normative and institutional framework, for the promotion and protection of human rights: Constitution, legislation, policy measures, national jurisprudence, human rights infrastructure including national human rights institutions and scope of international obligations identified in the "basis of review" in resolution 5/1, annex, section IA;<sup>4</sup>
- C. Promotion and protection of human rights on the ground: implementation of international human rights obligations identified in the "basis of review" in resolution 5/1, annex, section IA, national legislation and voluntary commitments, national human rights institutions activities, public awareness of human rights, cooperation with human rights mechanisms ...;
- D. Presentation by the State concerned of the follow-up to the previous review;
- 4 The Basis of Review as per Resolution 5/1, annex IA is as follows:
  - "1) The basis of the review is:
    - (a) The Charter of the United Nations;
    - (b) The Universal Declaration of Human Rights;
    - (c) Human rights instruments to which a State is party;
    - (d) Voluntary pledges and commitments made by States, including those undertaken when presenting their candidatures for election to the Human Rights Council (hereinafter "the Council").
  - 2) In addition to the above and given the complementary and mutually interrelated nature of international human rights law and international humanitarian law, the review shall take into account applicable international humanitarian law."

8

- E. Identification of achievements, best practices, challenges and constraints in relation to the implementation of accepted recommendations and the development of human rights situations in the State;
- F. Key national priorities, initiatives and commitments that the State concerned has undertaken and intends to undertake to overcome those challenges and constraints and improve human rights situations on the ground;
- G. Expectations of the State concerned in terms of capacity-building and requests, if any, for technical assistance and support received.

These guidelines were reiterated, with additional details in the Guidance Note for preparing National Reports for the Third Cycle of Review.<sup>5</sup>

India was one of the first countries to be reviewed under the UPR mechanism. It has now completed three cycles of review in 2008, 2012 and 2017 respectively. One of us, Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh, has assisted the Government of India in drafting national reports for India for all three cycles of review. Dr. Aparna Chandra assisted the Government in preparing India's national report for the third cycle of review.

To enable dissemination of information about India's 3rd UPR, in this compilation, we have put together the relevant documents relating to India's third UPR. These include India's National Report; the compilation of UN information; summary of stakeholder reports; report submitted by India's National Human Rights Commission; outcome report of India's review; Opening Statement by the Attorney General of India (as leader of the Indian delegation) at the Human Rights Council; and statement made by Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh, Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi (on the process of preparation of the National Report).

<sup>5</sup> OHCHR, 3rd Cycle Universal Periodic Review National Report – Guidance Note, https://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/generaldocument/pdf/ohchr\_guidance\_national\_report\_3rdcycle\_en.pdf

#### Introduction

To place India's third cycle of review in context, we have also included herein an article co-authored by us titled "The Universal Periodic Review Process: A Critical Appraisal" which appeared in the 2017 issue of the National Human Rights Commission Journal.

# Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh

Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi

# Dr. Aparna Chandra

Assistant Professor of Law, National Law University, Delhi

# India's National Report for UPR III



# **General Assembly**

Distr.: General 23 February 2017 Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Twenty-seventh session 1–12 May 2017

National report submitted in accordance with paragraph 5 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 16/21\*

India

GE.17-01931(E)







<sup>\*</sup> The present document has been reproduced as received. Its content does not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations.

#### Introduction

With one-sixth of the global population, India is the world's largest democracy that is home to a multi-ethnic, multi-religious, multi-linguistic population that has lived together for millennia with an ethos of respect for diversity and plurality. Supported by a rights oriented constitutional framework, a secular polity, and independent judiciary, a range of national and state level commissions that monitor compliance with human rights, a free press, and a vibrant and vocal civil society, India continues its endeavours towards fulfilling its human rights obligations. Recognizing the universality, indivisibility and interrelatedness of all human rights, India places equal emphasis on the civil and political rights and freedoms of its citizens as well as their socio-economic development. Aware that historical factors as well as extant social structures can render certain communities more vulnerable to exclusion, marginalization and human rights violations, India prioritises, through a range of protective and affirmative measures, the attainment of liberty and development for all. In the spirit of leaving no one behind, India follows the motto of "Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas" (all together and development for all).

# I. Process for the preparation of the report

# A. Approach

2. This national report has been prepared in compliance with the United Nations Human Rights Council Decision 17/119. This report emphasises measures that the State has undertaken for the protection, promotion and fulfilment of such commitments since the previous round of review. Where possible, the report catalogues the targets, achievements, shortfalls and indices for evaluating the effectiveness of State action. At the same time, India asserts that numeric measurement is not the only criteria for assessing its human rights record. For India, as for any other country, the realization of human rights is a work in

progress, and this report documents the steps taken by the country towards this goal.

- 3. As far as possible, this report has been drafted in line with the informal guidance note issued by the OHCHR dated November 8, 2016. Most of the recommendations accepted by India in the previous review pertained to socio-economic rights which are subject to progressive realization through continuing action. Therefore, instead of classifying recommendations as full, partial or not implemented, this report uses the thematic clusters provided in Annex 2 of the guidance note as the framework for the report. Within each thematic cluster, the report first provides an overview of the recommendations accepted by India in the previous round and voluntary pledges made by India, if any. It then explains the advancements in implementing these recommendations/pledges. Further, under the same thematic heading, the report details any other emerging issue or development that falls within the scope of the theme but was not subject of an accepted recommendation or pledge.
- 4. The report aims to enable engagement, conversation, and dialogue on how best to proceed towards the shared goal of advancement of human rights, and to this end, highlights the achievements, challenges and constraints present in India's human rights journey.

# B. Methodology

5. India believes in using the UPR national report drafting process as an opportunity to receive feedback on its laws and policies for advancing human rights. For this reason, India followed a broad-based consultative process in drafting the national report. The Government of India requested the National Law University, Delhi (NLU, Delhi) to assist with preparing the initial draft of the report. NLU, Delhi organized a series of national level consultations with civil society representatives, national human rights institutions and commissions, and academicians

to aid in the identification of issues, achievements, challenges and constraints relating to advancing human rights in India. Government representatives attended all the consultations. They also attended five regional consultations and one National Consultation which were organized by the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC). A draft of the national report was published online for public comments. In a series of inter-ministerial meetings, the feedback received through this consultative process was relayed back to the relevant Ministries.

# II. Implementation of accepted recommendations and voluntary pledges, other developments

# A. Cross cutting issues

### **Inclusive sustainable development**

- 6. At the second review, India committed to continuing its efforts towards socio-economic development and poverty eradication. It agreed to provide more resources for the enjoyment of economic and social rights, and to make efforts towards ensuring that such rights are available to all, especially vulnerable groups like women, children, poor people and minorities. Towards this end, the country also agreed to put in place monitoring mechanisms to ensure that the objectives of its progressive policies are achieved. India has also pledged to continue to foster a culture of transparency, openness and accountability in the functioning of the Government, as enacted in the Right to Information Act.
- 7. India attaches utmost priority to poverty eradication and achieving an inclusive sustainable development. Its policies and priorities mirror the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.<sup>1</sup>
- 8. India believes that inclusive and equitable development is the key to securing a life of dignity, security, empowerment and freedom for

- all. For this reason, India has put in place a robust set of socio-economic policies to address the various basic needs of people, including health, education, housing, poverty alleviation, women empowerment, food security, social security measures and the like. Acknowledging the need for sustainable development, and the potential conflict between competitive growth and inclusive growth, India directs its policies towards enabling economic growth consistent with the imperative of ensuring that the benefits of such growth reaches all sections.
- 9. An example of this commitment is the Stand-Up India Scheme which was launched in 2016 to facilitate bank loans to members of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and women entrepreneurs for setting up greenfield enterprises in manufacturing, service or trading sectors.
- 10. The 2005 Right to Information Act has been a flagship legislation to vastly improve government accountability and transparency. The Government is committed to supporting the users of the Act against harassment and injury. In furtherance of this commitment, the Whistleblowers Protection Act was passed in 2014.
- 11. To aid efforts towards reducing corruption and increasing accountability, the Lokpal and Lokayuktas Act, 2013 was enacted. The Act establishes ombudsmen for inquiring into allegations of corruption against public functionaries.
- 12. To prevent leakages due to corruption, and to ensure the targeted delivery of scheme benefits, India has introduced the Aadhaar Unique Identification Number, which provides single window access to a range of information about beneficiaries and helps in identification of beneficiaries through the use of biometric data, with the aim of ensuring that benefits and subsidies reach the right person. To further institutionalize the project, the Aadhaar (Targeted Delivery of Financial and other Subsidies, Benefits and Services) Act, 2016 was passed by Parliament. As of date, 1.08 billion Aadhaar cards have been issued.

13. A key plank of India's development agenda, as well as of its push towards good governance and the creation of a knowledge society is the "Digital India" programme. Launched on 1st July 2015, the programme has the vision to transform India into a digitally empowered society through increased connectivity, increased access to knowledge, delivery of services, and e-governance through digital means.

# Climate change and environment

- 14. India is committed to continuing its efforts in relation to its environmental policies. India has articulated its belief in ethical and people centric approach to climate change through the concept of "Climate Justice". The Supreme Court of India has also recognized the right to clean environment as part of an individual's right to life guaranteed by the Constitution of India.<sup>2</sup>
- 15. India has taken a lead to push for strong domestic climate action for a more sustainable development pathway. India is striving to provide access to modern and clean energy sources to all its people.
- 16. India has prioritized renewable energy technology and has launched an ambitious domestic effort to achieve 40 percent cumulative electric power installed capacity from non-fossil fuel based energy resources by 2030<sup>3</sup>.
- 17. India facilitated the entry into force of the Paris Agreement by ratifying it in October 2016, and thereby renewing its commitment to achieve its Nationally Determined Contributions (NDC).
- 18. In addition to the bold and ambitious domestic action, India pushed for the acceptance of the principles of historical responsibility, equity, and Common But Differentiated Responsibility (CBDR) to defend the interests of the people in developing countries.

- 19. India played a constructive role at the Kigali meeting in October 2016 to amend the Montreal Protocol to include HFCs in its ambit.
- 20. Dedicated policies have been launched to sensitize citizens on developing city-forests and to promote climate-smart green cities.<sup>4</sup> India has been enthused by the growth in forest cover from 21.05% in 2011 to 21.34% at present, and will endeavour to increase it further.
- 21. Water resources conservation is a priority for the Government. Concerned about the continuing pollution of water bodies and depletion of ground water, innovative schemes have been launched to provide better irrigation facilities <sup>5</sup> and conservation of wetlands, <sup>6</sup> existing water bodies, and their respective ecosystems. <sup>7</sup> The Model Groundwater Bill, circulated to states by the Central Government, has so far been adopted by 15 states. <sup>8</sup>
- 22. India has launched initiatives to ensure cleaner air in its cities. A National Air Quality Index has also been launched by the Government for citizens' awareness regarding air quality in their vicinity. India remains concerned about the quality of air, and is committed to taking all necessary measures to address this issue. The Supreme Court of India and the National Green Tribunal are also monitoring the issue.
- 23. In recognition of its commitment to sustainable development, India is working towards moving to cleaner sources of energy for its developmental activities. Continuous efforts are being made to provide affordable and clean energy including through targeted schemes<sup>10</sup> and separate budgetary allocations.<sup>11</sup> India has been focusing on renewable energy technology including nuclear energy.
- 24. In compliance with its obligations under the UNFCCC, India launched the Climate Change Action Programme, 2014 which aims to create and strengthen the scientific and analytical capacity for assessment of climate change and provide a framework for implementation of the

National & State Action Plans on Climate Change. India has already submitted two national communications to UNFCCC providing details of its compliance with the Convention.

25. Recognizing that implementation of environmental related norms requires improvement, India continues to work towards their effective enforcement.

# Human rights and counter-terrorism

# 1. Training security personnel on human rights

- 26. India committed to continue and intensify its efforts towards training and orientation of security and other law enforcement officers towards human rights.
- 27. India remains committed to instilling human rights values in its security personnel. Indian Security forces receive training in human rights as well as in humane methods of security enforcement through programmes developed by the NHRC through training programmes at police academies, army training institutes, and other such agencies.
- 28. India remains committed to work with other countries to finalise the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.

#### 2. Other issues

29. Concerns have been raised with regard to Armed Forces Special Powers Act (AFSPA) however, AFSPA is applied only to disturbed areas where the ordinary law and order machinery is deemed insufficient to deal with exigent circumstances like insurgency. Whether or not AFSPA should be repealed or the provision for sanctions should continue, is a matter of on-going and vibrant political debate in the country. While on the one hand in 2015 one state withdrew the

application of AFSPA to that state, in another the judiciary has asked the Government to consider imposing AFSPA in parts of that state. <sup>12</sup> A Government appointed committee recommended that there should be no sanction requirement for prosecutions of security personnel for sexual offences.

- 30. The Supreme Court of India has upheld the constitutionality of AFSPA and has laid down strict guidelines for exercise of powers under AFSPA.<sup>13</sup> Recently, the Court held that use of excessive force or retaliatory force by the armed forces of the Union is not permissible in the course of the discharge of their duty under the Act, and that AFSPA does not allow blanket immunity to perpetrators of unjustified deaths or offences.<sup>14</sup>
- 31. There is a view that provisions of the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967, which allow the state to detain a person without charge for up to 180 days and limit the power of Courts to grant bail in pending cases, could be misused. These provisions have been enacted in order to deal with the exigent threat of terror and insurgency. Recognizing that state response to these threats cannot violate human rights standards, India is committed to invoking these powers only in exceptional circumstances.

# B. Civil and political rights

# Right to life, liberty and security of the person

#### 1. Torture

- 32. India committed to ratify the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.
- 33. India remains committed to ratifying the Convention. The Law Commission of India is examining the changes required to domestic

21

law prior to ratification. The Government has requested the Law Commission to examine and give a comprehensive report covering all aspects of criminal law so that comprehensive amendments can be made in Indian Penal Code (IPC), Code of Criminal Procedures (CrPC) and Indian Evidence Act, etc. In the meantime, acts of torture remain punishable under various provisions of the Indian Penal Code. The higher judiciary also serves as a bulwark against such violations.

# 2. Enforced disappearances

- 34. India pledged to ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances.
- 35. India is a signatory to the Convention and is concerned with enforced disappearances. To address this issue, India is cooperating with the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances by reporting facts of cases from time to time. To protect against disappearances from police custody, the NHRC has also issued extensive guidelines on arrest to supplement guidelines issued by the Supreme Court in this regard. Through its training programmes, the NHRC continues to educate police and security personnel to prevent such violations.

# 3. Right against arbitrary arrest and detention

- 36. To strengthen the constitutional guarantee against arbitrary arrest and detention, and in order to limit the abuse of the arrest power, the Supreme Court issued guidelines in 2014 directing police officials not to arrest persons for offences carrying sentences of seven years or less, except in exceptional circumstances, and directed judicial magistrates to ensure compliance with arrest norms.<sup>17</sup>
- 37. The National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) regularly monitors complaints of illegal arrest and detention. Between 2012 and

2016, NHRC registered 2,361 cases of illegal arrest, of which 1,075 were disposed of in this time period. NHRC issued directions in 82 cases and compensation in 22 cases. 5,370 cases of unlawful detention were registered by NHRC in this time period, of which 2,297 were disposed of. NHRC issued directions in 198 cases and recommended monetary relief in 46 cases. In both instances a bulk of the cases were transferred to State Human Rights Commissions.

# 4. Extra judicial killings

38. India remains cognizant of the human rights implications of extrajudicial killings, and has taken measures towards ensuring accountability for such violations. The Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions recognized in his report on India that there has been a general drop in unlawful killings in the last few years. NHRC has in place a robust monitoring mechanism for cases of extrajudicial executions. In 2014, the Supreme Court of India issued extensive guidelines for effective and independent investigation of such deaths, including mandatory registration of first information reports in cases of encounter deaths, magisterial inquiry into the case, investigation either by the Crime Investigation Department or another independent agency, and prohibiting out-of-turn promotions or gallantry awards for police officers involved in such killings until the genuineness of the encounter is determined. 18 The judiciary also monitors investigation in specific instances, as for example in the Extra Judicial Execution Victim Families Association case, where the Court held that every death caused by armed forces in a disturbed area shall be enquired into by NHRC and CID.19

# 5. Death penalty

39. Indian law requires that the death penalty should be imposed only in the "rarest of rare cases."<sup>20</sup> Only where the crime committed is so heinous as to 'shock the conscience of society'. In 2015, the Law

Commission of India reported that the rarest of rare doctrine does not provide a clear, consistent, and non-arbitrary standard for determining who should be given the death sentence. The Commission recommended the eventual abolition of the death penalty for all crimes, and as a first step for all crimes except terror and waging war. The Report of the Law Commission of India is under consideration by the Government.

- 40. Three terrorists were awarded death sentence in India between 2012 and 2015. Subsequent to fair trial under rule of law, all three were convicted of terror related offences that had resulted in loss of lives of innocent people and threatened peace and security of the nation.
- 41. Cognizant of concerns that long periods of incarceration on death row pending a decision on clemency amounts to torture, the Supreme Court has held that such delay is a ground for commuting the death sentence. The Court has also laid down various guidelines for greater procedural safeguards for persons under sentence of death.<sup>21</sup>

# Administration of justice and access to justice

- 42. India agreed to further promote equal access to justice for all, committed to working towards reducing backlog and delays in the administration of cases in courts, and providing more legal aid to the poor and marginalized.
- 43. To address judicial delays and backlogs, the Law Commission of India has studied and made recommendations on institutional changes to facilitate timely justice.<sup>22</sup> This report is under active consideration by the Government and the Supreme Court of India. The Government of India is also coordinating with the judiciary to explore other avenues for addressing this concern. One such effort is through the National Mission for Justice Delivery and Legal Reforms which has been launched with the specific aim of reducing delays and arrears in the judicial

system. Through its effort, the sanctioned strength of judicial officers increased from 17,715 at the end of 2012 to 21,320 as of June 2016.

- 44. Access to justice remains a priority for India. Legal Services Authorities across the country provide legal aid to marginalized and vulnerable communities. Between 2012–13 and 2016–17 (up to September, 2016), 6.12 million eligible persons including women, children, persons in custody, persons belonging to Scheduled Castes/ Scheduled Tribes and backward classes, have been provided free legal aid. Recently, legal aid has been extended to persons under sentence of death, to enable them to make effective representations for clemency.<sup>23</sup> The Supreme Court has issued directions to legal services authorities for maintaining the quality of legal aid provided by them.24 In addition, newly set up One-Stop Crisis Centres provide survivors of sexual violence with legal aid.
- 45. The Government of India has partnered with UNDP to facilitate access to justice for marginalized communities.<sup>25</sup>
- 46. To address the special legal needs of children, the National Legal Services Authority has formulated the NALSA (Child Friendly Legal Services to Children and their Protection) Scheme, 2015.26
- 47. NALSA has also introduced the NALSA (Legal Services to the Mentally III and Mentally Disabled Persons) Scheme, 2015 to provide legal aid and other assistance to mentally ill and mentally disabled persons in their interface with the legal system.
- 48. India has taken various steps to provide timely justice to persons accused of crime. The Government issued a directive to all state governments to implement Section 436A, Criminal Procedure Code to reduce overcrowding of prisons. It also recommended the constitution of under-trial review committees in every district to periodically assess cases of under-trial prisoners with a view to their early release from incarceration.

25

49. In order to ensure that conditions of incarceration in prisons across India are consistent with protecting the human rights and dignity of prisoners, regarding foods, clothing, sanitation and health, the Government approved a new Model Prison Manual 2016, which includes gender-specific health measures for women, gender sensitization of the prison staff, provisions for children of women prisoners, and the like. The Manual also provides for inspection of prisons and specifies the rights of prisoners sentenced to death. The Supreme Court has also taken cognizance of conditions of incarceration, and has directed prison officials to ensure that the prisoners live with basic human dignity regarding food, clothing, sanitation, and health.<sup>27</sup>

# Fundamental freedoms and participation in public and political life

# 1. Freedom of speech and expression

- 50. India accepted a recommendation to ensure safe working environment for journalists.
- 51. India recognizes the centrality of free speech and expression to its constitutional order. At the same time, in order to protect the country's pluralistic character, its multi-ethnic and multi-religious social fabric, as well as to promote social harmony, a range of laws prohibit speech that has harmful social consequences.<sup>28</sup> Some of these laws, like those criminalizing defamation and sedition, have been upheld by the Supreme Court, which has found them compliant with the right to free speech.<sup>29</sup> The Supreme Court of India did strike down Section 66A of the Information Technology Act for being overbroad and impermissibly impacting the right to free speech and expression.<sup>30</sup>
- 52. The Press Council of India (PCI) works towards ensuring safety of journalists. It ensures that the freedom of the press is preserved and protected. It has set up a sub-committee and has submitted a report on

this issue to the Government, which is currently under consideration. The PCI has issued letter in 2016 to all states/union territories to provide data of cases filed on the issues of threats/attacks/killings of journalists along with the current status of the cases. The Government has also taken cognizance of the need for gender specific measures for the protection of women journalists.

# 2. Human rights on the internet

53. India recognizes the importance of extending free speech guarantees to activities on the internet. At the same time, recognizing the potential for misuse of the internet for inciting violence, spreading rumours and hatred or committing other illegal activities, In order to prevent arbitrary use of this power to block content on the internet, the Supreme Court of India has put in place various adequate procedural safeguards such as the right to appeal a blocking decision, and the requirement for reasons in writing for issuing a blocking order.<sup>31</sup>

# 3. Right to privacy and surveillance

- 54. Government of India has decided to set up the Centralized Monitoring System to automate the process of Lawful Interception & Monitoring of telecommunications. It is likely to be completely operationalized in 2017.
- 55. India believes that its surveillance programme furthers its national security interests, and that safeguards in the law, including safe transmission of content, requirement for authorization from senior officials, and the existence of a Review Committee to oversee such authorizations, are sufficient to address concerns regarding privacy and freedom of speech. However, in recognition of the potential of such a system to impinge on the freedom of speech, the Government is in the process of legislating on right to privacy.

# 4. Human rights defenders

- 56. India is committed to ensuring a safe working environment for people engaged in promoting and protection of human rights. The NHRC also treats the protection of Human Rights Defenders as a priority issue and has set up a platform for reporting rights violations and providing them compensation.
- 57. At the same time, India believes that the activities of the human rights defenders should be in conformity with the legal framework of the land and the rights guaranteed by our Constitution.

# 5. Freedom of religion

- 58. India committed to strengthening its efforts to guarantee freedom of religion to all.
- 59. Recognizing the importance of religious freedom for the safe and secure enjoyment of human rights and life with dignity for all, India remains committed to protecting its secular, multi-ethnic, multi-religious, pluralistic character, and combating instances of religious intolerance, violence and discrimination. The government is duty bound to ensure that there is complete freedom of faith and that everyone has the undeniable right to retain or adopt the religion of his or her choice without coercion. India views anti-conversion laws as important safeguards against coercion and inducement to convert or reconvert from one religion to another in a multi-religious society.
- 60. To strengthen its response for aiding victims of communal violence, the Government has enhanced compensation to victims of communal violence from Rs. 300,000 to Rs. 500,000. This is in addition to directions from courts, especially the Supreme Court, on rehabilitation packages and other responses for aiding victims of communal violence.

61. The Government of India has issued Communal Harmony Guidelines which lay down Standard Operating Procedures to deal with communal violence.

# Combating all forms of human trafficking

- 62. India committed to reinforcing and accelerating its efforts towards combating human trafficking by implementing monitoring mechanisms to stop trafficking; and towards protecting and rehabilitating victims of trafficking.
- 63. Through amendments to its criminal laws, India now provides stringent punishment for trafficking.<sup>32</sup>
- 64. The Government of India has set up 330 Anti Human Trafficking Units in collaboration with UNODC, to provide an effective and coordinated law enforcement response to trafficking. To strengthen implementation of anti-trafficking laws, various training programmes for law enforcement officials as well as judges are conducted routinely.<sup>33</sup> The Supreme Court of India is also seized of the matter, and has directed state governments to create standard operating procedures for responding to trafficking, particularly of children.<sup>34</sup>
- 65. India has entered into collaborations with neighbouring countries such as with Bangladesh, for bilateral cooperation for prevention of human trafficking between the countries.
- 66. In recognition of the special vulnerability of children to trafficking and related violations, the Government of India has launched operations to rescue missing children. Through Operation Smile and Operation Muskaan, over 28,000 children were rescued in 2015–2016 alone. The Khoya Paaya scheme enables citizen participation in tracking missing children.

- 67. Recognizing that a law enforcement response is only a partial step towards addressing the multiple human rights violations that a trafficked person suffers, India has also put in place various schemes for rehabilitation of survivors of trafficking.<sup>35</sup> Apart from the general schemes that seek to empower vulnerable persons who are most likely to be trafficked, India has put in place various schemes that provide measures tailored to the specific needs of trafficked persons through providing them legal services, shelter and counselling, amongst others.
- 68. To comprehensively address issues relating to human trafficking, the Government is in advanced consultations with stakeholders on a new Anti-Human Trafficking Bill.
- 69. India has also been working towards effective implementation of laws prohibiting and abolishing the system of bonded labour. The NHRC has a specific mandate in this regard. To ameliorate the conditions of persons engaged in bonded labour, the Government of India recently revised the Centrally Sponsored Scheme for Rehabilitation of Bonded Labourers. India is also working on strengthening social protections for such persons.

# C. Economic, social and cultural rights

# Right to social security

- 70. India agreed to continue its efforts and action in the promotion of social security and labour policy. It also agreed to further continue its efforts to spread the model of rural growth in the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA).
- 71. The Employees' Provident Fund (EPF) Scheme and the Employees State Insurance (ESI) Scheme continue to be the two major social security schemes for the organized sector. The Prime Minister has launched the 2nd Generation Reforms of the ESI Corporation for better

coverage and implementation of the scheme. The EPF Scheme is calibrated regularly with a continuous expansion of benefits, including enhancements of the wage ceiling.

- 72. Since persons employed in the unorganized sector are most vulnerable to destitution in the absence of social security, this sector has been a priority area for India. The Government of India has launched and strengthened various schemes, most of them under the umbrella of the Unorganized Workers (Social Security) Act, 2008.<sup>36</sup> Under the flagship National Social Assistance Programme (NSAP), five schemes provide monetary and other assistance to the elderly, persons below the poverty line, widows and persons with disabilities.<sup>37</sup> Allocation of funds for the NSAP has increased from Rs. 84.47 billion in 2012–13 to Rs. 106.35 billion (approx.) in 2015. As of date, approximately Rs. 432.95 billion has been allocated for this project, and has reached approximately 144 million beneficiaries. Also, the Pradhan Mantri Atal Pension Yojana was launched in 2015 and is aimed primarily at the unorganized sector, though it is open to all citizens between the ages 18 and 40.<sup>38</sup>
- 73. In order to ameliorate vulnerabilities due to ill health, under the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana, smart card based cashless health insurance cover is provided to families below the poverty line, as well as to various categories of workers in the unorganized sector.<sup>39</sup>
- 74. The Government has launched several schemes to provide insurance protection to all citizens at a nominal sum. The Pradhan Mantri Suraksha Bima Yojna for accident insurance, and the Pradhan Mantri Jeevan Jyoti Bima Yojna for life insurance are two flagship insurance schemes of this nature. The Aam Aadmi Bima Yojana provides life insurance cover to those living below or marginally above the poverty line.<sup>40</sup>

75. The Government remains committed to better implementation of all these schemes in order to progressively provide a stronger social security net to its citizens.

# Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work

- 76. India committed to promoting the right to equal opportunity for work and at work.
- 77. India is in the process of consolidating existing labour laws into four codes<sup>41</sup> to ensure transparency and consistency across the board. Amendments are pending in Parliament to bring the existing Factories Act in line with technological advances and the fast-changing global economy. The aim is to achieve occupational safety, prevention of health hazards and diseases, regulatory compliance and transparency in inspection, and encouragement of labour-intensive enterprises.
- 78. The Government has overhauled the mechanism for evaluating compliance with labour laws. Through a Unified Labour Web Portal (Shram Suvidha Portal) employers now have to file returns detailing their compliance with labour laws. The Government believes the move from an inspection based mechanism to a self-reporting mechanism will streamline compliance with labour laws, and targeted inspection based on objective criteria will better protect rights of employees consistent with the developmental goals of the country.
- 79. While the Government is cognizant of demands for ratification of ILO Conventions 87 and 98 and recognises that this issue is critical, certain outstanding issues remain, particularly those relating to the scope of rights to be granted to government employees. India is in discussion with ILO as well as other member countries with similar legal norms to resolve these issues.

- 80. India's flagship employment programme MGNREGA, an entitlement based law covering the entire country. India is making active efforts to address leakages and resources availability problems. Allocation for the MGNREGA has consistently increased each year. The Government is enthused that women availed 57% of the 1.4 billion person days of work pursued under this Act. Apart from the MGNREGA, employment generation through cooperative training programmes has been extremely encouraging.<sup>42</sup>
- 81. After guaranteeing employment, as the next step, the Prime Minister has called upon the nation to transform India into the "Skill Capital" of the world through the "Skill India Initiative." The youth are the main beneficiaries of the Skill India Initiative campaign. For the marginalised section, the Government launched the Seekho aur Kamao scheme in 2013. The Government of India has recently launched the Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana which has imparted skills to 19 million youth so far. Through this and other schemes, the Government facilitates generation of, and access to, employment opportunities. Through the National Urban Livelihood Mission, the Government enables economically vulnerable communities to organize themselves into Self Help Groups and to contribute to their skill development to facilitate salaried- or self-employment. Skills training under this mission has been imparted to 1.4 million beneficiaries in 2012–2015.

# **Economic empowerment of women**

82. India has taken various steps to promote equal participation by women in the workforce, to ensure a safe and dignified work environment, and to facilitate overall socio-economic empowerment of women. The Factories Act is being amended to remove discriminatory provisions, and to require employers to provide greater facilities for women employees.<sup>46</sup> In a radical move, India has decided to open combat roles to women in all sections of the military, at par with men.

- 83. To address low Labour Force Participation Rate and Worker Population Ratio of women as compared to men, India has introduced schemes and programmes to overcome the economic, social, and cultural barriers that hinder women's equal participation in the workforce.<sup>47</sup> For example, the National Rural Livelihoods Mission focuses on generating employment and empowerment opportunities for rural women through Self-Help Groups, and through support for women in agriculture.<sup>48</sup>
- 84. Schemes have also been put in place to empower women through skills training, educating them about available schemes, and through facilitating women's financial inclusion.<sup>49</sup> For example, to enable access to credit and thereby to income generating opportunities, the Nari Arthik Sashaktikaran Yojana (NASY) provides loans at 4% per annum to women.
- 85. Recognizing that women bear a large share of familial care giving responsibilities, which often limits their ability to participate equally in the workforce, the Government is committed to facilitating restructuring of workspaces to make them more sensitive to women's social circumstances.<sup>50</sup> The Government has proposed providing extended maternity leave, crèche facilities and day care centers, flexible working hours and safe and dignified work environments to facilitate women's equal access to employment opportunities.<sup>51</sup>
- 86. Women and other disadvantaged groups form the bulk of domestic workers who belong to the unorganized sector, and are often subject to violence, abuse, and discrimination. Currently, the protection of rights and welfare of domestic workers is the prerogative of each State. However, the Government of India is in discussions with civil society organizations on a proposed national law for the protection, welfare and social security of domestic workers.<sup>52</sup>

# Right to an adequate standard of living

### 1. Poverty eradication

- 87. India committed to strengthen its poverty alleviation strategies and provide better living conditions for its citizens, including through consolidating programmes and socio-economic measures essential to achieve poverty reduction and social exclusion. In pursuing these policies, India undertook to pay special attention to its rural population, women and children.
- 88. Poverty eradication is a key element of India's developmental goals. As of 2012, 21% of India's population is under the poverty line. India is intensifying its efforts to align its policies with SDGs by focusing on education, health, gender, skills and employment, energy and infrastructure development, etc.
- 89. India has put in place a range of schemes and services that empower marginalised communities to overcome poverty, such as Direct Benefit Transfers, and entitlement based schemes that guarantee employment, mobilize the rural poor and caters to occupational aspirations of the rural youth.<sup>53</sup> To circumvent corruption and to ensure that the subsidies and benefits reach citizens directly, the Government has been issuing AADHAR cards.

# 2. Adequate food

- 90. India agreed to promote food security, support efforts to raise the standard of nutrition, and specifically to adopt the bill on food security and strengthen the Public Distribution System.
- 91. India has taken steps to eliminate all forms of malnutrition, by increasing food productivity. To achieve this goal, the National Food Security Act, 2013 aims to provide food and nutritional security to up

to 75% of the rural population and 50% of the urban population through improvement in the Public Distribution System. The Act also makes provisions to meet the nutritional requirements of pregnant women, malnourished children, and homeless and destitute persons. This law has now been implemented throughout the country. The National Nutrition Mission, launched in 2014, supplements the law and, in particular, aims to prevent and reduce maternal and child under-nutrition. To ensure better access to food subsidy, the Government is moving towards the digitization of ration cards. The Act also has a strong gender component, in keeping with India's support for gender mainstreaming in food security programmes. The Act provides that the eldest adult woman in a household be designated the head of the household for the purpose of issuing ration cards under the Act.

- 92. India has put in place the National Intellectual Property Policy, 2016, in recognition of the importance of a public interest oriented approach to intellectual property for enhancing access to healthcare, food security and environmental protection, as well as other sectors of vital socio-economic importance.
- 93. India continues its efforts to ensure effective implementation of the Mid-day Meal scheme in schools. The Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS), which was introduced to ensure better nutrition, health, and overall development of children aged 0–6 years and nutritional and health support to pregnant and lactating mothers, has now been expanded to an additional 200 districts. This scheme has benefitted approximately a 100 million persons of which 18.9 million are pregnant and lactating mothers and the remaining are children under the age of 6. The 12th five year plan aims at strengthening the existing ICDS.<sup>54</sup>

# 3. Sanitation and safe drinking water

94. India committed to accelerating sanitation coverage and increase access to safe and sustainable drinking water in rural areas.

- 95. Consistent with the SDGs on sustainable management of water and sanitation for all, India has pledged to achieve access to adequate and equitable sanitation and hygiene for all and to end open defecation, paying special attention to the needs of women and girls and those in vulnerable situations, by 2030.
- 96. The Swachh Bharat Abhiyan (Clean India Campaign) is a nationwide programme launched in 2014 that aims to facilitate community-led and collective behavioural change in practices of sanitation.<sup>55</sup> One of the goals of the programme is to achieve an Open Defecation Free (ODF) India by 2019. To this end the Government is providing monetary incentives for building individual household latrines as well as for construction of community toilets.<sup>56</sup> The success of the campaign is reflected in that the sanitation coverage in rural areas was 38.76% in 2012–13, which has increased to 55.33% as of September, 2016.<sup>57</sup>
- 97. In 2013, new guidelines were framed under the National Rural Drinking Water Programme for improving its implementation. India has met the target for halving the number of households without drinking water supply in rural areas.
- 98. Under the Swachh Vidyalaya Campaign the Government has built separate toilets for boys and girls in every government school.<sup>58</sup>
- 99. Manual scavenging continues to persist in various part of the country. In order to abolish undignified and unsafe practice, India has enacted the Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Act, 2013.<sup>59</sup>

# Housing and land

100. To achieve the SDG of Sustainable Cities and Communities, the Government has launched various measures such as the SMART Cities

programme for establishing sustainable model cities;<sup>60</sup> the Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation to provide amenities for improving the quality of life of the urban poor and marginalized; the Pradhan Mantri Gramin Aawas Yojana and Housing for All Mission 2022 to provide better housing facilities; and the Rajiv Aawas Yojna to integrate slums into the formal housing system and to generate affordable housing for the urban poor.<sup>61</sup> In addition, the National Urban Livelihood Mission provides permanent shelters for the urban homeless. In rural areas, the MNREGA now includes within its ambit the construction of houses.

- 101. To ensure inclusive access to housing, the Government also provides preferential allotment in housing facilities under various schemes to marginalized communities such as minorities.<sup>62</sup>
- 102. To ensure protection of rights of homeless persons, under directions of the Supreme Court the process of physical verification of available shelters for urban homeless persons in each State/UT is underway. The verification process will also check whether the shelters comply with the operational guidelines for the Scheme of Shelters for Urban Homeless under the National Urban Livelihoods Mission (NULM).<sup>63</sup>
- 103. The Right to Fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Act 2013 was passed by Parliament to provide a humane, participative, informed and transparent process for land acquisition. The Act also aims to bring about an improvement in the post-acquisition social and economic status of the affected persons.
- 104. Under the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act as amended in 2012, 44,27,613 claims have been filed and 17,46,338 titles have been distributed as of

May, 2016. A total of 3,863,025 claims have been disposed of, which is 87.25% of the total claims received.<sup>64</sup>

# Right to health

105. India committed to strengthening and further supporting initiatives towards guaranteeing the right to health. In particular, India agreed to take steps towards improving access to health, especially access to maternal health and access to adequate obstetric delivery services and sexual and reproductive health services, including safe abortion and gender-sensitive comprehensive contraceptive services. It agreed to take further steps towards reducing maternal and child mortality. India also committed to taking effective measures to fully implement the National Rural Health Mission.

106. In pursuance of its constitutional obligations as well as the SDGs, India aims to "ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages." Internationally, India has promoted Yoga as a system of holistic approaches to health and well-being. India's efforts have been warmly welcomed by the international community by adopting the resolution for celebrating the International Day of Yoga on June 21 every year in the General Assembly in 2014. Within the country, the National Urban Health Mission was launched in 2013 as a sub-mission of the overarching National Health Mission with the National Rural Health Mission as the other sub-mission. Specific policies provide targeted resources to aid efforts to combat diseases prevalent in India. 65 India is encouraged in its efforts by its successes. The country met its target of 50% reduction in tuberculosis prevalence and resultant mortality. India received poliofree certification in March 2014. In 2013, the WHO found that India has more than halved the number of malaria cases since 2000 from 2 million to 882,000. In February 2016, India launched the National Framework for Malaria Elimination (NFME) 2016-2030 which outlines India's strategy for elimination of the disease by 2030.

107. The Mental Health Policy was launched in 2014 to provide universal access to mental health care by enhancing the understanding of mental health and strengthening leadership in the mental health sector at all levels.<sup>66</sup>

108. Schemes like The Janani Suraksha Yojana provides institutional delivery services to pregnant women who fall below the poverty line, so as to reduce maternal and infant mortality. While monetary assistance to beneficiaries has been streamlined through direct bank transfers, delay in opening bank accounts due to poor banking services has posed difficulties in implementation in some states. <sup>67</sup> India is encouraged in its efforts by the decline in Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) from 58/1000 live births in 2004–05 to 40/1000 live births in 2013. The Neonatal Mortality Rate (NMR) as per SRS 2013 is 28/1000 live births while the Under-five Mortality Rate (U5MR) is 49/1000 live births. The Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) of India for 2011–13 is 167/100,000 live births as compared to 178 for 2010–12.

109. India has also moved to a new strategic approach, the RMNCH+A (Reproductive, Maternal, Newborn, Child and Adolescent Health) in 2013, to focus its attention on all the life stages including adolescents for targeted health interventions. The National Policy on Children, 2013 also aims at providing equitable access to comprehensive, and essential, preventive, curative and rehabilitative health care, of the highest standard, for all children before, during and after birth, and throughout the period of their growth and development. In December, 2016 the Prime Minister has announced a scheme to provide pregnant women who undergo institutional delivery and vaccination of their children, a financial aid of Rs. 6,000.

110. Recognizing the need for awareness building as a key element in health related interventions, India launched programmes such as the Rashtriya Kishor Swasthya Karyakaram (RKSK) in 2014, which includes the imparting of health education through community based

interventions, and the Scheme for Promotion of Menstrual Hygiene among adolescent girls in rural areas. Further, the fourth phase of the National AIDS Control Programme (NACP-IV) was launched in February 2014 which supports the training and capacity building of staff in STI/RTI Clinics (Suraksha clinics), provision of counsellors, availability of free colour-coded standardized STI/RTI drug kits, and the like. Recognizing that Men Having Sex with Men (MSMs) are a High Risk Group for HIV/AIDS, and that due to social and legal stigma such persons may not have adequate access to health services, the National AIDS Control Organization has implemented various schemes to reach out to sexual minorities. <sup>69</sup> India pharma's contribution of 80% of the world's antiretroviral drugs to combat HIV/AIDS is well recognised.

- 111. Although the overall sex ratio has increased by 7 points to reach 940 in Census 2011 as against 933 in Census 2001, the child sex ratio (0–6 years) has shown a sharp decline from 927 females per thousand males in 2001 to 919 females per 1,000 males in 2011. As a result, the Government has intensified its efforts to effectively implement the Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994. The Prime Minister's Beti Bachao Beti Padao campaign was launched in 2014 with the objective of improving the sex ratio and combating female foeticide.
- 112. In line with the SDG to ensure healthy lives and promote wellbeing for all, at all ages, the Government has taken the initiative of starting the National Initiative on Care for Elderly, under which special attention is given to geriatric care.<sup>70</sup>
- 113. Through the National Programme for Health Care of the Elderly which is currently implemented in 100 districts of 21 states, India seeks to provide easy access to preventive, promotive, curative and rehabilitative services for the elderly.

# Right to education

- 114. India agreed to further promote children's right to education, especially through the continued implementation of a non-discriminatory and inclusive policy to guarantee quality education to all children. India agreed to reinforce its efforts in providing free and compulsory primary education, and to work towards the smooth implementation of the 2010 Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act. With universalisation of primary education and achievement of gender parity, the Education for all programmes (Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan) is now moving into the second phase with its focus on affordable and quality secondary education. India also agreed to continue with action to include human rights education in school curricula.
- 115. Education is a fundamental pillar of development in any country. India therefore prioritises inclusive and quality education for all. In pursuance of this, there was a 4.9 per cent increase in the education budget in 2016.
- 116. Recognizing the need for equitable access to quality education for all sections of the society, India has initiated various measures to raise the literacy standards of excluded and marginalized groups and facilitate their access to education. Government scholarships for schooling and higher education targeted at women, Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, and other backward classes seek to improve their access to education.<sup>71</sup> Additional scholarships have been introduced for persons with disabilities at all levels of education, including for studies abroad.<sup>72</sup>
- 117. Padhe Bharat Badhe Bharat, a sub-programme of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, has been initiated to improve the quality of primary education.<sup>73</sup>
- 118. Various schemes and measures promote higher education for marginalized groups, and facilitate their access to advanced educational

opportunities. Scholarships like the Swami Vivekananda Single Girl Child Scholarship for Research in Social Sciences and PRAGATI (Providing Assistance for Girls' Advancement in Technical Education Initiative) work towards these goals. The Government has initiated a scheme called UDAAN, to increase the enrolment of women, Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and minorities in professional education, especially in science and mathematics.<sup>74</sup> Special scholarship schemes have been launched to facilitate access to quality higher education for students from the North Eastern states.

- 119. To address demands from marginalised sections, the Government has constituted a committee to advise the Government on matters relating to the educational needs and issues faced by Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe students. Universities have also been directed to establish equal opportunity cells to facilitate responsiveness to the needs of disadvantaged groups.
- 120. India has been prioritizing ICT enabled enhancement of learning opportunities to facilitate access to the highest quality educational resources.<sup>75</sup>
- 121. India is working towards a policy for meeting the educational needs of children between 0-6 years. The National Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) Policy of 2013 permits universal and equitable access for all children in a decentralized manner and ensuring a continuum of ECCE in a life cycle approach.<sup>76</sup>
- 122. The national curriculum for school education of the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT) has included human rights education component in social science subject. Teachers training programmes has also been prepared under the guidance of NHRC.

# D. Rights of specific persons or groups

#### Women

123. India committed to continuing its efforts and initiatives for eradicating violence and discrimination against women, and for the equality and empowerment of women. Towards this end, India agreed to continue incorporating gender perspectives in its programmes and development plans. India specifically committed to improving measures for preventing violence against women, including sexual violence. India agreed to continue promoting the rights of women in their choice of marriage, and to address the skewed sex ratio, including through more stringent enforcement of the prohibition on pre-natal sex selection.

124. India is undertaking a range of measures to improve the condition of women in the country.<sup>77</sup> To enable the integration of gender perspectives into policy formulation and implementation, and to ensure that women's concerns are given equal weightage in developmental agendas, the Government of India remains committed to its Gender Budgeting Scheme. So far, 56 Ministries/Departments have confirmed setting up this monitoring mechanism.

125. Various forms of violence like acid attacks, stalking, public stripping, voyeurism, etc, have now been incorporated into the penal code as distinct offences.<sup>78</sup> Schemes for compensating and rehabilitating victims and survivors of various forms of violence have been put in place by the state governments.<sup>79</sup> Women's helplines provide immediate and holistic response to those facing violence, including through urgent intervention, as well as facilitating access to health services, counselling and legal aid.

126. India remains committed to combating sexual violence against women and children. In the aftermath of a tragic gang rape in New Delhi in December 2012, the Government of India set up the Justice J.

- S. Verma Committee to suggest measures for addressing violence against women. Based on the recommendations of this Committee, various law reforms were introduced. Laws relating to sexual violence were comprehensively reviewed and overhauled to recognize the multiple forms and sites of sexual violence. New procedures and evidentiary requirements were also put in place to aid swift and successful prosecutions.
- 127. India also enacted a new law to deal with sexual violence against children of all genders. 80 This law provides for stringent punishment, special courts, as well as procedural measures to protect the child during investigation and trial.
- 128. India has enacted a law requiring employers to provide effective redressal to women complaining of sexual harassment, and to take other measures for fostering a gender sensitive, safe working place for women.81 In addition, sexual harassment has been made a distinct criminal offence.82
- 129. Apart from legislative reforms, the Government has put in place various schemes to strengthen the safety and security of women in the country.<sup>83</sup> The Nirbhaya Fund is one such example. India has also been launching one stop centres to provide single point access to women affected by violence and to provide them medical and police assistance, psycho-social support, legal aid and counselling, and temporary shelter.<sup>84</sup> The Government has recently proposed a National Policy for Women which supports a holistic approach to addressing violence against women.
- 130. India is building a gender-responsive and sensitized police force through training programmes, performance appraisal, and by encouraging 33% reservations for women in the police force.

#### Children

131. India agreed to continue its efforts to protect children from exploitation including sexual exploitation, to protect their fundamental rights, dissuade child marriage, continue efforts at rehabilitation of child labourers, prohibit corporal punishment of children, and overall give children the opportunity and assistance to grow up in an environment of freedom and dignity.

132. With over 450 million children, India is home to the largest child population in the world. The National Policy for Children, 2013 places issues relating to children within a rights based approach and recognizes children as individuals with rights and responsibilities appropriate to their age and level of maturity. The National Early Childhood Care and Education Policy, 2013, seeks to ensure a sound foundation for survival, growth, and development of children. Both policies require that children should be protected from all forms of harm and exploitation, and should be provided with a caring and enabling environment. To this end, the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015 (JJ Act) criminalizes corporal punishment.

133. The JJ Act, 2015 has overhauled the system of administration of justice in relation to children in need of care and protection, as well as children in conflict with the law. The Act has introduced new penalties for the exploitation and abuse of children, as well as measures to prevent their exposure to drugs and intoxicants. While previously, persons below the age of 18 were tried as juveniles for all offences, under the 2015 Act, persons in the 16-18 age group can be tried as adults for heinous crimes. Although this change has been criticised for not recognizing the special circumstances of children in the 16-18 age group, the Government believes that this move is necessary in light of incidents of heinous crimes being committed by persons in that age group.

134. India is encouraged by the reduction in rates of child marriage. India remains committed to working towards the elimination of this harmful practice, through enforcement of the Prohibition of Child Marriage Act as well as through awareness raising.

135. India has recently enacted the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act, 2016. 86 In order to align the child labour policy with the Right to Education Act, the new law prohibits child labour below the age of 14 except after-school work in family enterprises, and permit labour in the age group 14-18 only in non-hazardous industries.

136. The National Child Labour Policy (NCLP) is being implemented in 270 districts of the country to enable rehabilitation of children who have been withdrawn from work. Each district has special schools/ training centres which provide bridge education, vocational training, mid-day meal, stipend, health care, and recreation, amongst other facilities. The ultimate aim of the programme is to prepare children for integration into the formal education system.<sup>87</sup>

#### Persons with disabilities

137. India committed to ensuring better protection for persons with disabilities, and to prioritizing efforts to ensure equal access to education for children with disabilities.

138. 2.21% of the Indian population is disabled. India recognizes the need to take special measures to ensure that persons with disabilities enjoy the full range of human rights and fundamental freedoms, live a life of dignity, free from violence, harassment and discrimination, want and marginalization. As the first signatory to the Marrakesh Treaty to Facilitate Access to Published Works for Persons Who Are Blind, Visually Impaired or Otherwise Print Disabled, India recognizes the importance of creating an enabling legal and policy environment for

making resources, amenities and facilities accessible to persons with disabilities. To this end, India launched the Accessible India Campaign, for achieving universal accessibility, barrier free environments, and a supportive ecosystem for persons with disabilities. 88 The campaign aims to fulfil India's commitments under the Incheon Strategy, as well as facilitate access to rights under the Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities to which India is a party. Through amendment to its copyright law, India has facilitated availability of knowledge resources in an accessible format. The National Policy on Universal Electronic Accessibility facilitates equal and unhindered access to electronics and Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) products and services by persons with disabilities.

139. In December, 2016, the Indian Parliament passed a new law on the rights of persons with disabilities. This law aims to facilitate greater access to public spaces, education, employment, and healthcare, and the integration and protection of rights, particularly of persons with mental illness or disability. The Act increases the number of recognised disabilities from 7 to 21, including disability due to acid attacks, thalassemia, haemophilia, muscular dystrophy, learning disabilities and Parkinson's.

140. Recognizing the need for measures targeted at extending the benefit of developmental gains to persons with disabilities, India has also put in place a number of schemes aimed at providing them with better access to education, vocational training, financial assistance, shelter, and overall care and development.<sup>89</sup> To ensure greater access to benefits under these laws and schemes, India is implementing a Unique Identity Card for persons with disabilities.

# **Older persons**

141. India committed to ensure better protection for the elderly.

142. 10% of India's population comprises senior citizens. Recognising that elderly persons face various vulnerabilities due to their age, and consistent with our commitment to the Madrid Plan of Action, we have taken numerous steps to ensure a life of dignity for the elderly. Policies and schemes including the National Policy on Older Persons, 1999, the National Programme for Health Care of Elderly, pension schemes and legal assistance programmes, are being implemented by the Government of India in collaboration with other partners for ensuring that the elderly not only live longer but also lead a secure, dignified and productive life. By revising the Integrated Programme for Older Persons, the Government has provided assistance to various local bodies and NGOs to secure the basic needs of the elderly, productive ageing, intergenerational bonding and awareness building. India is also in the process of revising its National Policy on Older Persons taking into account changing demographic pattern, socio-economic needs, social value system and advancement in the field of science and technology over the last decade. In December, 2016, Prime Minister has announced a new scheme for Senior Citizens guaranteeing 8% interest on fixed deposit of up to Rs. 7.5 lakh with 10 years lock in and monthly payment.

# Sexual orientation and gender identity

143. India agreed to study the possibility of eliminating any criminalisation of same sex relations.

144. Section 377, Indian Penal Code, criminalizes homosexuality. In 2009, the Delhi High Court declared this section to be unconstitutional.<sup>90</sup> This decision was reversed by the Supreme Court of India in 2013.<sup>91</sup> However, the Supreme Court in February 2016 agreed to another hearing on the matter, which is now *subjudice*.<sup>92</sup> In a related judicial

development, in 2014, the Supreme Court recognized that sexual orientation and gender identity are integral to a person's personality and are "basic aspects of self-determination, dignity and freedom." The Court stated that discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation violates India's constitutional guarantee of equality. 94

145. In 2014, the Supreme Court of India recognized that discrimination, violence and prejudice based upon a person's gender identity, as well as the non-recognition of transgendered persons in law, violates India's constitutional commitments to equality, liberty and life with dignity. The Court directed the state to include transgendered persons within the categories eligible for various affirmative action schemes. In 2016, the Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Bill, 2016 was introduced in the Lok Sabha. This Bill seeks to protect transgendered persons from violence and discrimination. It also provides for equal opportunities in education, employment and residence. Simultaneously, the Government is working on an Umbrella Scheme for the Welfare of Transgender Persons. India has also taken various steps to make state practices and public spaces safe and inclusive for transgendered persons. The suprementation of the suprementation of the state practices and public spaces safe and inclusive for transgendered persons.

#### **Minorities**

146. The Government has undertaken a range of measures pertaining to minority education, skill development, access to credit, infrastructural and social development of regions with high concentration of minority populations, affirmative action measures, etc.<sup>97</sup> The Government earmarks 15% of its outlay on various schemes and programmes for socio-economic empowerment, for minorities. *Khidmat*, a toll-free helpline increases access to information on schemes for minorities.

147. The National and State Commissions for Minorities continue to monitor complaints from minority communities regarding issues of discrimination and disadvantage faced by them.

### **Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes**

148. India has put in place a robust affirmative action programme to secure substantive equality for all. Affirmative action in education and public employment, along with electoral reservations seek to ensure that access to public resources is not confined to any particular group. Recognizing that in the changed economic scenario, private employment is a key source of economic wellbeing, the Government of India has been working with industry associations to voluntarily extend affirmative action in the private sector. As a result of these efforts, many companies have adopted a voluntary code of conduct and are providing persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes with scholarships and vocational training to enhance their employability.<sup>98</sup>

149. India has amended the Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act, 1989 to expand the forms of caste based atrocities recognized under that law and has been notified with effect from 26 January, 2016. The amended Act has also introduced a new chapter on the rights of victims and witnesses. Through the creation of Exclusive Special Courts and Exclusive Special Prosecutors for offences under the Act, India seeks to provide timely and effective response to such atrocities.

150. State governments have also taken various steps to prevent and punish atrocities against scheduled castes and scheduled tribes, including through establishing special crime cells, identifying sensitive areas, and setting up state and district level vigilance and monitoring committees. The National Commission for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes also monitors cases of atrocities.

# E. Coordination with the UN, NHRIs and other stakeholders

151. India committed to continue its cooperation with the UN and other International Organizations, including through sharing good

experiences and practices with other countries and extending support in efforts to combat human rights violations. India also agreed to continue its cooperation with Special Procedures and accept requests for visits from Special Rapporteurs. India has pledged to help other countries with capacity building to promote the work of the Human Rights Council.

- 152. India agreed to further its coordination with national human rights institutions as well as well civil society organizations, and to continue involving civil society in the UPR process.
- 153. India believes that progress towards realizing its human rights obligations requires constant dialogue, engagement and coordination with various stakeholders, and in particular with other national authorities and human rights institutions. The NHRC serves as the nodal point for such coordination through the Statutory Full Commission comprising the chairs of all national level human rights commissions and institutions.
- 154. Recognizing that a vibrant civil society keeps the Government accountable for its commitments, and provides crucial feedback for drafting effective policy responses for advancing human rights, India routinely publishes proposed acts, schemes and policies for public comment and discussion, and has done the same with the draft of its National Report for UPR III. The National Policy on Children is an example of a policy drafted through such a wide-spread consultative process.
- 155. As a proud member of the United Nations, India remains committed to cooperating with international organizations as well as other countries individually in a spirit of reciprocity and comity, to raise the standards of human rights within the country and across the world. India has in place a standing invitation to UN Special Procedures mandate holders to visit the country at a mutually convenient time. Ten mandate holders have visited India since 2000 including the visit by Special Rapporteur

on adequate housing as a component of the right to an adequate standard of living, and on the right to non-discrimination in this context in 2016. Further, another two SRs visits are being scheduled for 2017–18.

#### Notes:

- India played an important part in the inter-governmental negotiations towards the finalisation of the 2030 Agenda that seeks to realise human rights for all and to leave no one behind.
- 2 Vellore Citizens' Welfare Forum v. Union of India, AIR 1986 SC 2715.
- 3 India plans to install 100 GW solar energy out of a total of 175 GW of renewable energy by 2022.
- 4 Compensatory Afforestation Fund Management Planning Authority Portal E-Green Watch (An online web portal which seeks to collect and present information to monitor and track how well CAMPA funds are achieving their ends); School Nursery Yojana (aims to brings students closer to nature and increase forest cover by planting trees for a sustainable future); Nagarvan Udyan Yojana (aims to create and develop at least one city forest in each city); National Afforestry Programme; National Green India Mission (approved as a centrally sponsored scheme in 2015); National Green India Mission and MNREGA Convergence Guidelines 2015 (aim to increase coordination between the rural sector and environment to increase forest cover in an integrated development approach).
- 5 National Water Use Efficiency Improvement Support Programme, Guidelines for Improving Use Efficiency in Irrigation Domestic and Industrial Sectors (2014), Under Pradhan MantriKrishiSinchayeeYojana (2015) (aims to achieve convergence of investments in irrigation and expand the cultivatable area to improve water use efficiency and reduce scarcity).
- 6 National Action Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Eco-Systems (2013).
- Integrated Ganga Conservation Mission NamamiGenge (2014); Ganga Management Plan (2015); Damn Rehabilitation and Improvement Project (2012); Guidelines for Continuation of Scheme on Repairs; Renovation and Restoration of Water Bodies (2013); Guidelines for Implementation for R & D Programme (2013), Jal KrantiAbhiyan (aims to consolidate water conservation and management efforts in the country through grassroot level, Panchayati Raj participation, awareness drives on conservation, security and management of water, and providing Suraj Cards for information on water requirements of various crops).

- 8 An additional 16 states have initiated procedures for the enactment of the model bill
- 9 The Delhi State Government has launched the Odd-Even vehicles scheme to ration vehicle usage and thereby reduce vehicular pollution. Delhi also now provides a real-time assessment of ambient air quality.
- Perform, Achieve and Trade Scheme (aims to achieve enhanced energy enhancement through trading of energy saving certificates based on reduced carbon emissions); National Smart Grid Mission; Energy Conservation Rules 2012; National Energy Efficient Agriculture Pumps Programme; National Energy Efficient Fan Programme; National Policy for Bio-Fuels (2015); Renewable Energy Global Investment Promotion Meet and Expo; Scheme for Ultra Mega Solar Parks and Solar Projects; Mission Innovation (A global initiative which aims to reinvigorate and accelerate global clean energy innovation with the objective to make clean energy widely affordable, create green jobs).
- 11 National Clean Energy Fund.
- 12 The Registrar General, HC of Meghalaya v. State of Meghalaya; WP (C) No. 127 of 2015 (Meghalaya High Court).
- 13 Naga Peoples' Movement of Human Rights v. Union of India, (1998) 2 SCC 109.
- 14 Extra Judicial Execution Victim Families Association (EEVFAM) v. Union of India, 2016, Supreme Court of India.
- 15 Section 43D, Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967. Similar provisions are found, for example, in the Narcotic Drugs & Psychotropic Substances Act, 1985 in Sections 36A, 42 and the Maharashtra Control of Organised Crime Act, 1999 in Section 21.
- 16 Such as those pertaining to voluntarily causing grievous hurt, or causing grievous hurt to extract a confession, etc.
- 17 Arnesh Kumar v. State of Bihar AIR 2014 SC 2756.
- 18 PUCL v. State of Maharashtra (2014).
- 19 Extra Judicial Execution Victim Families Association v. Union of India, W.P. (Cr.) 129 of 2012 (Supreme Court of India, 2016).
- 20 Bachan Singh v. Union of India, AIR 1980 SC 898.
- 21 Shatrughan Chauhan v. Union of India, (2014) 3 SCC 1, 241.
- 22 Law Commission of India (Report No. 245: Arrears and Backlog: Creating additional judicial (wo) manpower) [7 July 2014].
- 23 Shatrughan Chauhan v. Union of India, (2014) 3 SCC 1.
- 24 In Re: Inhuman Conditions in 1382 Prisons AIR 2016 SC 993.

- 25 As part of this collaboration, legal aid clinics have been set up and paralegal volunteers have been trained to provide legal aid. Legal awareness campaigns are also planned as part of this project across the country.
- 26 This scheme aims to provide meaningful, effective, and age-appropriate legal assistance to children in need of care and protection as well as children in conflict with the law, and to strengthen institutional care, counselling and support services to them.
- 27 In Re: Inhuman Conditions in 1382 Prisons AIR 2016 SC 993.
- Sections 124A, 153A, 153B, 295A, 505, Indian Penal Code 1860; Section 144, Criminal Procedure Code, 1973; Section 5, Official Secrets Act, 1923; Sections 67, 67A, 67B, Information Technology Act, 2000.
- 29 Subramniam Swamy v. Union of India, W.P. (Criminal) No. 184 of 2014, which upheld criminalization of defamation.
- 30 Shreya Singhal v. Union of India (2013) 12 SCC 73.
- 31 Shreya Singhal v. Union of India (2013) 12 SCC 73.
- 32 §§ 370 an 370A, Indian Penal Code 2013. These amendments expand the definition of trafficking and related exploitation, in line with India's obligations under the Palermo Protocol.
- 33 Specifically, the Training of Trainers (ToTs) programme for law enforcement agencies and Judicial Colloquims for judges and magistrates.
- 34 Bachpan Bachao Andolan v. Union of India (2014) 16 SCC 616.
- Amongst others, National Legal Services Authority's NALSA (Victims of Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation) Scheme 2015 is meant to provide legal services to address concerns of victims of trafficking; Swadhar Greh Scheme seeks to provide temporary accommodation to women in difficult circumstances. Through the Ujjwala Scheme, a comprehensive scheme for prevention of trafficking and rescue, rehabilitation and re-integration of victims of trafficking and commercial exploitation, the Government has created capacity to rehabilitate above 8000 women and children. This is in addition to the capacity created by State/Provincial Governments. Annually about 10,000 women availed the facility during the last 2 years.
- The following schemes are listed under the Act:
  - 1. Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension Scheme
  - 2. National Family Benefit Scheme
  - 3. Janani Suraksha Yojana
  - 4. Handloom Weavers' Comprehensive Welfare Scheme

- 5. Handicraft Artisans' Comprehensive Welfare Scheme
- 6. National Scheme for Welfare of Fishermen and Training and Extension
- 7. Janshree Bima Yojana and Aam Admi Bima Yojana
- Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana
- 37 Started in 1995, the NSAP comprises five schemes, namely
  - The Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension Scheme (IGNAOPS), wherein assistance is provided to persons aged 60 years or above and belonging to a Below Poverty Line (BPL) family;
  - The National Family Benefit Scheme, wherein upon the death of the primary breadwinner aged 18-59 years, the BPL household is entitled to compensation amount;
  - Indira Gandhi National Widow Pension Scheme (IGNWPS), wherein BPL widows aged 40-79 years receive pension benefits:
  - Indira Gandhi National Disability Pension Scheme (IGNDPS), wherein BPL
    persons with severe or multiple disabilities and aged 18-79 years receive
    pension benefits.
  - Annapurna Scheme, wherein the old-aged beneficiary is entitled to 10 kg free food grains per month.
- 38 Contributors to this scheme will be eligible for pension on a monthly basis after a certain period of contributions.
- 39 Over 37.1 million smart cards had been issued under this scheme as of 30th April 2014. The programme targets covering 70 million households by 2017.
- 40 The Scheme covered 45.4 million beneficiaries by the start of 2014–15.
- 41 Dealing respectively with Wages, Industrial Relations, Social Security and Welfare, and Safety and Working Conditions.
- 42 National Council for Cooperative Training and the National Centre for Cooperative Education. The Council conducts training programmes as per the needs of cooperative sector. Through such training, participants are equipped with the necessary knowledge, skills and aptitude required to manage the cooperative enterprises. 26934 persons have been the beneficiaries of these training programmes in the year 2016–17 (up to September 2016).
- 43 So far over 20 million youth have been trained under this programme.
- 44 Deen Dayal Antyodaya Yojana i.e. National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) (covering 864,768 beneficiaries under the 12th 5 Year Plan (up to September, 2016); The Prime Minister's Employment Generation Programme (PMEGP); National Skill Development Fund (NSDF); Sampoorna Gramin Rozgar Yojna (set

- up with the objective of providing additional wage employment in all rural areas and thereby provide food security and improving nutritional levels. A secondary objective is to create a durable community, social and economic assets and infrastructural developments in rural areas. Between 2012 and 2016, Rs. 1,693.5 billion was spent on this scheme and benefited around 350 million persons).
- 45 Many such schemes affirmatively target excluded communities for financial inclusion, promotion of entrepreneurship, and for facilitating other avenues of income generations.
- 46 S. 66, S. 22, S. 47 of the Factories (Amendment) Bill, 2014.
- 47 Women Cooperative Education Field Projects. Under this, the National Cooperative Union of India has catalyzed the formation of 270 SHGs with 2501 members. Further, 10098 women availed benefits through several income generating activities. In 2016-17 (up to September, 2016) 3831 events were conducted for 44941 participants under this programme).
- 48 The mission has covered 32.4 million rural poor households and mobilized around 2.64 million Self Help Groups, since its inception. That India has the largest women self-help group network, and that 80% of micro-credit loans are utilized by women, reflects the success of these schemes.
- 49 Support to Training and Employment Programme for Women (STEP) Scheme; National Mission For Empowerment of Women. At its 52nd meeting in 2014, the Governing Body of Rashtriya Mahila Kosh set a target of assisting ten lakh women over the next three years.
- 50 Rajiv Gandhi National Creche Scheme for Children of Working Mothers. There are 23,923 creches as of January, 2015.
- 51 Draft National Policy for Women, 2016.
- 52 Further, the National Skill Development Corporation has set up the Domestic Workers Sector Skill Council in early 2016 to ensure better employment prospects for domestic workers through skills development.
- 53 Direct Benefit Transfer; Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Act, 2005 (MNREGA) (In the financial year 2015-16, the Government had made a budgetary provision of Rs 346.99 billion for MGNREGA and in the financial year 2016-17, Rs 385 billion has been allocated for the same. Up to 18th February, 2015, 38 million households have been provided employment. The share of SCs, STs and Women is 22.6 per cent, 16.8 per cent and 55.1 percent respectively. The share of women in total person-days generated is well above the stipulation of 1/3 as per the Act. Now, at least 60 per cent of the work in terms of the cost in the district will be taken up for the activities related to development of land, water and trees). India has set aside funds amounting to Rs. 2.05 billion for Self Help

- Groups under the National Rural Livelihoods Mission, which was utilized to enter 32,573 villages, in 2013-14. *See also*, Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Grameen Kaushalya Yojana Skill Development for Inclusive Growth.
- 54 In 2012, India launched the ICDS Systems Strengthening and Nutrition Improvement Project (ISSNIP) with the assistance of the World Bank to improve the implementation of ICDS. The Kishori Shakti Yojana years has also been started under ICDS to improve the nutritional status of adolescent girls between the age of 11–18.
- 55 For this purpose, the Government has organized awareness campaigns, advertisements and mass cleanliness drives in both rural and urban areas.
- As on 30 September, 2016 a total of 90,006 villages and 27 districts of the country have been declared ODF.
- 57 241.51 lakh Individual household latrines (IHHLs) have been constructed from 2.10.2014 to 30.9.2016 under SBM(G). In addition, 15.30 lakh IHHLs have been constructed under MGNREGS since 2.10.2014. 90,006 villages have been declared Open Defecation Free (ODF) as on 30.9.2016. Also 27 districts have been declared ODF.
- 58 226,000 toilets for boys and 191, 000 toilets for girls have been constructed from 15.8.2014 to 15.8.2015 under the Swachh Vidyalaya Campaign.
- 59 This law prohibits the employment of persons as manual scavengers, the manual cleaning of sewers and septic tanks without protective equipment, and the construction of insanitary latrines.
- 60 The Smart City Mission was launched on 25 June 2015. Since the launch of the Mission and till September, 2016, total Rs. 47.01 billion has been allocated by Government of India under Smart Cities Mission. So far, 60 cities (20 cities in Round 1 in January, 2016, 13 cities in fast track round in May, 2016 and 27 cities in Round 2 in September, 2016) have been selected for development as Smart Cities under the Mission. Since the launch of the Mission and till date, Rs. 45.72 billion has been released to States/UTs under Smart Cities Mission.
- 61 Pradhan Mantri Gramin Aawas Yojana, 2016. The Government proposes to improve the standards of living conditions by providing pucca houses to all rural poor by 2022 and the Ministry of Rural Development has launched schemes to provide assistance to landless poor, and is offering grants to construct houses in hilly areas and plain areas, wherein 15.92 lakh houses out of the targeted 24.81lakh houses were constructed in the year 2013-14. As of date, Rs. 150 billion has been allocated under this scheme, benefiting over 13.35 million beneficiaries between 2012 and 2016; Rajiv Gandhi Grameen Vidyutikaran Yojana. The Rajiv Rinn Yojana scheme; Rajiv Awas Yojana Scheme.

- 62 15% of financial and physical targets under National Urban Livelihoods Mission are earmarked to benefit people below the poverty line from minority communities. Under the Basic Services to the Urban Poor (BSUP)/Integrated Housing & Slum Development Programme (IHSDP) components of JNNURM, 15% of the Central allocation is to be earmarked for the Minority communities. States/UTs were requested to give priority to the cities/slums predominantly inhabited by minority communities (i.e. where the minority population is 25% or more).
- 63 E. R. Kumar & Others Vs Union of India & Others, WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) No. 572 of 2003 dated 11/11/2016 (Supreme Court of India).
- 64 The decision making power in relation to land acquisition affecting areas covered under the Act vests with the local self-government bodies.
- 65 National Road Map for Kala-Azar Elimination, August 2014.
- 66 The National Mental Health Programme consists of various district level and tertiary/central level activities in the country. Support has been provided to establish 18 centres of excellence in the field of Mental Health and to strengthen/establish 39 post graduate training departments in mental health specialities. Additionally, the National Mental Health Programme supports activities in 339 districts.
- 67 To further its commitment to improving maternal and child health, the Government has increased allocation under the scheme from Rs. 16.06 billion in 2011–12 to Rs. 17.62 billion in 2013–14.
- 68 See also, Universal Immunization Programme, Janani Suraksha Yojana, Janani Shishu Suraksha Karyakaram Essential and Emergency Obstetric Care, Navjat Shishu Suraksha Karyakaram, Special Newborn Care Units, Newborn Stabilisation Units, Newborn Care Corners, Home Based Newborn Care, Kangaroo Mother Care, establishment of Nutritional Rehabilitation Centres.
  - The Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakaram (RBSK) was launched in 2013 to provide strategic interventions and identification of deficiencies, diseases and development delays in children. In furtherance of the Global Every Newborn Action Plan (ENAP), the India Newborn Action Plan has been launched to take forward the Global Strategy for Women's and Children's Health. Mission Indradhanush, launched in 2015, seeks to immunize children against seven life-threatening but vaccine preventable diseases.
- 69 Targeted Interventions (TI) have been made by NACO through schemes which involve providing care and counselling through support group meetings where discussions on issues like sexual identity, dealing with harassment and substance abuse, amongst others. A Link Worker Scheme has been introduced in rural areas around a community-centred model which will help build the area's capacity of HIV/AIDS prevention through building awareness, creating a demand for access to health services and reaching out to High Risk Groups.

- 70 Central assistance is also being provided to support the Free Drugs and Diagnostics Service Initiative, 2015 and to strengthen ambulatory services, human resources, community participation, primary health care services, family welfare centres, redevelopment of hospitals and dispensaries.
- 71 Pre-Matric Scholarship for SC students studying in classes IX and X.
- 72 http://mhrd.gov.in/sites/upload\_files/mhrd/files/upload\_document/NOS-sudentsdisabilities.pdf
- 73 For access to resources that facilitate a quality education, the National E-library has been set up with more than 1.5 million titles.
- 74 See also, National Fellowship for OBCs; New scheme of Interest Subsidy on educational loan for Overseas studies for OBC students; Dr. Ambedkar Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme for the DNT students; Nanaji Deshmukh Scheme of Construction of Hostels for DNT Boys and Girls; Dr. Ambedkar's Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme has been launched for Economically Backward Classes for OBCs.
- 75 Initiatives like E-Paathshala and SWAYAM (Study Webs of Active Learning for Young Aspiring Minds) facilitate this goal.
- 76 The Law Commission of India recently submitted a report on "Early Childhood Development and Legal Entitlements" which is under consideration by the Government.
- 77 To enable greater participation by women in the highest decision making bodies, the Women's Reservation Bill, which aims to introduce 33% reservations in Parliament, was introduced and is currently pending in Parliament.
- 78 See §§ 326A, 326B, 354A, 354B and so on, Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013.
- 79 National Human Rights Commission, Scheme for Relief and Rehabilitation of Victims of Rape, 2005 and Scheme for Relief & Rehabilitation of Offences (by Acids) on Women and Children 2009.
- 80 Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act, 2012 (POCSO Act).
- 81 Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition, Redressal) Act, 2013.
- 82 § 354A, Indian Penal Code 2013.
- 83 Amongst others, the Integrated Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) is a platform which supports a Geographical Information System (GIS) Based Call Taking which will receive a distress call and dispatch a Global Positioning System (GPS) fitted Police vehicle to the spot of violence. Further, 150 units of Investigating Units on Crime Against Women (IUCAW) have been set up in different States/

60

- Union Territories to create a dedicated investigative capacity to fast track investigation.
- 84 The Ministry of Women and Child Development formulated the scheme of Setting up One Stop Centre (OSC) to support women affected by violence which is being implemented since 1st April 2015. Under the scheme, it has been envisaged that One Stop Centres would be set up across the country in phased manner. In the first phase, funds were released to 33 States/UTs. Further, 150 additional centres are taken up in second phase during 2016-17 which have been approved for 20 States/UTs. So far 20 centres have become operational.
- 85 The objective of the Policy is to enable greater protection, participation and education of children in addition to improving their health and development.
- 86 The law stems from the recognition that children constitute a large segment of the Indian population, and that the future social, economic and political development of the country depends on their wellbeing. India is committed to protecting the rights of children, to prevent exploitation in all forms and to create a better world for the next generation.
- 87 The number of children mainstreamed into formal education under this scheme increased from 72,976 in 2012–13 to 116,957 in 2014–15. While the expenditure on NCLP has been significantly reduced in recent years, there has been a simultaneous increase in allocation of funds for various education related welfare schemes targeting vulnerable and marginalized communities. This realignment of funds ensures targeted delivery of scheme benefits to such communities.
- 88 Accessible India Campaign: Creation of Accessible Environment for Persons with Disabilities (Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities & Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment, Government of India). India has launched the National Action Plan for Skill Development for 2.5 million persons with disabilities by 2022. Model Building Byelaws have been revised in March 2016 which contain separate provisions for persons with disabilities, older persons and children. These rules are applicable to all buildings and facilities used by the public. India jointed a group of countries in voicing our support for inclusion of the needs of persons with disabilities in the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015-2013. As a member of the Asia Pacific Group, India recently hosted Working Group Sessions on Asia Pacific Decade of Persons with Disabilities constituted under the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and Pacific (UNESCAP) for implementation of the Incheon Strategy-Make the Right Real for Persons with Disabilities.
- 89 Construction of Colleges for the Deaf in Five Regions of the Country; Research on Disability Related Technology, Products, and Issues; Central Sector Scheme of "Support for Establishment/Modernization/Capacity Augmentation of Braille Presses"; Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarships for Students with Disabilities;

61

Rajiv Gandhi National Fellowship for Providing Scholarships to Students with Disabilities to Pursue Programmes; Provision of Travelling Allowance for an Attendant/Escort Accompanying a Government Servant with Disabilities on travel during tour/training; National Overseas Scholarship for Students with Disabilities for Studying Abroad; Aids/devices for Leprosy-Affected Persons; Aids/devices for visually-impaired persons; National Fellowship Scheme for Persons with Disabilities for pursuing M.Phil/Ph.D. courses; Scheme of Financial Assistance for Skill Training of Persons with Disabilities; Scheme of Setting up of State Spinal Injury Centres.

- 90 Naz Foundation v. Government of NCT160 DLT 277.
- 91 Suresh Kumar Koushal and Anr. v. Naz Foundation and Anr. (2014) 1 SCC 1.
- 92 Naz Foundation Trust v. Suresh Kumar Koushal 2016 (2) SCALE 553.
- 93 National Legal Services Authority v. Union of India (2014) 5 SCC 438, 20.
- 94 Id at 55.
- 95 National Legal Services Authority v. Union of India (2014) 5 SCC 438.
- 96 For example, some states like West Bengal and Tamil Nadu have instituted Transgender Development Boards, which have taken steps to introduce transgender-friendly washrooms in universities, supply transgender persons with health insurance and ration cards, and devise transgender-specific pension schemes. The Ministry of Social Justice & Empowerment recently took cognizance of bonded labour practices specific to transgender communities and reached out to help them.
- 97 Implementation of Sachar Committee Recommendations (Status Report as on 31st March, 2015).
- 98 935 member companies of the Confederation of India Industry have adopted the Voluntary Code of Conduct. 260,174 candidates from SC/ST community have been trained in vocational skills; 128,362 students from SC/ST community have been provided scholarships and 106 entrepreneurship development training programmes have been held. 478 member companies of the Federation of Indian Chamber of Commerce and Industry have adopted the Voluntary Code of Conduct. They awarded 2,493 scholarships to SC/ST students and trained 261,750 persons belonging to these communities. In addition to this, 38,380 students belonging to the SC/ST communities have been provided free education. 1,038 member companies of the Associated Chamber of Commerce and Industry of India have adopted the Voluntary Code of Conduct. 35,956 candidates have been trained under the Skill Development Programme and 3,387 students belonging to SC/ST communities have been provided scholarships to study in premier institutions. 3,830 students have received entrepreneurship development programmes.

# Compilation of UN and Treaty Body Reports on India by OHCHR



# **General Assembly**

Distr.: General 22 February 2017

Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Twenty-seventh session 1–12 May 2017

**Compilation on India** 

Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

# I. Background

- 1. The present report was prepared pursuant to Human Rights Council resolutions 5/1 and 16/21, taking into consideration the periodicity of the universal periodic review. It is a compilation of the information contained in the reports of treaty bodies and special procedures and other relevant United Nations documents, presented in a summarized manner owing to word-limit constraints.
- II. Scope of international obligations and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies<sup>1,2</sup>

GE.17-02866(E)







<sup>\*</sup> The present document has been reproduced as received. Its content does not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations.

- 2. The United Nations country team indicated that the recommendations contained in the previous reviews<sup>3</sup> regarding the ratification of several international instruments had not been implemented.<sup>4</sup> Such recommendations were reiterated by treaty bodies,<sup>5</sup> and the Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions also recommended that India consider ratifying Protocols I and II additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949.<sup>6</sup>
- 3. The Special Rapporteur on adequate housing as a component of the right to an adequate standard of living, and on the right to non-discrimination in this context recommended that India submit its report to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; that the recommendation made to it in the previous universal periodic review relating to housing, living conditions and poverty be implemented; and that it use the universal periodic review to commit to implementing the recommendations made to it in the report of the Special Rapporteur.<sup>7</sup>
- 4. The country team highlighted the standing invitation by India and that three mandate holders had completed their visits during the reporting period. Another 15 other special procedure mandate holders had requested a visit, of which two had been accepted.<sup>8</sup>
- 5. In 2016, the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) expressed deep regret at, inter alia, the failure of authorities to grant the Human Rights Office access to India-administered Jammu and Kashmir, given the grave concerns about recent allegations of serious human rights violations, including on the excessive use of force.<sup>9</sup>
- 6. India had contributed annually to OHCHR since 2012. 10

# III. National human rights framework<sup>11</sup>

7. The Special Rapporteur on executions indicated that the situation regarding the use of force in India had been exacerbated by what in

effect though not in law could constitute emergency measures. The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act, enacted in 1958, had regulated instances of the use of special powers by the armed forces in "disturbed areas" of the country (as declared by governors). The Act had provided wide-ranging powers to the armed forces in respect of using lethal force in various instances but had failed to provide safeguards in case of excessive use of such powers. In his follow-up report, the Special Rapporteur recalled that the Supreme Court had upheld the constitutionality of the Act and had provided several conditions on the use of the special powers conferred on the armed forces by the Act. The Government in its comments had strenuously opposed that part of the report. He also noted that a commission appointed by the Supreme Court had stated that it was time to progressively de-notify areas of the State under the Act.

8. The Special Rapporteur indicated that India should repeal or at least radically amend the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act and the Jammu and Kashmir Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act, with the aim of ensuring that the legislation regarding the use of force by the armed forces provided for the respect of the principles of proportionality and necessity in all instances, as stipulated under international law. He also indicated that it should remove all legal barriers for the criminal prosecution of members of the armed forces. <sup>16</sup> He recommended that, while waiting for the necessary repeal or amendment of the Act, India ensure that the status of "disturbed area" was subjected to regular review and that a justified decision was made on its further extension. He noted information received that the states of the North-East and Jammu and Kashmir regions continued to be declared "disturbed areas" without any deliberation, justification or reference to the scale of insurgency in the respective areas.<sup>17</sup> The country team reported that the Act had been withdrawn from Tripura in 2015, but continued to be in operation in Jammu and Kashmir and parts of the North-East. It also reported that recommendations for the repeal of the Act had been reiterated by the Justice Verma Committee and Justice Hegde Commission. 18

- 9. The Special Rapporteur indicated that India should swiftly enact the Prevention of Torture Bill and ensure its compliance with the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.<sup>19</sup> According to the country team, the Government had finalized an amended draft of an anti-torture bill that was expected to be soon placed before Parliament.<sup>20</sup>
- 10. The Special Rapporteur on executions noted that the record of the National Human Rights Commission had included important steps in protecting the right to life, but observed that the Commission's effective functioning had been partially hampered by its mandate.<sup>21</sup> Regarding the functioning of state human rights commissions, he found they inspired little confidence, owing to their lack of independence from the authorities, their limited resources and consequently their limited effectiveness.<sup>22</sup> He indicated that no steps had been taken to: amend section 19 of the Protection of Human Rights Act to provide the Commission with the express authorization to investigate members of the armed forces for alleged human rights violations;<sup>23</sup> put in place the legal basis to enable the extension of the period of one year under which the Commission could consider cases;<sup>24</sup> and review the independence and functioning of state human rights commissions to ensure compliance with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (the Paris Principles).<sup>25</sup> The country team reported that, in a recent judgment, the Supreme Court had drawn attention to the lack of resources available to the Commission and the need to strengthen its enforcement value.<sup>26</sup>
- 11. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences referred to reported failures of the thematic National Commission for Women, including by finding that no particular religious group had been targeted during the 2002 Gujarat massacre; by consistently justifying sexual assault on women as a result of "provocative dressing"; and by denying reports of sexual violence by security forces, including in regions governed by the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Acts.<sup>27</sup>

# IV. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

# A. Cross-cutting issues

# 1. Equality and non-discrimination<sup>28</sup>

12. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women reported that the lack of registration and the difficulty in obtaining an identity card had impeded women's participation, including their access to essential services.<sup>29</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was particularly concerned at bureaucratic obstacles and financial barriers preventing women from scheduled castes and scheduled tribes from registering births and obtaining birth certificates for their children.<sup>30</sup> The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) indicated that the new Aadhaar biometric identification card, issued by the authorities, was required in order to gain access to services, including education.<sup>31</sup> The country team explained the intentions of the Government to integrate the social protection system and target cash transfers through the Jan Dhan Yojana programme to facilitate financial inclusion, resulting in the creation of 250 million bank accounts; the *Aadhaar* card, which was held by about 1 billion Indians and which linked to their bank accounts; and mobile telephone applications linking the Aadhaar card to its owner's bank account (approximately 1 billion Indians had mobile telephones).<sup>32</sup>

13. In 2016, the Special Rapporteur on minority issues highlighted that, according to official data, Dalits (referred to as "scheduled castes") constituted more than 201 million people. The figure did not include Dalits who had converted or were born and raised within non-Hindu religious communities, such as the Dalit Muslim and Christian communities.<sup>33</sup> She also reported on the discrimination, exclusion, dehumanization, stigmatization and violence suffered by scheduled castes.<sup>34</sup> The country team pointed out that, according to the National

Crime Records Bureau, 47,064 cases of crimes against Dalits had been registered in 2014, up from 39,408 in 2013. Furthermore, according to the National Commission for Scheduled Castes, the highest number of registered cases of crimes against scheduled castes in the period 2013-2015 had been in the states of Uttar Pradesh, Rajasthan and Bihar. The Special Rapporteur on executions noted with concern that the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act of 1989 had not incorporated Dalit Muslims and Christians into the definition of scheduled castes and scheduled tribes, and recommended that the legislation be reviewed to extend the definition.

- 14. The Special Rapporteur on minority issues explained that manual scavenging constituted a caste-designated occupation that was mainly imposed upon Dalits, particularly Dalit women, who represented 95 per cent of manual scavengers. Despite the passing of the Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Act in 2013, the practice reportedly persisted, institutionalized through State practice, with local governments and municipalities employing manual scavengers.<sup>37</sup> The country team referred to reports that as few as 13 per cent of women had benefited under the manual scavengers rehabilitation scheme.<sup>38</sup>
- 15. In 2016, the Special Rapporteur on housing expressed concern at the legacy of India regarding discrimination against scheduled castes and tribes and so-called "backward" classes, and against women, particularly single and widowed women, and various religious minorities. She noted that the majority of homeless people or those residing in slums with the worst housing conditions were members of those and other vulnerable groups.<sup>39</sup> The country team reported that 54.71 per cent of scheduled caste households were landless in 2013. It referred to information from the post-Sachar Evaluation Committee on the poor living conditions of Muslims in urban areas and the lack of basic services in settlements with high Muslim populations in urban and rural areas.<sup>40</sup> The Special Rapporteur recommended that India enact legislation to

curb all forms of de facto housing discrimination against any individual or group, especially religious or ethnic minorities, women, scheduled castes or scheduled tribes, internal migrants or manual scavengers.<sup>41</sup>

- 16. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women noted that sex workers were exposed to a range of abuse. Many sex workers were forcibly detained and rehabilitated and faced a consistent lack of legal protection. Many faced challenges in gaining access to essential health services, including for treatment for HIV/AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases.<sup>42</sup> She recommended that India review the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act 1956, which criminalized sex work.<sup>43</sup>
- 17. The country team reported on a 2014 landmark judgment of the Supreme Court affirming the equal rights of transgender persons and that, in 2014, the same Court had overturned a 2009 judgment by the Delhi High Court that had decriminalized consensual same-sex relationships between adults.<sup>44</sup> Referring to a recommendation,<sup>45</sup> the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women urged India to make efforts towards eliminating the criminalization of same-sex relations.<sup>46</sup> The Special Rapporteur on violence against women recommended that India repeal section 377 of the Penal Code.<sup>47</sup>

# 2. Development, the environment, and business and human rights48

- 18. The country team welcomed the "whole-of-Government" approach to the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals.<sup>49</sup>
- 19. While commending the commitment of India to addressing climate change, the country team referred to concerns at the relaxation of norms for environmental impact assessments and application procedures under the Forest Conservation Act.<sup>50</sup>
- 20. Concerned about the forced displacement of a large number of children and their families and the loss of their ancestral lands owing to

71

manufacturing operations, the Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that India: establish and implement regulations to ensure that the business sector complied with international and national human rights, labour, environment and other standards; and require that companies undertake assessments of, consultations in relation to and full public disclosure of the environmental, health-related and human rights impacts of their business activities, and reveal their plans to address such impacts.<sup>51</sup>

# B. Civil and political rights

# 1. Right to life, liberty and security of person<sup>52</sup>

- 21. In 2014, two special procedures mandate holders welcomed a decision by the Supreme Court to commute to life imprisonment the death sentences of 15 individuals and to introduce guidelines safeguarding the rights of people on death row.<sup>53</sup> The Special Rapporteur on executions invited India to consider implementing as a priority the recommendation to review legislation to provide that the death penalty could only be imposed for the most serious crimes.<sup>54</sup>
- 22. The Special Rapporteur took note of reports regarding deaths resulting from the excessive use of force by security officers with little adherence to the principles of proportionality and necessity as defined under international human rights law standards.<sup>55</sup> He noted that section 46 of the Criminal Procedure Code authorized law enforcement officials to use "all means necessary" to perform an arrest that was forcibly resisted, and recommended that India review the Code and legislation in all states regarding use of force, including the exceptional use of lethal force, by all security officers to ensure compliance with international human rights law principles.<sup>56</sup> He regretted that section 46 had not been reviewed or amended.<sup>57</sup>

- 23. The Special Rapporteur also took note of reports of "fake encounters", whereby suspected criminals or persons alleged to be terrorists or insurgents had been fatally shot by security officers.<sup>58</sup> He indicated that justice for victims, accountability and punishment of the perpetrators was essential and that specific attention should be given to: challenging the general culture of impunity; eliminating the practice of "fake encounters"; and ensuring that swift, decisive action, with concrete outcomes, was taken in cases of large-scale killings.<sup>59</sup>
- 24. The Special Rapporteur took note of reports of cases of deaths while in custody and recommended that autopsies be carried out in conformity with international standards and that the families of victims be given full and easy access to autopsy reports, death certificates and other relevant documentation.<sup>60</sup> The Special Rapporteur on violence against women indicated that violence against women in custodial settings remained a concern.<sup>61</sup>
- 25. Deeply concerned about the reported high level of violence against women in conflict-affected regions, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women called upon India to: review promptly the continued application of the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act and related protocols; amend and/or repeal the Act and protocols in order for sexual violence against women perpetrated by members of the armed forces to be brought under the purview of ordinary criminal law; to enable prosecution in all pending cases; and enforce a code of conduct for members of the armed forces to effectively respect women's rights.<sup>62</sup>

# 2. Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law<sup>63</sup>

26. The Special Rapporteur on executions indicated that delays in judicial proceedings constituted one of the most serious challenges that India faced and had clear implications for accountability.<sup>64</sup> He recommended that India consider launching a process of reflection on

the need to reform its judiciary, with the aim of reducing the length of judicial proceedings and strengthening the independent functioning of the judiciary.<sup>65</sup>

- 27. The Special Rapporteur was concerned that section 197 of the Criminal Procedure Code required prior sanction from the government concerned before cognizance could be taken of any offence by a public servant for criminal prosecution, effectively rendering a public servant immune from criminal prosecution. <sup>66</sup> He recommended that such legal barriers for the prosecution of public servants be removed and that section 197 of the Criminal Procedure Code be reviewed. <sup>67</sup> He welcomed that an explanation had been added to the Code to clarify that no prior sanction was necessary for the prosecution of public servants accused of sexual offences, but indicated that for all other crimes the prior sanction provision continued to be a major hurdle for victims in securing remedies. <sup>68</sup>
- 28. The Special Rapporteur reported that the fight against impunity faced challenges at various stages of the accountability process. He noted numerous allegations that, when reporting a crime, including those related to killings or death threats, security forces often refused to register a first information report. Additionally, Dalits, the representatives of lower castes, tribes and poorer communities and women were particularly exposed to difficulties in registering such reports. Individuals who wished to report violations by security officers faced similar challenges.<sup>69</sup> He recommended that the authorities put in place an independent mechanism to monitor the registration of first information reports and that they punish those law enforcement officials who refused to register them.<sup>70</sup>
- 29. The country team indicated that the new Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection) Act 2015 allowed juveniles aged 16-18 years to be prosecuted as adults.<sup>71</sup>

# 3. Fundamental freedoms and the right to participate in public and political life<sup>72</sup>

- 30. The Special Rapporteur on executions noted that numerous reports concerning major incidents of communal violence had indicated an often wilful failure by State forces to protect citizens.<sup>73</sup> He also noted information that communal violence was often planned in order to target members of a particular group or acquire its property.<sup>74</sup>
- 31. The country team indicated that incidents of religious minorities being targeted during riots, such as in Muzzafarnagar, particularly prior to elections, needed to be addressed. It also noted that the Prime Minister had condemned incidents of violence stemming from allegations of cow slaughter as attempts to "poison social harmony".<sup>75</sup>
- 32. The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) reported that it had recorded 24 killings of journalists. It urged the Government to continue to investigate such cases and to report voluntarily to UNESCO on judicial follow-up measures.<sup>76</sup>
- 33. The country team reported that several incidents at universities in 2016 had triggered debate on the application of penal provisions relating to "hate speech", "sedition" and the use of section 144 of the Penal Code to prohibit the rights to assemble and to protest. The assassinations of well-known rationalists had added to the concerns about the reduced space for free speech and expression.<sup>77</sup>
- 34. UNESCO made recommendations, including that India decriminalize defamation and place it within a civil code that was in accordance with international standards, <sup>78</sup> and that it review section 22 (4) of the Right to Information Act 2005 in order to remove unnecessary restrictions for requests related to human rights violations. <sup>79</sup>

- 35. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women urged India to remove restrictions on the work of human rights defenders, not to place them under surveillance and to ensure that women in the north-eastern states participated in peace negotiations and in the prevention, management and resolution of conflicts. <sup>80</sup> The Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and association expressed concern at the restrictions imposed on human rights organizations and reminded India of its obligation to ensure that all members of civil society, including human rights defenders, were able to carry out their legitimate work in freedom and in a safe and enabling environment without fear of threats or acts of intimidation, harassment or assassination of any sort. <sup>81</sup>
- 36. In that regard, in 2016, the Special Rapporteur and several other special procedure mandate holders called upon India to repeal the Foreign Contribution Regulation Act, which had been increasingly used to obstruct civil society's access to foreign funding, and had failed to comply with international human rights norms and standards. The experts noted that many civil society organizations depended on being accredited under the Act in order to receive foreign funding. However, the broad and vague terms contained in the Act, such as "political nature", "economic interest of the State" or "public interest", did not conform to its prescribed aim, and were not proportionate responses to the purported goal of the restriction.<sup>82</sup>
- 37. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women reiterated the recommendation that India enact the Women's Reservations Bill to reserve at least 33 per cent of the seats in the state and central legislative bodies for women candidates.<sup>83</sup>

# 4. Prohibition of all forms of slavery<sup>84</sup>

38. While acknowledging the measures adopted, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women remained concerned at the alarming persistence of internal and cross-border trafficking, the lack of protection and services available to women and girls who were victims of trafficking and sexual exploitation and the lack of efforts to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, to address the root causes. So Concerning recommendations on trafficking, So Concerning recommendations on trafficking recommendations on traffickin

## C. Economic, social and cultural rights

## 1. Right to an adequate standard of living88

- 39. The Special Rapporteur on housing observed the stark contrast in India between extreme poverty and deprivation on the one hand and extreme wealth on the other hand, and that the gap between them was growing steadily and visibly.<sup>89</sup> The country team referred to the recommendation from the Task Force on Elimination of Poverty in India that a separate committee be constituted to identify those people living below the poverty line.<sup>90</sup>
- 40. The country team identified the urgent need to establish a social protection floor, and to recognize equal pay for work of equal value and women's unpaid care and domestic work.<sup>91</sup>
- 41. The country team reported on the National Food Security Act 2013, which provided for subsidized food grains and nutritional support to be given to pregnant and nursing women and children, including through the integrated child development services. It indicated that an efficient and functioning public distribution system was essential, and that the Government was focusing on reforms so that pilferage and inefficiency in the system could be removed. 92

- 42. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned by the low number of people with access to safe water, sanitation and hygiene and the widespread practice of open defecation and its negative impact on health, specifically child deaths from diarrhoea. The country team reported the government target to make India free from open defecation by 2019, despite the fact that it was still a reality for 564 million people. It indicated that reducing the high bacteriological contamination of water sources, especially in rural areas, was a critical challenge. 94
- 43. The Special Rapporteur on housing noted that India had the largest number of urban poor and landless people in the world. She praised the "Housing for All" scheme and stated that the important steps taken could result in the realization of the right to adequate housing for hundreds of millions of vulnerable people. She recommended that the central Government and state governments deal with homelessness as an urgent priority, with a view to eliminating it by 2030, in keeping with target 11.1 of the Sustainable Development Goals, and that the structural causes of homelessness in urban and rural India be identified, including in relation to access to land and housing, affordability and the lack of specific measures in favour of people without an income. 95

# 2. Right to health<sup>96</sup>

44. The country team welcomed the draft national health policy (2016) aimed at doubling government expenditure on health to 2.5 per cent of gross domestic product by 2020, and the new health insurance scheme for families living below the poverty line. However, it indicated that the public sector only provided about 30 per cent of all health services, and that vast inequalities persisted in gaining access to health services across different regions and social groups, while high out-of-pocket expenditure on health care had pushed about 63 million people into poverty.<sup>97</sup>

- 45. The country team took note of the "Delhi Declaration", signed by 20 countries in 2015, which called for accelerated progress towards ending preventable child and maternal deaths. 98 Treaty bodies commented on the high rates of neonatal mortality and maternal mortality. 99 The Committee on the Rights of the Child reported that the high levels of stunting, acute malnutrition and underweight children were closely linked to maternal undernutrition, anaemia and inadequate feeding practices. It recommended that India ensure the effective implementation of the National Food Security Act 2013 and promote breastfeeding and micronutrient interventions for mothers. 100
- 46. In 2015, several special procedure mandate holders reported on the practice of coerced, unsafe and unethical female sterilization in Government-sponsored sterilization camps. In November 2014, sterilizations performed in Chhattisgarh had resulted in the deaths of 13 women and critical injuries to many others. Similar incidents had occurred since then, notably in Uttar Pradesh, Jharkhand and Madhya Pradesh. The country team highlighted the fact that a judgment by the Supreme Court to put an end to sterilization camps was an opportunity to bring about far-reaching changes in the quality of contraceptive services. <sup>102</sup>
- 47. The country team referred to the 2014 launch of the National Adolescent Health Strategy and noted that its implementation needed to be strengthened. 103 The Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that sexual and reproductive health education be made part of the mandatory school curriculum and be aimed at adolescent girls and boys; and that measures be taken to raise awareness of and foster responsible parenthood and sexual behaviour, with particular focus on boys and men. 104

## 3. Right to education<sup>105</sup>

- 48. The country team indicated that, at 3.9 per cent of gross domestic product, the amount that India spent on education was the lowest among all the BRICS countries (Brazil, Russian Federation, India, China and South Africa), and that the quality of education in rural areas was an issue. <sup>106</sup> Estimates by the United Nations suggested that 17.8 million children including 34 per cent of children with disabilities did not attend school. Dalit, Adivasi and Muslim children and those from female-headed households were particularly vulnerable to educational exclusion. As at 2014, a total of 244,000 schools did not have toilet facilities. <sup>107</sup>
- 49. The country team referred to the *Beti Bachao Beti Padhao* ("Save the Girl, Educate the Girl") campaign to create a momentum towards ensuring the education and participation of the girl child, and the *Swacch Vidyalaya Abhiyan* ("Clean School Campaign") launched in 2014.<sup>108</sup> It indicated that more impetus was required to increase girls' secondary education. <sup>109</sup>
- 50. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women expressed its concern about the low retention and completion rates of girls at the secondary level due to early marriage, harmful practices and poverty, especially in rural areas. It reiterated its previous concluding observations and called upon India to: allocate increased resources; ensure that schools were girl-friendly, within a reasonable distance of communities and had supplies of potable water and separate hygienic toilets for girls; and address safety issues for girls in and out of school, including through the use of escorts to schools for girls in unsafe areas and the effective investigation and prosecution of acts of corporal punishment, harassment or gender-based violence against girls at school.<sup>110</sup>

51. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was seriously concerned about attacks on school facilities by non-State armed groups and the occupation of schools by security forces. It urged India to prohibit the occupation of schools by security forces and to rehabilitate and repair damaged schools.<sup>111</sup>

## D. Rights of specific persons or groups

## 1. Women<sup>112</sup>

- 52. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women expressed concern at the persistence of harmful traditional practices, such as the high number of dowry deaths, so-called "honour killings", sex-selective abortion, *sati*, *devadasi* and women accused of witchcraft. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women noted that widows were often denied and dispossessed of property, and that social exclusion had led some to engage in sex work and their children to perform hazardous labour or beg on the streets. 114
- 53. The Special Rapporteur noted that customary practices in the family and community pointed to a pattern whereby parents preferred to have sons over daughters. She indicated that research had revealed the declining ratio of girls to boys, and the continuing prevalence of sex-selection practices in some states, despite specific legislation to address the problem. The country team welcomed greater focus on improving gender outcomes. The flagship *Beti Bachao Beti Padhao* campaign had been launched in 2015 with the objective of preventing gender-biased sex selection and addressing the imbalance in the gender ratio. Cash incentive schemes to promote education and encourage people to delay marriage had shown varied results and needed to be complemented. 116
- 54. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women noted that early marriages continued to endanger girls' lives.<sup>117</sup> The Committee

on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women also expressed concern about the high prevalence of early and forced marriage. It reiterated its recommendations<sup>118</sup> that India withdraw its declarations regarding the Convention and that it review the application of the Special Marriage Act to remove procedural barriers regarding the application for permission to marry and the registration of marriages.<sup>119</sup>

- 55. The Special Rapporteur indicated that violence against women had become a priority political issue following the brutal gang rape and tragic death of a young student in New Delhi in 2012. As a consequence, the Verma Committee had been established by the Government to review existing normative gaps. <sup>120</sup> Regarding the partial implementation of a noted recommendation, <sup>121</sup> the Rapporteur reported on the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 2013, which: recognized acid attacks as a new criminal offence; provided for penalties for sexual harassment, assault against or use of criminal force on a woman with the intent to disrobe, voyeurism and stalking; introduced the crime of trafficking; and criminalized rape and gang rape. <sup>122</sup> UNHCR reported that, in accordance with the Act, the police would also be penalized for failing to register first information reports. <sup>123</sup>
- 56. The country team reported that marital rape continued to be outside the ambit of criminal law. It indicated that section 357-A of the Code of Criminal Procedure had introduced the concept of reparations in criminal cases, and that all states in India had established victim compensation schemes, although their scope and implementation varied. It noted that the Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act 2013 had been enacted. The country team reiterated the recommendations for the criminalization of marital rape and "honour crimes". 124
- 57. The Special Rapporteur on violence against women reported that the lack of implementation of the Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act was a concern. The attitudes and prejudices of many

village leaders in *Khap Panchayats* (local councils), who acted as informal judicial officers, often led to a pre-arranged settlement between families, thus failing to provide effective redress for victims.<sup>125</sup> The Rapporteur recommended that India implement in full and throughout the country the ban by the Supreme Court on *Khap Panchayats*.<sup>126</sup>

58. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women urged India to establish one-stop crisis centres to provide women and girls who were victims of violence and rape with free and immediate access to medical attention, psychological counselling, legal aid, shelter and other support services.<sup>127</sup>

## 2. Children<sup>128</sup>

- 59. The Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that India increase social budget allocations, establish a budgeting process with a child-rights perspective and take all measures necessary to prevent and combat corruption.<sup>129</sup>
- 60. The country team pointed to the fact that the Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act 2012, adopted since the previous review, had increased the age of consent to 18 years. <sup>130</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women urged India to: ensure that the Act was implemented without exception; void all child marriages automatically; and ensure that the Act applied also to child brides. <sup>131</sup>
- 61. The Committee on the Rights of the Child noted that one in three rape victims in India was a child. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was concerned about the retention in the Penal Code of an exemption from punishment when a rape was committed by the victim's husband if the wife was over 15 years of age. The Committee on the Rights of the Child urged India to ensure that all forms of sexual abuse of girls under 18 years of age, including marital rape, were fully criminalized.

- 62. Several treaty bodies encouraged India to raise awareness about the prohibition on child marriage and its spectrum of harms, including reproductive health issues, maternal and infant mortality and violence. The country team indicated that, in 2013, the Government had proposed a national strategy on the elimination of child marriage and an action plan to implement it. However, the measures were pending finalization. The country transfer is the second of the country transfer is the second of the country transfer is the country
- 63. The Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that India establish a national database of all cases of violence against children, and explicitly prohibit all forms of corporal punishment of children under 18 years of age in all settings.<sup>137</sup>
- 64. The country team referred to the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act 2016, which set at 14 years the general minimum age for employment and raised to 18 years the legal age at which people could engage in hazardous work. Areas of concern included the exception granted to family enterprises, which could increase impunity and child labour, and the substantial reduction in the list of professions considered to be hazardous.<sup>138</sup>
- 65. Additional issues raised by the Committee on the Rights of the Child included the sale of children through surrogacy and adoption and the recruitment or use of children by non-State armed groups.<sup>139</sup>

## 3. Persons with disabilities<sup>140</sup>

66. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women urged India to enact the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Bill, 2014 without delay and include in it a specific section to protect women and girls with intellectual disabilities from forced sterilization, and to repeal laws so as to prohibit disability-based detention of women, including involuntary hospitalization and forced institutionalization. <sup>141</sup> The country team noted that the Bill was pending with Parliament and supported

the undertaking of a comprehensive legislative gap analysis to enable the alignment of legislation with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. It stressed that efforts were required regarding the issuance of disability certificates in order to gain access to entitlements, as only 49.5 per cent of people with disabilities in 2015 had been issued with such a certificate.<sup>142</sup>

## 4. Minorities and indigenous peoples<sup>143</sup>

- 67. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women called upon India to adopt an integrated policy to enhance the living conditions of women and girls who had survived the Gujarat riots, and to intensify witness protection and security measures. 144
- 68. In 2012, the International Labour Organization (ILO) Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations reported that the national tribal policy was under consideration and requested information on the progress made for its development and adoption, including in collaboration and consultation with tribal groups and their representatives.<sup>145</sup>

# 5. Migrants, refugees and asylum seekers<sup>146</sup>

- 69. Although the recommendation made in the previous review cycle<sup>147</sup> to accede to the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness had not been supported, UNHCR hoped that India could reconsider its position on the matter.<sup>148</sup>
- 70. The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees recommended that refugees be issued with *Aadhaar* identification cards to enable them to have access to services on an equal footing to nationals.<sup>149</sup>

## 6. Stateless persons<sup>150</sup>

71. UNHCR reported, inter alia, that a group of Sri Lankan refugees, the Hill Tamils, were stateless or at risk of becoming stateless. <sup>151</sup>

## Notes:

- Tables on the scope of international obligations and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies for India will be available at www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/INSession27.aspx.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.1-138.30, 138.32, 138.36-138.38, 138.63-138.70, 138.95, 138.101, 138.112-138.113, 138.121 and 138.128.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.1 (Spain), 138.3 (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland), 138.4 (United States of America), 138.5 (Iraq), 138.6 (Republic of Korea), 138.7 (Italy), 138.8 (Maldives), 138.10 (Uruguay), 138.12 (Australia), 138.13 (Austria), 138.14 (Slovakia), 138.15 (Botswana), 138.16 (Brazil), 138.17 (Czech Republic), 138.18 (Portugal), 138.19 (Brazil), 138.21 (Czech Republic), 138.23 (Republic of Korea), 138.24 (France), 138.26 (Ghana), 138.28 (Sweden), 138.29 (Indonesia),138.30 (Slovakia), 138.32 (Switzerland), 138.36 (Timor-Leste), 138.37 (Timor-Leste), 138.38 (Costa Rica), 138.95 (France), 138.101 (Portugal), 138.112 (Ireland), 138.128 (Hungary); and A/HRC/8/26 and Add.1, paras. 86.1 (United Kingdom, France, Mexico, Nigeria, Italy, Switzerland and Sweden), 86.6 (Brazil), 86.7 (Brazil, Sweden), 86.9 (Netherlands) and 86.12 (Nigeria).
- 4 See country team submission for the universal periodic review of India, para. 5.
- 5 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras. 42 and 47, and CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 89.
- 6 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 98.
- 7 See A/HRC/34/51/Add.1, para. 85 (o).
- 8 See country team submission, para. 13.
- 9 See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID =20382&LangID=E.
- 10 OHCHR, "Donor profiles", in *OHCHR Report 2015*, p. 108.
- 11 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.3-138.4, 138.6, 138.12, 138.24, 138.32-138.36, 138.44-138.45, 138.54-138.60, 138.63-138.64, 138.71, 138.75 and 138.133.

- 12 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 21. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 15, and A/HRC/23/47/Add.7, para. 1.
- 13 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 21-22. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, paras. 15-16, and A/HRC/23/47/Add.7, para. 1.
- 14 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 16. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.7, para. 1.
- 15 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 18. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.7.
- 16 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 100.
- 17 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 19. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 101, and A/HRC/23/47/Add.7.
- 18 See country team submission, para. 42.
- 19 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 99.
- 20 See country team submission, para. 5.
- 21 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 88-89. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, paras. 56-58.
- 22 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 90. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 123, and A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 59.
- 23 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 120, and A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 57.
- 24 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 121, and A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 58.
- 25 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 123, and A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 59.
- 26 See country team submission, para. 11.
- 27 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 58. See also para. 78 (n).
- 28 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.43, 138.47, 138.53, 138.65, 138.68, 138.71-138.73, 138.75, 138.87, 138.89-138.90, 138.118, 138.131-138.132, 138.162-138.163 and 138.167. See also A/HRC/8/26, paras. 86.5 and 86.13.
- 29 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 34.
- 30 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 34.
- 31 UNHCR submission for the universal periodic review of Morocco, pp. 2 and 7.
- 32 See country team submission, para. 88.
- 33 See A/HRC/31/56, para. 33.
- 34 Ibid., paras. 22, 29-30, 50, 59, 62, 80, 82, 85 and 93. See also A/HRC/21/42, para. 22, and www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx? NewsID=19861&LangID=E.
- 35 See country team submission, para. 39.

- 36 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 80 and 104. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 48.
- 37 See A/HRC/31/56, para. 72.
- 38 See country team submission, para. 38.
- 39 See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID =19861&LangID=E. See also A/HRC/34/51/Add.1, paras. 62-73.
- 40 See country team submission, para. 84.
- 41 See A/HRC/34/51/Add.1, para. 85 (g).
- 42 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 20.
- 43 Ibid., para. 78 (e).
- 44 See country team submission paras. 26 and 28.
- 45 For the relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.89 (Argentina).
- 46 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 11 (i).
- 47 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 78 (d).
- 48 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.51 and 138.168.
- 49 See country team submission, para. 90. See also para. 87.
- 50 Ibid., para. 92.
- 51 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, paras. 29-30.
- 52 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.44, 138.79, 138.91-138.101 and 138.119-138.121.
- 53 See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID =14205&LangID=E.
- 54 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 25. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 106-107, and country team submission, para. 6.
- 55 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 8. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 10.
- 56 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 102. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 11.
- 57 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 11.
- 58 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 13. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 13.
- 59 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 94.
- 60 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, paras. 20 and 22. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 29-33 and 117.
- 61 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 24.
- 62 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 13 (a)-(b) and (d).

- 63 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.4, 138.62, 138.117-138.124 and 138.127.
- 64 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 67.
- 65 Ibid., para. 125. See also A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 44.
- 66 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 39. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 69.
- 67 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 103.
- 68 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.1, para. 39.
- 69 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 65.
- 70 Ibid., para. 110, and A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 14 and appendix. See also A/HRC/31/56, para. 62, A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, paras. 63-65, and CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras. 10-11.
- 71 See country team submission, para. 22.
- 72 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.37, 138.42-138.43, 138.48-138.50, 138.63, 138.67-138.68, 138.72, 138.79, 138.118, 138.121, 138.123-138.127, 138.131 and 138.169.
- 73 See A/HRC/29/37/Add.3, para. 28. See also A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, paras. 43-44.
- 74 See A/HRC/23/47/Add.1, para. 45.
- 75 See country team submission, para. 35.
- 76 See UNESCO submission for the universal periodic review of Morocco, paras. 100 and 106.
- 77 See country team submission, paras. 52-53.
- 78 See UNESCO submission, para. 105.
- 79 Ibid., para. 108.
- 80 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 13 (g) and (h).
- 81 See A/HRC/32/36/Add.3, paras. 297-300.
- 82 See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID =20112&LangID=E. For a detailed analysis of the Foreign Contribution Regulation Act, see www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/FAssociation/InfoNoteIndia.pdf, and
  - www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID= 20112&LangID=E#sthash.U8K3lbN3.dpuf.
- 83 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 25. See also country team submission, paras. 19-21 and annex.

- 84 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.5, 138.10, 138.26, 138.28, 138.40, 138.107-138.115 and 138.128.
- 85 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 22. See also country team submission, paras. 19-21 and annex.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.108 (Ukraine) and A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.109 (Belarus).
- 87 UNHCR submission, p. 5.
- 88 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.51, 138.74, 138.130, 138.134-138.145 and 138.148.
- 89 See A/HRC/34/51/Add.1, para. 5.
- 90 See country team submission, para. 86.
- 91 Ibid., para. 20.
- 92 Ibid., para. 81-82.
- 93 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 63 (g).
- 94 See country team submission, paras. 83 and 85.
- 95 See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID =19861&LangID=E and A/HRC/34/51/Add.1, paras. 7 and 85 (b) (i).
- 96 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.54, 138.130, 138.135, 138.146-138.159 and 138.168.
- 97 See country team submission, paras. 71-72 and 78.
- 98 Ibid., para. 76.
- 99 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 30, and CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 63.
- 100 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, paras. 63-64.
- 101 See A/HRC/30/27, case No. IND 3/2015, and A/HRC/31/79, case No. IND 14/2015.
- 102 See country team submission, para. 80.
- 103 Ibid., para. 75.
- 104 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 66.
- 105 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.52, 138.54-138.55, 138.104, 138.115, 138.157-138.158 and 138.160-138.166.
- See country team submission, paras. 69 and 70.
- 107 Ibid., paras. 66 and 68.
- 108 Ibid., paras. 64-70.

- 109 Ibid., paras. 19, 65 and 68.
- 110 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras. 26-27.
- 111 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, paras. 73-74.
- 112 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.2, 138.19, 138.21-138.23, 138.31, 138.37-138.38, 138.41-138.42, 138.54, 138.64, 138.68, 138.71-138.72, 138.74-138.77, 138.79-138.88, 138.102, 138.105-138.106, 138.109, 138.130, 138.144 and 138.150-138.155. See also A/HRC/8/26/Add.1, paras. 86.6, 86.11, 86.13 and 86.17.
- 113 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 20. See also A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 22.
- 114 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 21.
- 115 Ibid., para. 11.
- See country team submission, paras. 15-16 and 56.
- 117 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 13.
- 118 See also A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.2 (Sweden), 138.22 (Finland), 138.23 (Republic of Korea) and 138.31 (Slovenia) and A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.17.
- 119 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras. 38-41. See also A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 78 (b).
- 120 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 49.
- 121 For the relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.41 (Canada).
- See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 49. See also UNHCR submission, pp. 2-3.
- 123 UNHCR submission, pp. 2-3.
- 124 See country team submission, para. 17 and annex. See also CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 11 (c), CEDAW/C/IND/CO/3, para. 23, and A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, para. 78 (c).
- 125 See A/HRC/26/38/Add.1, paras. 59 and 63. See also para. 33.
- 126 Ibid., para. 79 (a) and (i).
- 127 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 11 (f).
- 128 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.10, 138.26, 138.28, 138.39-138.41, 138.46, 138.52, 138.61, 138.68, 138.75-138.76, 138.79, 138.85, 138.88, 138.102-138.106, 138.109, 138.112-138.116, 138.128, 138.130-138.133, 138.140, 138.144, 138.150-138.152, 138.160 and 138.162-138.166. See also A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.11.
- 129 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 18 (a), (b)-(d).
- 130 See country team submission, para. 22.

- 131 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 39 (b)-(c).
- 132 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 49 (b).
- 133 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 10 (b).
- 134 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, para. 50 (a).
- 135 Ibid., paras. 51-52, 63 and 65-66 and CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras. 10-11, 30 and 39.
- 136 See country team submission, para. 57.
- 137 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, paras. 48 (a) and 50 (c).
- 138 See country team submission, para. 23.
- 139 See CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, paras. 57-58, CRC/C/OPSC/IND/CO/1, paras. 23-24 and CRC/C/OPAC/IND/CO/1, paras. 40-41. See also A/70/836, paras. 184-186.
- 140 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.164 and 138.166-138.167.
- 141 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 37 (a).
- 142 See country team submission, paras. 30 and 33 and annex.
- 143 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.5, 138.26, 138.43, 138.47, 138.68, 138.71-138.73, 138.75, 138.87, 138.118, 138.125 and 138.131.
- 144 See CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, para. 13 (f).
- 145 See www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed\_norm/@relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms\_174843.pdf.
- 146 For the relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.25.
- 147 Ibid., para. 138.25 (Ghana).
- 148 UNHCR submission, pp. 3-4.
- 149 Ibid., p. 7.
- 150 For the relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.25.
- 151 UNHCR submission, p. 2.

# Summary of Stakeholder Submissions on India



# **General Assembly**

Distr.: General 27 February 2017

Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Twenty-seventh session 1–12 May 2017

Summary of Stakeholders' submissions on India\*

Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

# I. Background

1. The present report was prepared pursuant to Human Rights Council resolutions 5/1 and 16/21, taking into consideration the periodicity of the universal periodic review. It is a summary of 72 stakeholders' submissions¹ to the universal periodic review, presented in a summarized manner owing to word-limit constraints. A separate section is provided for the contribution by the national human rights institution that is accredited in full compliance with the Paris Principles.

GE.17-01938(E)







<sup>\*</sup> The present document was not edited before being sent to United Nations translation services.

# II. Information provided by the national human rights institution accredited in full compliance with the Paris Principles

- 2. NHRC-India reported on the implementation of all accepted recommendations.<sup>2</sup> Additionally, it recommended<sup>3</sup> ratification of ICPPED and submission of overdue treaty reports, including to the Human Rights Committee.<sup>4</sup>
- 3. The Bill introduced in Parliament in 2010 to enable ratification of the Convention against Torture<sup>5</sup> lapsed in May 2014, with the Government viewing existing provisions with slight amendments in the Penal Code as sufficient to address torture.<sup>6</sup>
- 4. Regarding same-sex relations,<sup>7</sup> although the Delhi court had decriminalized same-sex relations, it was overturned at the Apex court, which is again seized of the matter.
- 5. On older persons,<sup>9</sup> it was reported that the elderly faced problems of financial security/personal safety, abuse and even abandonment.<sup>10</sup>
- 6. Concerning freedom of religion11 and protecting religious minorities, 12 communal violence rose 17 percent in 2015, with 751 incidents recorded across the country as against 644 in 2014. *Prevention of Communal Violence (Access to Justice and Reparations) Bill 2013* is yet to become law. 13 There is a need for federal and state governments to be more vigilant. 14
- 7. Regarding the safety of journalists,15 incidents of violence against journalists have been reported.<sup>16</sup>
- 8. The legal system<sup>17</sup> continues to be dysfunctional with inordinate delays in both criminal and civil litigation. While the paucity of Judges/ Magistrates has often been cited as a prime reason for delays, there

appears to be no appetite for reforms in court processes and appointment procedures of Judges and the re-engineering of an archaic system created during colonial rule. Functioning of legal aid authorities at all levels needs to improve to reach the poor/marginalized who suffer long periods of incarceration as undertrials due to inadequate legal assistance in a ponderously slow legal system.<sup>18</sup>

- 9. Despite the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 2013 and its section 370 and 370A covering trafficking,<sup>19</sup> trafficking continues with less than effective Anti-trafficking units.<sup>20</sup> Rehabilitation, counselling and services like legal aid are inadequate. Government has been implementing *Ujwala* scheme for prevention, rescue and rehabilitation of trafficking victims with the help of NGOs.<sup>21</sup> Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act needs to be repealed.<sup>22</sup>
- 10. Regarding economic and social rights,<sup>23</sup> the agrarian crisis and inadequate Government safety net have driven poor farmers into debt traps resulting in large number of suicides.<sup>24</sup> Funding to a major rural poverty alleviation and employment (MGNREGS) programme has remained static compared to previous years.<sup>25</sup> MGNREGS has provided households with about 50 rather than 100 days employment and many studies pointed to weaknesses like wage payment delays and non-payment of unemployment allowance.<sup>26</sup> Despite measures taken to improve social security, 93 percent of the workforce is in the unorganized sector without social security or a safety net.<sup>27</sup> India enhanced maternity benefits for working women from 12 to 26 weeks.<sup>28</sup>
- 11. Regarding the right to food,<sup>29</sup> 34 states/union-territories have progressed towards implementation of the National Food Security Act, 2013. Efforts have been made towards strengthening of the public distribution system in accordance with the Act. Identification of beneficiaries is a problem as States use different methodologies leading to confusion and food insecurity.<sup>30</sup>

- 12. Concerning water and sanitation,31 despite a national cleanliness mission, open defecation is rampant and quality water is a problem.<sup>32</sup>
- 13. Regarding health,<sup>33</sup> the Government's share of healthcare expenditure is 1.4 percent of GDP. Health emergencies often push families into poverty.<sup>34</sup> Regarding integrating gender perspective into budgets,<sup>35</sup> there are potential repercussions on maternal and child health and nutrition services with higher budgetary responsibilities shifting from central government to the states.<sup>36</sup>
- 14. Concerning women and children's health,<sup>37</sup> despite nutrition and vitamin provision programmes for pregnant and nursing mothers, the maternal mortality rate remains high at 167 against a target of 109 by 2015.<sup>38</sup> Despite a recent emphasis on reproductive health under the rural health missions there are close to 46,500 maternal deaths each year and 8% of maternal deaths are attributed to unsafe abortions.<sup>39</sup> The infant mortality rate has fallen but remains high for such states as Madhya Pradesh, Assam, Odisha and Utter Pradesh.<sup>40</sup>
- 15. Regarding the skewed sex ratio and prohibition of sex selection,<sup>41</sup> the 2011 census indicates a ratio of 914 girls against the 927 recorded in 2001.<sup>42</sup> The Government initiated the *Beti Bachao Beti Padao* (Save the girl, Educate the girl) campaign to arrest this trend which appears to be yielding positive results.<sup>43</sup>
- 16. Regarding education,<sup>44</sup> the draft new education policy does not mention human rights education.<sup>45</sup> The 2009 Right to Education Act is being implemented in 25 out of 29 states.<sup>46</sup> Gaps persist in basic infrastructure in schools. Learning outcomes in both government and private schools indicate a dismal picture.<sup>47</sup> Affirmative action in education has resulted in delayed marriages.<sup>48</sup>
- 17. Concerning recommendations on free choice of marriage and measures to dissuade child marriage,<sup>49</sup> the "Prohibition of Interference

with the Freedom of Matrimonial Alliances Bill" to prevent honour killings was supported by several states. However, Government has not proceeded, even with this Bill, which steers clear of suggesting Penal Code amendments for defining honour killings and proposing appropriate punishment. The Bill does not propose amendment to the Special Marriage Act to remove the 30-day waiting period for registering a marriage. India does not have a law on compulsory registration of marriages. Hence, child marriage and forced marriage go on with impunity. Child marriage continues due to ineffective implementation of the law, traditional customs and practices and the absence of a survey to arrive at a baseline to make a meaningful impact in eliminating child marriage.

- 18. On violence against women and children,<sup>52</sup> the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 2013 redefined rape and incorporated additional provisions on violence against women along with stringent punishments yet violence against women continue. In 2014 there were 337,922 cases against women of which 36,735 were of rape. The Protection of Children from Sexual Offenses Act, 2012 (POCSO); and Sexual Harassment of Women at Work Act 2013 have been enacted. While the legal regime stands strengthened, allegations of sexual offences against minors have not shown signs of abatement.<sup>53</sup>
- 19. The amended Juvenile Justice Act 2015 allegedly allows children between 16-18 years to be tried as adults.<sup>54</sup>
- 20. Regarding recommendations on protection of children, including rehabilitation of child labourers,<sup>55</sup> the National Child Labour Project is continuing across 270 endemic districts in 20 states. However, rehabilitation of released children from labour is highly unsatisfactory with many children returning to work, as their household lacks alternative livelihoods.<sup>56</sup> Despite child protection services and schemes, a large number of children continue to lead lives on streets and without

families.<sup>57</sup> Persistent problems regarding children's homes, street children and out of school children require urgent attention.<sup>58</sup>

- 21. Concerning persons with disabilities,<sup>59</sup> legislation has not been effectively implemented and accessibility and equal opportunity for persons with disabilities is still far from happening. The share of children with disabilities outside of school is high as is illiteracy.<sup>60</sup>
- 22. Regarding scheduled castes and tribes (SC/ST) and minorities,<sup>61</sup> national data shows that in 2014 47,064 crimes were committed against Scheduled Castes and 11,451 against Scheduled Tribes. Insufficient efforts were made to review related legislation resulting in the non-fructification of the 2015 amendment to the Prevention of Atrocities Act 1989.<sup>62</sup>
- 23. Regarding new developments, sporadic instances of violence concerning the eating of beef have been reported in different parts of India. The fringe of the right-wing Hindutva Brigade is alleged to be behind such incidents.<sup>63</sup>
- 24. Reporting that the turmoil in Jammu and Kashmir is in the spotlight, NHRC-India stated that the use of pellets is controversial and has taken up a case on the matter.<sup>64</sup>

## III. Information provided by other stakeholders

- A. Scope of international obligations<sup>65</sup> and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies<sup>66</sup>
  - 25. JS27 noted that India had not implemented nearly 20 accepted first and second cycle recommendations<sup>67</sup> for the ratification of CAT and reiterated that recommendation.<sup>68</sup> 18 submissions reiterated about 20 noted recommendations<sup>69</sup> to ratify other treaties to which India is not yet a party.<sup>70</sup>

- 26. Regarding international cooperation recommendations,<sup>71</sup> JS14 indicated that India last submitted a report to the Human Rights Committee in 1995 and reiterated the requested visit<sup>72</sup> by the Special Rapporteur on Torture, pending since 1993.<sup>73</sup> PVCHR urged India to immediately implement the recommendations of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women following her 2013 mission.<sup>74</sup>
- 27. JS25 reported that an inclusive civil society consultation for the preparation of UPR remains an illusion.<sup>75</sup> According to JS11, the Government of India has a long record of persecution of human rights defenders. Mr. Khurram Parvez from Jammu and Kashmir was prevented by the Government from travelling to Geneva to attend the 33rd session of the Human Rights Council.<sup>76</sup>
- 28. KIIR recommended that the Government allow unhindered access to an OHCHR fact–finding mission to Jammu and Kashmir and unrestricted access to ICRC, MSF and UNMOGIP.<sup>77</sup>

# B. National human rights framework<sup>78</sup>

- 29. HRW recommended that India enact the pending Prevention of Torture Bill, after ensuring it conforms to the Convention against Torture and does not include any provisions that would grant officials effective immunity.<sup>79</sup>
- 30. KSAG and other submissions urged immediate revocation of impunity laws, such as the AFSPA.<sup>80</sup>
- 31. Regarding recommendations from the first and second cycle, <sup>81</sup> JS14 noted that India has nine national and over 180 state human rights institutions (N/SHRIs). These institutions face systematic impediments in matters related to patterns of appointments, composition, pluralism, transparency, mandate and powers which affect their effective functioning. <sup>82</sup> JS6 pointed out that India did not support the

recommendation to implement the 2011 international observations on ensuring high standards and independence of NHRC-India. JS6 commented in detail on those observations, including the non-publication of annual reports for the past four years; and non-use of Commission powers under Section 12 to review laws, particularly an analysis pertaining to the Foreign Contribution Regulation Act (FCRA); with FCRA registrations of around 30,000 organisations being reviewed for renewal this year.<sup>83</sup> JS6 and JS14 made recommendations.<sup>84</sup>

- 32. JS40 recommended ensuring the effective implementation of UPR recommendations through the establishment of a national mechanism for reporting and follow-up as a permanent governmental mechanism to liaise with relevant ministries and consult with civil society, NHRIs and all relevant stakeholders.<sup>85</sup> OHR recommended that India report on the SDGs when reporting for the UPR.<sup>86</sup>
- 33. Regarding recommendations on human rights education and training, <sup>87</sup> JS20 referred to government training programmes on women and child rights to law enforcement. <sup>88</sup> JS20 and GOOD Group recommended that India create a national action plan for human rights education that it be created in partnership with students, teachers, college and university faculty and administrators prior to the midterm review. <sup>89</sup>

# C. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

## 1. Cross cutting issues

# Equality and non-discrimination<sup>90</sup>

34. Regarding noted recommendations on birth registration,<sup>91</sup> JS17 reported that universal birth registration should have been achieved by 2010.<sup>92</sup>

- 35. JS22 reiterated recommendations<sup>93</sup> for an anti-discrimination law tackling all types of discrimination; and enforceable against private enterprises and transnational actors, especially in relation to education, housing and employment.<sup>94</sup>
- 36. Referring to the SDGs, aiming at leaving no one behind, JS43 pointed to the precarious situation of "invisible" children, especially from nomadic and denotified tribe communities. 95 JS33 highlighted that these communities were notified as criminal during colonial times and the recommendations of the 2008 National Commission for Nomadic and Denotified Communities were not implemented. 96 Linking stereotyping and violence, JS19 reported that after 6 decades of political independence in India, the Kuruvan community is subjected to torture by the Tamil Nadu police in the name of convicting "habitual offenders". 97 JS14 recommended repeal of the 1952 Habitual Offenders Act. 98
- 37. HRW reported on a new law to end the degrading and inhuman practice of "manual scavenging", 99 which, JS40 highlighted, particularly affects women from lower castes. 100 HRW pointed to the proposed amendments to the SC/ST Atrocities Act. 101 JS19 noted that, despite protections, atrocities against Dalit communities persist. In 2014, 2333 registered rapes of SC women –an average of 6 per day were reported. 102 AI recommended holding police officials accountable for failing to properly register and investigate complaints of caste-based discrimination and violence. 103
- 38. Noting the re-criminalization of homosexuality in 2013, JS21 highlighted abuses against LGBTI persons since India's second cycle review in 2012. <sup>104</sup> JS18 recommended that India repeal Section 377 of the Penal Code. <sup>105</sup>
- 39. HRW reported that the Supreme Court recently recognized transgender individuals as a third gender and ordered a review of its

earlier judgement that upheld a discriminatory colonial-era law criminalizing homosexuality. <sup>106</sup> Nevertheless, JS21 noted that there has been little effort to give effect to one of the decision's key holdings—that transgender persons must be given legal recognition for the self-identified gender. <sup>107</sup> ICJ recommended engaging in meaningful public consultation with members of the transgender community, with a view to substantially revising the Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Bill, 2016, to bring it in line with the Court's decision and international human rights law. <sup>108</sup>

## Development, environment and business and human rights<sup>109</sup>

- 40. JS37 referred to more than 20 progressive policy initiatives and measures to implement the 17 SDGs. <sup>110</sup> Concerned that vulnerable groups are unaware of such measures, JS40 recommended <sup>111</sup> designing and implementing programmes that monitor the progress of government initiatives. <sup>112</sup>
- 41. Reporting on its business and human rights research in Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand and Odisha, AI recommended requiring public and private mining companies to, inter alia, carry out human rights impact assessments as part of due diligence processes. <sup>113</sup> JS44 reported on the Odisha Industrial Security Force Act enacted in 2012 to provide an armed force for industrial undertakings. <sup>114</sup>
- 42. JS16 highlighted that India ratified the Paris Agreement on climate change in October 2016.115 Regarding the implementation of SDGs relating to the environment, JS37 recommended: introducing a complete point-to-point segregation of waste programme, while ensuring that rag-pickers are recognised as workers with rights and dignity; and banning all destructive mining, dumping of untreated wastes in rivers and oceans and deforestation.<sup>116</sup>

43. JS1 reported that the implementation of environmental laws is weak due to poor enforcement mechanisms and inadequate accountability and redress opportunities.<sup>117</sup>

## 2. Civil and Political Rights

## Right to life, liberty and security of the person<sup>118</sup>

- 44. HRW reported that India noted all recommendations<sup>119</sup> on abolishing the death penalty; and that Indian courts have recognized that the death penalty has been imposed disproportionately and in a discriminatory manner against disadvantaged groups.<sup>120</sup> See also comments by JS23.<sup>121</sup> AI recommended restricting the imposition of the death penalty to the "most serious crimes", as a first step towards full abolition.<sup>122</sup> LC specifically recommended repealing the 1985 Act that provides for death penalty for repeat drug offenders.<sup>123</sup>
- 45. JS14 noted that there were many grave complaints against security forces from conflict areas, particularly Jammu and Kashmir, the northeastern states and central Indian states, of rape and sexual assaults, enforced disappearances, extrajudicial killings, arbitrary arrests and detention and torture. Complaints of torture and extrajudicial killings have emerged from other regions. Prosecution of police officers and state agents is immensely difficult due to in-built protections in law. HRW stated that security and public officials continue to enjoy effective impunity for serious human rights abuses. JS14 reiterated the recommendations that India repeal AFSPA and other security laws. Pointing to gaps in the criminal code, JS22 indicated that there should be no prior sanction required to prosecute public servants of rape in Jammu and Kashmir. APDP reiterated the recommendation for ratifying ICPPED.
- 46. PVCHR, JS11 and JS1 reported on the alleged widespread use of torture. <sup>130</sup> AI reported that two-thirds of India's prison population are

pre-trial detainees, with Dalits, Adivasis and Muslims being disproportionately represented. <sup>131</sup> JS14 stated that police and prison systems continue to function under laws enacted in the 1800s. <sup>132</sup> HRW recommended that India implement police reform as recommended by the Supreme Court, including the establishment of a complaint mechanism to address police abuse, with JS27 recommending implementation of the Model Police Bill 2015. <sup>133</sup> JS14 recommended that Boards of Visitors are constituted in all jails across states in compliance with the 2011 MHA advisory and remove undue restrictions on access to prisons from the 2015 MHA advisory and ensure legal aid clinics in every prison. <sup>134</sup>

## Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law<sup>135</sup>

- 47. JS11 reported that India's judiciary suffers from a lack of resources. 10 or more years of delay in adjudication is hence the norm. JS11 alleged that, like the judiciary, prosecutors are deeply corrupt and demand bribes for opposing or not opposing bail applications, to undertake trials and to present evidence in court. There has not been a single study undertaken by the government to assess the efficiency of the prosecutorial office and its accountability. 136
- 48. Regarding a recommendation on access to justice, <sup>137</sup> AI reported that inadequate provisions of legal aid continue to contribute to excessive pre-trial detention. <sup>138</sup>
- 49. JS45 reported that, despite confirmation by the Jammu and Kashmir State Human Rights Commission (defunct since June 2014), and the offer of assistance by the European Parliament in 2008, India has refused to act regarding 7000 reported unmarked graves.<sup>139</sup>
- 50. SAHRDC recommended that a mandatory right to compensation must be established for the victims of State imposed abuse. 140

51. CRIN reported that the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act 2015 reintroduced life imprisonment as a possible sentence, for children who commit serious offences while they are aged 16 or older, across all states and union territories with the exception of Jammu and Kashmir.<sup>141</sup>

# Fundamental freedoms and the right to participate in public and political life<sup>142</sup>

- 52. About eight submissions, including CSW, JC, JS4, JS15, JS24, JS27 and JS28 reported a worsening situation of freedom of religion since the 2012 review. A Reference was made to the victims of communal violence in Odisha, particularly Christians still awaiting justice 144 and to the large-scale targeted violence against Muslims in Uttar Pradesh in 2013. I S14 reiterated the recommendation that India enact the Prevention of Communal and Targeted Violence (Access to Justice and Reparations) Bill, 2013. I S14
- 53. Several submissions, including JS32 noted the grave insecurities of religious minorities from anti-conversion laws, <sup>147</sup> "Ghar-wapsis" (where converts from Hinduism are forcibly converted back to Hinduism), <sup>148</sup> and the harsher beef ban law enacted after 2014.149 Several submissions reported on training by armed militias of rightwing organisations accentuating threats to religious minorities. <sup>150</sup>
- 54. Concerning the recommendation on safety of journalists,<sup>151</sup> JS31 reported that the period under review has seen a rise in attacks on dissent and press freedom with 21 cases of persecution of writers and journalists recorded in 2015 and 26 cases between January-June 2016; and that the growing prominence of nationalist rhetoric prompted a rise in attacks on dissent and press freedom by right-wing and vigilante groups.<sup>152</sup> ICJ reported that the State has used a variety of means, including bringing criminal charges of "sedition" and "defamation" against human rights defenders, NGOs, journalists and others.<sup>153</sup>

- 55. While reporting on the 2015 Supreme Court judgement in favour of upholding and advancing the free expression rights of Indian citizens online, Access-Now and JS3 highlighted the increased use of internet shutdowns since 2015.<sup>154</sup>
- 56. Regarding recommendations on protecting human rights defenders, <sup>155</sup> JS38 stated that the Government had not fully implemented any of them and no human rights defenders law was passed. JS38 referred to a disturbing new trend of targeting human rights defenders making use of the Right to Information Act. <sup>156</sup> AI referred to media reports in 2014 that a classified document prepared by India's Intelligence Bureau had described a number of foreign-funded NGOs as "negatively impacting economic development". <sup>157</sup> About fifteen submissions referred to restrictions affecting civil society, with ICJ reporting that the Government, using the FCRA cancelled the registration of about 4000 groups in 2012 and 10,000 groups in 2015. FCRA had been used to disproportionately target and harass NGOs and activists critical of governmental priorities and policies, including Greenpeace, Lawyers Collective, and Sabrang Trust. <sup>158</sup>

## Prohibition of all forms of slavery<sup>159</sup>

- 57. JS30 described the various forms of slavery, including the widespread abuse of women domestic workers, with JS34 highlighting the vicious cycle of inter-state trafficked migration of labour called "dadan". JS14 recommended that India ratify ILO Convention 189, and ensure minimum wages, fair work conditions, and protection from all forms of abuse for domestic workers.
- 58. JS30 highlighted the Government's introduced Central Sector Scheme for the rehabilitation of bonded labourers, which significantly increases the rehabilitation payment for released bonded labourers. However, released bonded labourers are only able to access the full amount upon a court conviction for bonded labour of the perpetrator,

which is problematic. <sup>163</sup> JS34 recommended delinking rehabilitation of freed bonded labourers with punishment of offenders, in consultation with NHRC-India and other stakeholders. <sup>164</sup>

- 59. JS8 reported that one out of every seven workers in India's unorganised sector is a tea plantation worker, with more than 50% of these workers being women. Ongoing labour rights violations in the Assam tea industry have perpetuated a cycle of generational servitude and slavery on the tea plantations. <sup>165</sup>
- 60. Regarding recommendations addressing trafficking, <sup>166</sup> JS17 stated that inclusion of Section 370 in the Indian Penal Code expanded the definition of human trafficking in keeping with the Palermo Protocol. <sup>167</sup> JS18, JS9 and CREA reported on violations and stigma faced by sex workers, with JS18 recommending decriminalization of adult consensual commercial sex work by repealing the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956. <sup>168</sup>

# Right to privacy

61. Regarding a new development, JS31 understands that a privacy bill is currently being drafted, though there is concern that law enforcement agencies are seeking exemptions placing its scope and effectiveness under question. <sup>169</sup> Internet-D-P recommended passing a law providing strong protections of the right to privacy. <sup>170</sup> JS35 recommended adopting and enforcing a comprehensive data protection legal framework that meets international standards. <sup>171</sup>

# 3. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

# Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work<sup>172</sup>

62. JS22 recommended that India ensure frontline workers for social justice programmes have secure employment and minimum wages with social security.<sup>173</sup>

# Right to an adequate standard of living 174

- 63. Concerning the implementation of India's commitment to address socio-economic inequities between the rich and poor, <sup>175</sup> JS33 reported that wealth is in the hands of a few, taxation is not in line with growth and social sector spending has seen a decline. <sup>176</sup>
- 64. Despite accepting two recommendations to promote food security and strengthen the Public Distribution System system, <sup>177</sup> JS14 noted that India tops the world hunger list. JS14 recommended that India ensure conformity of the National Food Security Act, (NFSA) 2013 with India's human rights obligations and expand NFSA's ambit. <sup>178</sup>
- 65. JS16 reported that rural landlessness, agrarian distress, forced migration, and farmer suicides as a result of increased indebtedness and impoverishment are on the rise. 179 Regarding housing recommendations, 180 JS16 reported that India records the world's largest number of homeless persons, urban and rural poor, and landless households. Despite commitments to provide "Housing for All" by 2022, India's paradigm of economic growth promotes homelessness, forced evictions, land grabbing/alienation and displacement. 181 Several submissions reported on violations of housing and land rights. 182 Concerning SDG11, 183 JS16 recommended that 'smart cities' do not promote evictions/segregation/forced relocation. 184 JS14 recommended that India promulgate a national right to housing law, which commits to ending homelessness, evictions, segregation and ghettoization; implement progressive laws and ensure policies/schemes adopt the human rights framework; and promulgate a national land reform act, ensuring land to the landless, especially SC/ST and women; and promulgate a right to homestead law. 185

# Right to health 186

66. JS14 recommended increasing the public health budget to 5% of GDP with substantial investment in primary healthcare; and institutionalize National Health Policy based on principles of Comprehensive Primary Health Care. LC reported on an urgent need for a rights-based approach to tackling Hepatitis C virus and tuberculosis. 188

67. JS10 reported on contradictions. Most women still do not know that abortion is legal, since the 1971 Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act. However, abortion arising from sex selection is illegal and the Penal Code still criminalizes abortion. Coercive measures such as the two-child norm (by which those with more than two children are excluded from elections, jobs and welfare benefits), continue to operate. Female sterilization accounts for 72% of contraceptive use in India. It is performed under extremely hazardous conditions and leads to human rights violations. <sup>189</sup> JS36 recommended implementation of the Supreme Court's orders, including discontinuing sterilization camps within three years. <sup>190</sup>

68. JS26 and CREA pointed to the importance of implementing health recommendations<sup>191</sup> or SDG3<sup>192</sup> for young people.<sup>193</sup> With over 250 million adolescents in India, JS26 called for: reproductive and sexual health education to be provided at all locations for adolescents and young people; strict enforcement of legislation to prevent early marriage; and accessibility of contraceptives to young couples to delay pregnancy.<sup>194</sup>

# Right to education 195

69. JS22 and JS39<sup>196</sup> analysed the implementation of recommendations on education<sup>197</sup> or SDG4. JS22 reported that resource allocation to education in the last four years has seen a consistent reduction to

0.48% of GDP in 2016. Key features of the Right to Education Act (RTE) have not been implemented, and are being withdrawn, without acknowledging or tackling causes of implementation failure from infrastructure gaps. Affirmative action to secure inclusion of children from marginalized groups into public or private educational institutions has remained unsatisfactory as the policy fails to overcome social and political barriers to inclusion. The resource gap in secondary education deprives adolescents from marginalized communities access and opportunities after primary education (6-14 years), on account of high costs of private education, pushing them into labour markets and unpaid household work. 198 JS17 noted that India has not yet endorsed the "Safe School Declaration" and JS2 called for the Declaration to be respected. 199 JS22 recommended aligning the Bill on national policy on education to the 1986 policy's principles with JS39 calling for the alignment of national plans with SDG4.200 CCL-NLSIU recommended that India extend the scope of RTE Act from pre-primary to 18 years.<sup>201</sup>

# 4. Rights of specific persons or groups

#### Women<sup>202</sup>

70. Regarding recommendations on skewed sex-ratio, <sup>203</sup> JS12 reported that India had failed to take effective measures to combat female foeticide since the last UPR. JS12 recommended the launching of pilot schemes on the implementation of the Preconception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act in targeted districts and called for a central nodal agency to combat female foeticide – leading to increased accountability, incentivised schemes for girl child and mandatory birth registration focusing on girl child. <sup>204</sup>

71. JS1 noted that poverty and food insecurity are intrinsically linked and women and girls tend to be more undernourished.<sup>205</sup> JS42 recommended ensuring women's access to nutritious food, particularly during adolescence, pregnancy and post-partum period.<sup>206</sup>

- 72. JS3 expressed concern that, increasingly, local governance bodies are barring women from using mobile phones and internet in rural areas.<sup>207</sup>
- 73. JS33 recommended reforming muslim personal law through abolition of "triple" divorce and polygamy.<sup>208</sup>
- 74. AI stated that over 327,000 crimes of violence against women, including over 34,000 cases of rape, were reported in 2015.<sup>209</sup> HRW reported that following outrage over a brutal gang rape and murder in Delhi, the Government amended its criminal laws with a view to strengthening the criminal justice response to sexual assault.<sup>210</sup> AI recommended that India introduce laws to specifically prevent and prosecute "honour" killings and prosecute unelected village councils that order or endorse violence against Dalit or Adivasi women.<sup>211</sup>

#### Children<sup>212</sup>

- 75. JS17 recommended the development of national standards consistent with the CRC on public budgeting for children's rights.<sup>213</sup>
- 76. Contradictions between related laws were highlighted with JS10 reporting that under the POCSO Act 2012, sexual relations with a girl under 18 is considered rape;<sup>214</sup> and AI reporting that an exception to Section 375 in the Penal Code does not find a man guilty to having sexual intercourse with his 15-year-old wife.<sup>215</sup> JS12 reported that 73.76% of the sanctioned funds for *Beti Bachao Beti Padao* remained unutilized by 11 states during 2014-2015.<sup>216</sup>
- 77. Regarding recommendations on child labour,<sup>217</sup> JS40 and JS17 noted the amended Child Labour Act in 2016 allows children under the age of 14 to work in "family or family enterprises". Since most family occupations are based on caste with poor families trapped in intergenerational debt bondage, this new law will have adverse effect

on the most marginalised and has the potential to increase drop-out rates of children living in rural areas, who are already more disadvantaged in enjoying right to education.<sup>218</sup>

78. JS40 recommended full implementation of the law against corporal punishment.<sup>219</sup>

#### Persons with disabilities<sup>220</sup>

79. HRW reported that the National Commission for Women took up its first-ever study of the situation of women with psychosocial and intellectual disabilities in government mental health institutions.<sup>221</sup> JS5 recommended that the pending bill on the rights of persons with disabilities be adopted with new sections including on prohibition of sterilization and ending forced institutionalization of women with disabilities.<sup>222</sup>

# Minorities and indigenous people<sup>223</sup>

80. JS29 referred to the important work of the Xaxa Committee on the status of Scheduled Tribes and its 2014 report's recommendations.<sup>224</sup> JS33 recommended that India enact the Scheduled/Caste and Scheduled/Tribe Sub-Plan Bill safeguarding budgets.<sup>225</sup> JS29 called for such plans and policies to be developed in line with India's SDG commitments.<sup>226</sup>

81. JS1 reported that indigenous peoples are increasingly being evicted from their traditional lands by national and multinational corporations with the support of police and state administrations.<sup>227</sup> Several submissions, including JS7, JS13, CS and ZIF reported on one or more issues of: Governors neglecting their constitutional duties<sup>228</sup> and the violation of Constitutional Schedules protecting tribal lands;<sup>229</sup> the violation of forest dwellers' rights through forest compensation actions and the commercial takeover of forests;<sup>230</sup> lack of consent requirements

for land acquisition for Coal India's mines under the Coal Bearing Areas (Acquisition and Development) Act;<sup>231</sup> and displacement from dam construction.<sup>232</sup> JS14 recommended ensuring effective implementation of protective legislation, the Panchayats (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act (PESA) and Forest Rights Act.<sup>233</sup> JS29 reiterated the recommendation for ratification of ILO Convention 169, and called for the adoption of a national tribal policy in line with it.<sup>234</sup>

82. On addressing impunity, JS27 reported that, in 2016, the Supreme Court investigated over 1,500 cases of killings by security forces in Manipur during 1978-2010 and ruled that "the use of excessive force or retaliatory force" was impermissible. JS27 alleged that the Government has yet to implement the Court's orders.<sup>235</sup> JS25 and JS2 called on the Government to seek a political solution to ongoing armed conflict particularly in Manipur.<sup>236</sup>

# Migrants, refugees, asylum seekers and internally displaced persons<sup>237</sup>

- 83. JS41recommended the closure of special camps in Tamil Nadu for Sri Lankan Tamil refugees.<sup>238</sup>
- 84. JS14 indicated that people living close to international borders, such as the Indo-Bangladeshi border, are subjected to human rights violations by Border Security Forces and face conflict-related displacement.<sup>239</sup> PACTI reported that Parliament in May 2015 adopted the 119th constitutional amendment paving the way for citizenry rights of the "enclave" dwellers at the Indo-Bangladeshi border.<sup>240</sup>

# 5. Specific regions or territories

85. Several submissions reported on the situation in Jammu and Kashmir,<sup>241</sup> especially the sharp increase in violence in 2016 after Indian security forces killed a suspected militant leader. The state responded

to these protests using lethal, excessive and unnecessary force and restricting the freedom of movement, association, and assembly. Over 80 civilians had been killed; and disability caused by the use of pellet guns is widely reported. Reports indicated that security forces attacked ambulances and hospitals.<sup>242</sup> PHR recommended that India immediately halt the use of "pellet guns" for crowd control; properly equip law enforcement with protective gear and training on the use of force and firearms; and ensure access to urgent medical care, protection of medical workers, and non-interference with delivery of medical care.<sup>243</sup>

#### Notes

The stakeholders listed below have contributed information for this summary; the full texts of all original submissions are available at: www.ohchr.org.

#### Civil society

#### Individual submissions:

Access Now Access Now, New York, United States of America;

ADFInternational ADF International, Geneva, Switzerland:

AI Amnesty International, London, United Kingdom of Great

Britain and Northern Ireland;

APDP Association of Parents of Disappeared Persons, Srinagar,

Jammu and Kashmir, India;

CCL-NLSIU Centre for Child and the Law, National Law School of India

University, New Delhi, India;

CREA Creating Resources for Empowerment in Action (CREA),

New Delhi, India;

CRIN The Child Rights International Network, London, UK;

CS Cultural Survival, Cambridge, MA., USA;

CSW Christian Solidarity Worldwide, New Malden, UK;

EAJCW European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses,

Kraainem, Belgium;

FFF Four Freedoms Forum, Kaneohe, USA; GOOD Group The Good Group, Honolulu, USA;

HRW Human Rights Watch, Geneva, Switzerland;

ICJ International Commission of Jurists, Geneva, Switzerland;

INDIGENOUS 1893 International Network for Diplomacy Indigenous Governance

Engaging in Nonviolence Organizing for Understanding &

Self-Determination (INDIGENOUS) Kaneohe, USA;

Internet-D-P Internet Democracy Project, New Delhi, India;

JUBILEECAMPAIGN Jubilee Campaign, FAIRFAX, VA, USA;

KIIR Kashmir Institute of International Relations, Islamabad,

Pakistan;

KSAG Kashmir Scholars Action Group, Cleveland Heights OH,

USA;

LC Lawyers Collective, New Delhi, India;
OHR Oceania Human Rights Hawaii, Kailua, USA;

PACTI Programme Against Custodial Torture & Impunity, Kolkata,

India;

PHR Physicians for Human Rights, New York, USA;

PVCHR Peoples' Vigilance Committee on Human Rights, Varanasi,

India;

SAHRDC South Asian Human Rights Documentation Centre, New

Delhi, India;

ZIF Zo Indigenous Forum, Mizoram, India.

Joint submissions:

JS1 Joint submission 1 submitted by: Eastern Indian Coalition on

Human Rights (EICHR), Kolkata, India, on behalf of Banglar Manabadhikar Suraksa Mancha (MASUM), Human Rights Alert, Dalit Foundation, Sramajibi Swasthya Prakalpa Samity, Anti Ethical Forum, Jana Swasthya Samaj, Right to Food Campaign (Bihar), TISS, PVCHR, World Women on Disability, Anti-Eviction Forum (Jharkhand), SPAN (West

Bengal), and DISHA;

JS2 Joint submission 2 submitted by: United NGOs Mission

Manipur, Manipur, India in cooperation with member Organisations, namely, Council for Anti Poverty Action and Rural Volunteer (CAPARV), Centre for Social Development (CSD), Village Development Organisation (VDO), Social Upliftment & Rural Education (SURE), Abundant Life Ministry(ALM), Rural Service Agency (RUSA), Development of Human Potential (DHP), Action for Welfare and Awakening I Rural Environment (AWARE), Rural Education and Action for Change Manipur(REACH-M), United Tribal Development Project (UTDP), Christian Social Development Organisation (CSDO), Chandel Khubol Social Welfare Arts and Culture Assn. (CKSWACA), Good

Samaritan Foundation (GSF), Evangelical Assembly Churches (EAC), Joint Action for Relief and Development Association (JARDA), Rural Aid Services (RAS), Integrated Rural Development Agency (IRDA), Socio Economic Development Organisation (SEDO), Centre for Community, Centre for Rural Development and Educational Organisation (CERDEO), Paomei Development Society Tungjoy (PDST), Zougam Institute for Community & Rural Development (ZICORD), Rural Development Association (RDA), Socio Economic & Environment Development Organisation(SEEDO), Integrated Rural Development Welfare Association (IRDWA) and Tangkhul Theological Association (TTA);

Joint submission 3, from the coalition on Internet Rights, submitted by: Digital Empowerment Foundation, Internet

JS3

JS4

Democracy Project, Point of View, Nazdeek and Association for Progressive Communications, New Delhi, India; Joint submission 4 submitted by: Civil Society Coalition For Freedom of Religion & Strengthening Pluralism in India on behalf of: 1) National Council of Churches in India; 2) Council of Baptist Churches in North East India; 3) Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church; 4) Chaldean Syrian Church of the East; 5) Gossner Evangelical Lutheran Church in Chotanagpur; 6) Mennonite Church in India; 7) Baptist Church of Mizoram; 8) Mennonite Brethren Church; 9) Catholic Bishops' Conference of India Office for Dalits and Backward Classes; 10) Lutheran World Service India Trust; 11) Indian Social Institute, New Delhi; 12) Center for Study of Society and Secularism; 13) Association for Protection of Civil Rights in India; 14) Council for Social Justice & Peace; 15) National Confederation of Human Rights Organization's, Goa; 16) Doon Bible College; 17) Odisha Forum for Social Action; 18) People's Alliance for Democracy and Secularism; 19) National Solidarity Forum; 20) United Religious Organization; 21) Tamil Nadu Christian Council; 22) National Dalit Christian Watch, New Delhi; 23) Student Christian Movement of India; 24) Karnataka Christian Council; 25) Center for Social Justice; 26) Justice and Equity Demand Samiti; 27) All India Secular Forum, Assam Chapter; 28) Char Chapori Sahitya Parishad; 29) Chhattisgarh Nagarik Samyukt Sangarsh Samiti; 30) Presbyterian Church of India; and 31) Union Biblical Seminary, India;

JS5	Joint submission 5 submitted by: Women Enabled International,
303	Washington, DC, and input from Women with Disabilities India
	Network, India;
JS6	Joint Submission 6 submitted by All India Network of NGOs
	and Individuals working with National and State Human Rights
	Institutions (AiNNI), Bangkok, Thailand;
JS7	Joint Submission 7 submitted by North East Indigenous
	Peoples Organisation (NEIPO), India; Zo Indigenous Forum
	(ZIF); Naga Peoples Movement for Human Rights
	(NPMHR); Karbi Human Rights Watch (KHRW);
	Meghalaya Peoples Human Rights Council (MPHRC);
	Indigenous Women's Forum of Northeast India (IWFNEI);
100	Zomi Human Rights Foundation (ZHRF);
JS8	Joint Submission 8 submitted by International Center for Advocates Against Discrimination (ICAAD) (New York,
	USA), Nazdeek and PAJHRA (Promotion and Advancement
	of Justice, Harmony and Rights of Adivasis), India;
JS9	Joint Submission 9 submitted by SANGRAM, National
***	Network of Sex Workers India endorsed by 80 organizations
	/individuals, including: 1.National Network of Sex Workers
	(NNSW), India; 2. Veshya Anyaya Mukti Parishad (VAMP),
	Sangli, Maharashtra; 3. Sangama, Bangalore, Karnataka; 4.
	Karnataka Sex Workers Union, (KSWU) Karnataka; 5.Uttara
	Karnataka Mahila Okkuta, (UKMO) Karnataka; 6. Me and
	My World, Andhra Pradesh; 7. Vadamalar Federation, Tamil
	Nadu; 8.Nirangal, Tamil Nadu; 9.Kranti Mahila Sangh,
	Solapur, Maharashtra; 10.Saheli Sangh, Pune; 11.Kerala
	Network of Sex Workers (KNSW), Kerala; 12.Muskan,
	Sangli, Maharashtra; 13.Sampada Grameen Mahila Sanstha
	(SANGRAM), Maharashtra; 14. Women's Initiatives (WINS),
	Tirupathi, Andhra Pradesh; 15.South India AIDS Action Project (SIAAP), Tamil Nadu; 16.Centre for Advocacy on
	Stigma and Marginalisation, Maharashtra;
JS10	Joint Submission 10 submitted on behalf of the Coalition of
0010	organizations on sexual and reproductive rights, India by
	National Alliance on Maternal Health and Human Rights
	(NAMHHR), Coalition for Maternal-Neonatal Health and
	Safe Abortion (CommonHealth), Jan Swasthya Abhiyan
	(People's Health Movement – India);
JS11	Joint Submission 11 submitted by Asian Legal Resource
	Centre (ALRC) Hong Kong, Special Administrative Region,

China and Nervazhi Human Rights Protection Council, Kerala, India: JS12 Joint Submission 12 submitted by Asian Centre for Human Rights, Plan International -India, Vimochona, Vanishing Girls, Vasavya Mahila Mandali, Breakthrough, Manab Adhikar Suraksha Manch, Gramin Evam Nagar Vikas Parishad, India Alliance for Child Rights, Shikshit Rozgar Kendra Prabandhak Samiti, South India Aids Action Programme, WeCan Women's Coalition Trust, Girls Count, Ma Bhagawati Vikas Sansthan, Control Arms Foundation of India, Aarti for Girls/ Vijay Foundation Trust and Global Village Foundation, New Delhi, India: JS13 Joint Submission 13 submitted by New Wind Association, Turku, Finland, Emmaus Aurinkotehdas ry, Finland and Global Human Rights Communications, India; JS14 Joint Submission 14 submitted by the Working Group on Human Rights in India and the UN (WGHR) - a national coalition of 12 human rights organizations and independent experts from India: Citizens for Justice and Peace, Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative, FIAN India, HAQ: Centre for Child Rights, Housing and land rights network, Human Rights Alert, India Alliance For Child Rights, Lawyers Collective, Multiple Action Research Group, National Campaign on Dalit Rights, Partners for Law in Development, Peoples' Watch, and the report was endorsed by 1000 plus organizations and individuals; **JS15** Joint Submission 15 submitted by Christian Collective (A National Solidarity of the Indian Christian Community for Peace and Harmony), supported by Franciscans International, VIVAT International, Congregations of St. Joseph, Pax Romana, Sisters of Charity Federation, Society of Catholic Medical Missionaries: JS16 Joint Submission 16 submitted by Housing and Land Rights Network India, New Delhi, India, on behalf of 81 supporting organizations: Adarsh Seva Sansthan, Aman Biradari, Amnesty International India, Apne Aap Women Worldwide, Association for Regional and Tribal Development, Banglar Manabadhikar Suraksha Mancha (MASUM), Banyan, Banyan Academy of Leadership in Mental Health, Beghar Adhikar Abhiyan (Homeless Rights Campaign), Beghar Mazdoor Sangharsh Samiti (Homeless Workers' Struggle

Committee), Borock People's Human Rights Organization, Business and Community Foundation, Campaign for Housing and Tenurial Rights, Centre for Holistic Development, Centre for Research and Advocacy, Centre for Social Equity and Inclusion, Centre for the Sustainable Use of Natural and Social Resources, Civil Society Forum on Human Rights, Committee for the Right to Housing, Deen Bandhu Samaj Sahyog, Delhi Housing Rights Task Force, Delhi Solidarity Group, Ekta – Women's Resource Centre, Ekta Mahila Manch - Ekta Parishad, Ekta Parishad, Environics Trust, Feminist Learning Partnerships, FIAN India, Ghar Bachao Ghar Banao Andolan, Grameena Mahila Okutta (Rural Women's Collective), Hamara Shahar Mumbai Abhiyan (Our City Mumbai Campaign), Haq: Centre for Child Rights, Human Development and Resource Centre, Human Rights Defenders Alert India, Human Rights Law Network, Human Welfare Voluntary Organisation, Humana People to People, India Alliance for Child Rights, Indian Social Institute Bangalore, Indo-Global Social Service Society, Information and Resource Centre for the Deprived Urban Communities, Initiative for Health and Equity in Society, Janpahal, Janvikas, Kannagi Nagar Pothu Nalla Sangam (Kannagi Nagar Residents Welfare Association), Shahri Adhikar Manch: Begharon Ke Saath (Urban Rights Forum: With the Homeless), Karavali Janaabahivriddhi Vedhike (Karavalli People's Development Forum), Karnataka Working Group for Habitat III, Koshish, Field Action Project on Homelessness and Destitution, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Maarga, Maharashtra Housing Forum, Mahilaye Pragati Ki Ore (Women for Progress), Mapithel Dam Affected Villages Organization, Montfort Social Institute, Nagara Vanchithara Vedike (Forum of Urban Deprived Communities), Nari Uthan Samiti (Women's Empowerment Committee), National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights, National Centre for Advocacy Studies, National Federation of Dalit Land Rights Movements, Navnirmaan Manch, Nazdeek, Nidan, Ondede, Partners for Law in Development, Pehchaan, People's Rights and Social Research Centre, People's Watch, POSCO Pratirodh Sangram Samiti (POSCO Protest Collective), Prakriti, Rural Education for Development Society, Samata Trust, Slum Jagatthu, Slum Janara Sanghatanegala Okkoota (Slum

JS17	Dwellers' Organizations Forum), Social Need Education and Human Awareness, Society for Promotion of Integrated Development, Tamil Nadu Dalit Women's Forum, Tamil Nadu Women's Forum, Vigyan Foundation, Vimochana Forum for Women's Rights, Women in Governance–Northeast India, Women's Coalition for Change; Joint Submission 17 submitted by HAQ: Centre for Child Rights, New Delhi, India; and Ankuram, Holistic approach for People's Empowerment (HOPE), Housing and Land Rights Network (HLRN), Jabala Action Research Group, Leher, Mahila Jan Adhikar Samiti (MJAS), Mines, Minerals & People (MM&P), Samata- Assertion for People, NineisMine Campaign, Pratyek, SAKTHI – VIDIYAL;
JS18	Joint Submission 18 submitted by Sexual Rights Initiative, Ottawa, Canada, and Creating Resources for Empowerment and Action (CREA), New Delhi, India;
JS19	Joint submission 19 submitted by the National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights (NCDHR), New Delhi India, with the support of All India Dalit Mahila Adhikar Manch; Dalit Ardhik Adhikar Andolan; National Dalit Movement for Justice; National Dalit Watch jointly with two coalitions (a) National Coalition for Strengthening PoAAct and (b) National Coalition on SCP/TsP legislation;
JS20	Joint Submission 20 submitted by Institute of Human Rights Education (IHRE), Madurai, India, with partner organizations Asian Development Research Institute (ADRI), Patna, Bihar; Holistic approach for People's Empowerment (HOPE), Puducherry; Institute of Human Rights Education & Protection, Agartala, Tripura; Institute of Human Rights Education, Bhubaneswar, Odisha; People's Action for Rural Awakening (PARA), Andhra Pradesh & Telangana; RIGHTS, Trivandrum, Kerala; SAMEEKSHA, Ajmer, Rajasthan; and South India Cell for Human Rights Education and Monitoring (SICHREM), Bangalore, Karnataka, India;
JS21	Joint Submission 21 submitted by Center for Health Law, Ethics and Technology, (CHLET) Haryana, India and India HIV/AIDS Alliance, New Delhi, India;
JS22	Joint Submission 22, submission on the Status of Women's Rights and Gender Equality: 2012-2016, submitted by Partners for Law in Development on behalf of 183 organizations and individuals, India;

JS23	National Law University, Delhi, India and World Coalition
JS24	Against the Death Penalty, Montreuil, France; Joint Submission 24 submitted by Indian American Muslim Council, Morton Grove, IL, USA, and Citizens for Justice
	and Peace (India);
JS25	Joint Submission 25 submitted by Civil Society Coalition for Human Rights in Manipur and the UN, Imphal, India, on behalf of Centre for Organisation Research & Education (CORE), Centre for Research and Advocacy Manipur (CRAM), Citizens Concern for Dams and Development (CCDD), Civil Liberties and Human Rights Organisation (CLAHRO), Civil Liberties Protection Forum (CLPF), Committee on Human Rights, Manipur (COHR), Extra-judicial Execution Victim Families' Association Manipur (EEVFAM), Families of the Involuntarily Disappeared's Association Manipur (FIDAM), Human Rights Alert (HRA), Human Rights Initiative (HRI), Human Rights Law Network Manipur (HRLN-M), Indigenous Perspective (IP), Just Peace Foundation (JPF), Movement for Peoples' Right to Information Manipur (M-PRIM), Threatened Indigenous Peoples Society (TIPS), and
1006	United Peoples Front (UPF);
JS26	Joint Submission 26, submission on Fulfilling Youth's Right to nutrition, health including reproductive and sexual health, and development in India, submitted by Centre for Health, Education, Training and Nutrition Awareness, (CHETNA) Gujarat, India and Family Planning Association of India (FPAIndia), Mumbai, India;
JS27	Joint Submission 27 submitted by Advocates for Human Rights, Minneapolis, USA, Indian American Muslim Council, DC. USA, Jamia Teachers Solidarity Association, New Delhi, India, Quill Foundation, New Delhi, India;
JS28	Joint Submission 28 submitted by Evangelical Fellowship of India (EFI), New Delhi, India, and endorsed by World Evangelical Alliance, Nagel Institute for the Study of World Christianity, Indian Social Institute - Bangalore, Biblica - The International Bible Society, India Missions Association, United Christian Forum, Oxford Center for Religion and Public Life - South Asia, Alliance Defending Freedom in India, Theological Research and Communications Institute, Indian American Muslim Council, Center for Policy Research;
JS29	Joint Submission 29 submitted by Asia Indigenous Peoples

Network (AWN) Jharkhand, India); Borok Peoples Human Rights Organization (BPHRO) Tripura, India; Centre for Research and Advocacy (CRA) Manipur, India; Chhattisgarh Tribal Peoples Forum (CTPF); Indigenous Peoples Forum, Odisha (IPFO); Jharkhand Indigenous and Tribal Peoples for Action (JITPA), Jharkhand, India); Karbi Human Rights Watch (KHRW); Meghalaya Peoples Human Rights Council (MPHRC), Meghalaya, India); Naga Peoples Movement For Human Rights (NPMHR), Nagaland, India; Zo Indigenous Forum (ZIF), Mizoram, India; Joint Submission 30 submitted by Anti-Slavery International, JS30 London, UK on behalf of Jan Jagriti Kendra (JJK), The National Domestic Workers' Movement (NDWM), Volunteers for Social Justice, India; JS31 Joint Submission 31 submitted by PEN International, London, UK, and PEN Canada, and the International Human Rights Program at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law (IHRP); JS32 Joint Submission 32 submitted by National Solidarity Forum, Bhubaneswar, Odisha, India, on behalf of 88 supporting organizations/individuals. Joint submission 33, submitted by Action Aid India, New Delhi, JS33 India on behalf of its NGO partners, State Offices, Knowledge Hubs and Policy Unit; **IS34** Joint submission 34 submitted by the National Coalition for the Abolition of Bonded Labour, (Bhubaneshwar, Odisha, India), NCABL (Odisha), PVCHR (Utter Pradesh), Global Human Rights Communications (Odisha), National integration Council Govt. Of India (Delhi), Odisha Rationalist Society (Odisha), NAVSARJAN (Gujarat), Campaign against Camp Coolie system (Tamilnadu), DASHRA (Bihar), NCDHR (Delhi), Khagapati Kumbhar, Jan Jagaran Dadan Sangh, Bolangir (Odisha), NASC (Tamilnadu), Gabesana Chakra (Odisha), NCAS, (Pune, Maharashtra), Goti Sharmika Surakshya Manch, (Odisha), Dadan Goti Shramik Surakshya Manch, (Odisha), Palli Alok Pathagara, (Odisha), PARDA, (Odisha), Debadutta Club, (Odisha), KARTABYA, (Odisha), Dadan Goti Shramik Surakshya Manch, (Odisha), Tribal

Pact, Chiang Mai, Thailand, on behalf of Adivasi Women's

124

Research and Training Centre, (Chaibasha, Jharkhand), Sangram Mallick, ALVM, (Odisha), CSFHR, (Odisha), India Media Centre, (Odisha), INSAf, (Odisha), HRD Alert,

	(Odisha), CSNR, (Odisha), ASHA, (Jharkhand), Agami Odisha, (Odisha), GCAP, (New Delhi), Odisha Peace Builders Forum, Odisha, India;
JS35 Joint	Submission 35, submitted by Privacy International, London, UK and the Centre for Internet and Society India, India;
JS36	Joint Submission 36 submitted by Center for Reproductive Rights, New York, USA, and Human Rights Law Network, India;
JS37	Joint Submission 37 submitted by Edmund Rice International and Franciscans International, Geneva, Switzerland;
JS38	Joint Submission 38 submitted by CIVICUS: World Alliance for Citizen Participation, Johannesburg, South Africa; and Human Rights Defenders Alert (HRDA) – India; and supported by Civil Society Forum on Human Rights, Police Reforms Watch, Jharkhand Women's Network, Socio Legal Information Centre, Human Rights Alert, All India Secular Forum, White Lotus Charitable Trust, Citizens for Justice and Peace, People's Action For Rural Awakening, Centre for Human Rights and Development, Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative, Towards Advocacy Network Developmental Action, National Alliance Group for Denotified and Nomadic Tribe, Helpage India – Delhi, National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights, People's Watch, South India Cell For Human Rights Education And Monitoring, Voice of Patient and Centre for Human Rights Studies, O.P.Jindal Global University;
JS39	Joint Submission 39 submitted by National Coalition for Education in India (NCE-India), World Vision, RTE Forum, PCCSS, AIPTF, NCE, All India Federation of Teachers Organizations (AIFTO), All India Secondary Teacher's Federation (AISTF);, Unorganised Labour Union, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh; Bal Kalyan avam Shodh Sangsthan, Allahabad, Uttar Pradesh;
JS40	Joint Submission 40 submitted by IIMA - Instituto Internazionale Maria Ausiliatrice and VIDES International - International Volunteerism Organization for Women, Education and Development, Veyrier, Switzerland;
JS41	Joint Submission 41 submitted by the Coalition of Tamil Nadu Civil Society Groups, Tirunelveli, India, based on contributions from over 50 civil society groups, community based organizations and grassroots movements from Tamil Nadu;
JS42	Joint Submission 42, submission on Every Woman's Right to

	Continuum of Quality and Respectful Maternal Care in India, submitted by SuMa Rajasthan White Ribbon Alliance for Safe Motherhood, Gujarat, India;
JS43	Joint Submission 43 submitted by India Alliance For Child
	Rights, New Delhi, India on behalf of the National NGO Child
	Rights Coalition (NNCRC);
JS44	Joint Submission submitted by Global Human Rights
	Communications, Bhubaneswar, Odisha, India with
	endorsement from Indian Community Activist Network
	(ICAN), Bangalore, Karnataka; Karbi Human Rights Watch,
	Assam; Naga Women Union; North East India Centre for
	Indigenous Culture and Development Studies (NEICICDS);
	Peace Core Team Manipur (PCTM); Prafulla Kumar Dhal,
	The Analytics, Bhubaneswar; Rajasthan Majdoor Kishan
	Union, Udaipur, Rajasthan; New Wind Association, Finland;
JS45	Joint Submission 45 submitted by Jammu and Kashmir
	Coalition of Civil Society (JKCSS) and Association of Parents
	of Disappeared Persons (APDP), Srinagar, India.

National human rights institution(s):

NHRC-India National Human Rights Commission India, New Delhi, India.

- 2 NHRC-India, main submission and Annex 1.
- 3 A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.70 (Lao People's Democratic Republic). See also, A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.12 (Nigeria).
- 4 NHRC-India, paras. 48-49.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.1, (Spain), 138.3 (United Kingdom), 138.4 (United States of America), 138.5 (Iraq), 138.6 (Republic of Korea), 138.7 (Italy), 138.8 (Maldives), 138.12 (Australia), 138.13 (Austria), 138.15 (Botswana), 138.16 (Brazil), 138.17 (Czech Republic), 138.18 (Portugal), 138.28 (Sweden), 138.29 (Indonesia), 138.32 (Switzerland) and 138. 36 (Timor-Leste). See also, A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.1 (United Kingdom, France, Mexico, Nigeria, Italy, Switzerland and Sweden).
- 6 NHRC-India, para. 4.
- For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.89 (Argentina).
- 8 NHRC-India, para. 53.
- 9 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.167 (Senegal).
- 10 NHRC-India, para. 46.
- 11 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.125 (Holy See).
- 12 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.79 (Islamic

- Republic of Iran).
- 13 NHRC-India, para. 21.
- 14 NHRC-India, para. 33.
- 15 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.127 (Austria).
- 16 NHRC-India, para. 51.
- 17 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.122 (Thailand).
- 18 NHRC-India, paras. 7-8.
- 19 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.107 (Islamic Republic of Iran), 138.108 (Ukraine) and 138.111 (Holy See).
- 20 NHRC-India, para. 29.
- 21 NHRC-India, para. 30.
- 22 NHRC-India, para. 31.
- 23 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.51 (Greece), 138.74 (Botswana), 138.78 (Holy See), 138.129 (Islamic Republic of Iran), 138.134 (Chad), 138.135 (Malaysia), 138.140 (South Africa), 138.141 (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela), 138.142 (Kuwait), 138.143 (Myanmar), 138.144 (Singapore) and 138.145 (Cuba).
- 24 NHRC-India, para. 36.
- 25 NHRC-India, para. 39, see also, para. 34.
- 26 NHRC-India, para. 42, see also, para. 34...
- 27 NHRC-India, para. 43.
- 28 NHRC-India, para. 23.
- 29 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.136 (Saudi Arabia) and 138.168 (Islamic Republic of Iran). See also, 139.148 (United Arab Emirates).
- 30 NHRC-India, para. 41.
- 31 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para.138.139 (Myanmar). See also, 138.148 (United Arab Emirates).
- 32 NHRC-India, para. 40.
- 33 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.130 (Viet Nam), 138.135 (Malaysia), 138.146 (Saudi Arabia), 138.148 (United Arab Emirates), 138.156 (Honduras), 138.157 (Cuba), 138.158 (Senegal) and 138.168 (Islamic Republic of Iran).
- 34 NHRC-India, para. 37.
- 35 For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.82 (Morocco). See also, paras. 138.64 (Norway), 138.76 (Nepal), 138.77 (Qatar), 138.80 (Kuwait), 138.81 (Bahrain), 138.83 (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela), 138.84 (Trinidad and Tobago) and 138.86 (Egypt).
- 36 NHRC-India, para. 16. See also, para. 15.

- 37 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.2 (Sweden), 138.148 (United Arab Emirates), 138.150 (Austria), 138.151 (Egypt), 138.152 (Norway), 138.153 (Finland) and 138.155 (Liechtenstein). See also, A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.11 (Mexico).
- 38 NHRC-India, para. 10.
- 39 NHRC-India, para. 9.
- 40 NHRC-India, para. 11.
- 41 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.152 (Norway) and 138.155 (Liechtenstein).
- 42 NHRC-India, para. 13.
- 43 NHRC-India, para. 14.
- 44 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.52 (Indonesia), 138.55 (Sri Lanka), 138.157 (Cuba), 138.158 (Senegal), 138.160 (Greece), 138.161 (Slovakia), 138.162 (Ecuador), 138.165 (Qatar), 138.166 (Australia) and 138.104 (Liechtenstein).
- 45 NHRC-India, para. 50.
- 46 NHRC-India, para. 18. See also, NHRC-India, para. 38.
- 47 NHRC-India, para. 28.
- 48 NHRC-India, para. 18.
- 49 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.87 (Holy See) and 138.102 (Switzerland).
- 50 NHRC-India, para. 12.
- 51 NHRC-India, para. 26.
- 52 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.39 (Algeria), 138.79 (Islamic Republic of Iran) and 138.106 (Mexico).
- 53 NHRC-India, para. 20.
- 54 NHRC-India, para. 20.
- 55 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.103 (Bahrain) and 138.114 (Angola).
- 56 NHRC-India, para. 24.
- 57 NHRC-India, para. 25.
- 58 NHRC-India, para. 35.
- 59 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.166 (Australia) and 138.167 (Senegal).
- 60 NHRC-India, para. 46. See also, para. 45.
- 61 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.75 (Ghana), 138.87 (Holy See) and 138.125 (Holy See).
- 62 NHRC-India, para. 17.
- 63 NHRC-India, para. 56.
- 64 NHRC-India, para. 55.
- 65 The following abbreviations are used in UPR documents:

ICERD International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

OP-ICESCR Optional Protocol to ICESCR

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICCPR-OP 1 Optional Protocol to ICCPR

ICCPR-OP 2 Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR, aiming at the abolition of the

death penalty

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination

against Women

OP-CEDAW Optional Protocol to CEDAW

CAT Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading

Treatment or Punishment

OP-CAT Optional Protocol to CAT

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

OP-CRC-AC Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed

conflict

OP-CRC-SC Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution

and child pornography

OP-CRC-IC Optional Protocol to CRC on a communications procedure

ICRMW International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All

Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families

CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

OP-CRPD Optional Protocol to CRPD

ICPPED International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from

Enforced Disappearance.

66 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.1-30, 138.32, 138.36-38, 138.63-70, 138.95, 138.101, 138.121, 138.128.

- 67 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.1 (Spain), 138.3 (United Kingdom), 138.4 (United States of America), 138.5 (Iraq), 138.6 (Republic of Korea), 138.7 (Italy), 136.8 (Maldives), 138.12 (Australia), 138.13 (Austria), 136.15 (Botswana), 138.16 (Brazil), 138.17 (Czech Republic), 138.18 (Portugal), 138.24 (France), 138.28 (Sweden), 138.29 (Indonesia), 138.32 (Switzerland) and 138.36 (Timor-Leste). See also, A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.1 (United Kingdom, France, Mexico, Nigeria, Italy Switzerland, Sweden),
- 68 JS27, para. 5 and recommendation, p.10.
- 69 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.1 (Spain), 138.5 (Iraq), 138.10 (Uruguay), 138.13 (Austria), 136.14 (Slovakia), 138.18 (Portugal), 138.19 (Brazil), 138.21 (Czech Republic), 138.23 (Republic of Korea), 138.24 (France), 138.25 (Ghana), 138.26 (Ghana), 138.28 (Sweden), 138.30 (Slovakia), 138.37 (Timor-Leste), 138.38 (Costa Rica), 138.95 (France), 138.101 (Portugal), 138.112 (Ireland), 138.113 (Norway) and 138.128 (Hungary). See also, A/HRC/

- 8/26, paras. 86.6 (Brazil), 86.7 (Brazil, Sweden) and 86.12 (Nigeria).
- JS45, recommendation 40; AI, recommendations, p.7; HRW, recommendations, p.2 and p.6; ICJ, recommendation, para. 34 (j); JS1, recommendations, paras. 2.3, 2.4, 5.1, 12.3, 28.2 and 31.1; JS14, recommendations pages 8, 10 12 and 15; JS8, recommendation, para. 74; JS2, recommendation, para.36.8; JS30, recommendations, pp.10-11; CCL-NLSIU, recommendation 48; Cultural Survival, recommendation 1; JS25, recommendation, Section G, para. (n), see also paras 24 and 43; JS29, recommendations, para. 6; PACTI, recommendation 6; KIIR, section IV; PHR, recommendations, p.5; FFF, recommendations p.3; ZIF, recommendations (iv) and (x) and JS41, pp. 5-6, section on refugees, recommendations.
- 71 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.66 (Belgium). See also, A/HRC/21/10, para. 69.
- 72 For relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.69 (Hungary).
- 73 JS14, paras. 91-94 and recommendations. See also, JS2, para. 36, recommendations 4, 5 and 8.
- 74 PVCHR, page 6.
- 75 JS25, para 60.
- 76 JS11, para. 1.2. See also, JS38, para. 3.8 and APDP, para. 21.
- 77 KIIR, VIII.2, See also, KSCCS, recommendation, para. 37.
- 78 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras.138.3, 138.6, 138.12, 138.24, 138.32-36, 138.44-45, 138.54-60, 138.63-64, 138.71, 138.75 and 138.133.
- 79 HRW, p.2, recommendations.
- 80 KSAG, recommendations, para. 11.3. See also, PACTI, recommendation 4; JS22, recommendation 6, section on conflict; JS29, para. 56, recommendations; PHR, recommendation, p.5/6.
- For relevant recommendation see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.56 (United Kingdom). See also, A/HRC/8/26, recommendation para. 86.3 (Ghana).
- 82 JS14, para. 88.
- 83 JS6, paras. 2.5.1.1 and 2.3.1.4 and annex.
- 84 JS6, recommendations, paras. 3.1.1-3.1.15, 3.2.1-3.2.10 and 3.3.1-3.3.2; and JS14, paras 88-90 and recommendations.
- 85 JS40, para. 8 a. See also, JS37, para. 105.
- 86 OceaniaHumanRights, p.3. See also, FFF, recommendations.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.55 (Sri Lanka), 138.59 (Malaysia) and 138.60 (Iraq).
- 88 JS20, paras. xxxiii and xxxiv.
- 89 JS20, para. xxiv and recommendation xxxviii; and GOODGroup, p. 2. See also, CCL-NCS, recommendation, para. 41.
- 90 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.43, 138.47, 138.53, 138.65, 138.68, 138.71-73, 138.75, 138.87, 138.89-90, 138.118, 138.131-132, 138.162-163 and 138.167. See also, A/HRC/8/26, paras. 86.5 and 86.13.

- 91 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.131 (Mexico) 138.132 (Holy See).
- 92 JS17, p.3.
- 93 For relevant recommendations see CEDAW/C/IND/CO/4-5, paras.8-9 and A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.53 (Ireland).
- 94 JS22, section on anti-discrimination, equal opportunity and empowerment, recommendation 1, p.2 and annex. See also, JS24, recommendation 3, p.10.
- 95 JS43, paras. 35-38 and recommendation 1.
- 96 JS33, section VII on Denotified communities.
- 97 JS19, p. 5 and annex.
- 98 JS14, paras. 76-77 and recommendations and JS44, p.4, section B and p.7, section I, recommendations.
- 99 HRW, p.1.
- 100 JS40, para. 28.
- 101 HRW, p.1.
- 102 JS19, section IV on women's rights, p.11 and annex.
- AI, recommendations, section on caste-based discrimination and violence, p.7.
- 104 JS21, paras. 3 and 17-38.
- 105 JS18, paras. 37 and 34.
- 106 HRW, p.1. See also, CREA, para. 7.1.
- 107 JS21, para. 13. See also, CREA, section 7 on lack of a comprehensive legal recognition and protection for transgender people, paras. 7.1-7.3 and recommendations.
- 108 ICJ, para. 34 b. See also, CREA, section 7 on lack of a comprehensive legal recognition and protection for transgender people, paras. 7.1-7.3 and recommendations.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, 138.51, 138.62, 138.77, 138.145 and 138.168.
- 110 JS37, paras. 15, 20, 25, 30, 35, 40, 45, 50, 55, 60 and 65.
- 111 For relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.75 (Ghana).
- 112 JS40, paras. 12 a, 26 c and 32 b.
- AI, p. 5 and recommendations, p.8.
- 114 JS44, part C on Odisha Industrial Security Force Act, pp. 4-5 and recommendations, p.7.
- 115 JS16, p.9, annex 1.
- 116 JS37, paras. 42-46 and 67-86.
- 117 JS1, para.20. See also, JS44, section A on National Green Tribunal Act, pp.2-3.
- 118 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.35, 138.44-45, 138.79, 138.91-138.101 and 138.119-121.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.91 (Ireland), 138.92 (Slovakia), 138.93 (Spain), 138.94 (Chile), 138.95 (France), 138.96 (Belgium), 138.97 (Italy), 138.98 (Switzerland), 138.99 (Argentina), 138.100 (Norway)

- and 138.101 (Portugal).
- 120 HRW, p.6.
- 121 JS23, pp.1-5.
- 122 AI, recommendations, p.7.
- LC, section on drug offences punishable by death, recommendation 1.
- 124 JS14, paras. 25-26 and 39.
- 125 HRW, p.1.
- 126 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.35 (Switzerland), 138.44 (Slovakia) and 138.45 (France).
- 127 JS14, paras. 24-35, recommendations. See also, JS29, paras. 53 and 56, recommendations.
- 128 JS22, section on violence against women/children, recommendations, p.6 and endnote 13, and annex.
- 129 APDP, recommendation A.
- 130 PVCHR, p.2, JS11, paras. 2.17 and 2.19 and JS1, paras. 4-5. See also, JS8, paras. 7 and 60-77.
- 131 AI, p.1.
- 132 JS14, para. 38. See also, JS11, paras. 2.20-2.21.
- HRW, p. 2 and JS27, recommendations, p.11.
- 134 JS14, paras. 36-41, recommendations.
- 135 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.4, 138.62, 138.117-138.124 and 138.127.
- 136 JS11, paras. 2.6, 2.10 and 2.12.
- 137 For relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.122 (Thailand).
- 138 AI, p.1.
- 139 JS45, paras. 8 and 12.
- 140 SAHRDC, paras. 14-15 and annex. See also, JS24, p.9, point 11 and JS14 para. 75 and recommendations.
- 141 CRIN, paras. 1.4 and 4, pp.2-3.
- 142 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.37, 138.42-43, 138.48-50, 138.63, 138.67-68, 138.72, 138.79, 138.118, 138.121, 138.123-127 and 138.169.
- JC, para. 4; CSW, para. 10; JS4, paras. 2.1-2.3; JS15, paras. 8-10; JS24, p.1; JS27, para.1; JS28, p.4, para. 1; and JS32, section 3. See also, HRW, p.4; EAJCW, paras. 8-22.
- 144 CSW, paras. 10-11; JS4, para. 3.2 and annex; JS15, paras. 26 and 32; JS27, para. 10; JS28, paras. 31-32 and annex; and JS32, para. 2.16.
- 145 CSW, paras. 10-11; JS4, para. 3.3 and annex; JS24 para 2; JS27, para. 11; JS28, pp.5-6, paras. 5-6; and JS32, para.3.1. See also, AI, p.4.
- 146 JS14, paras.73-75 and recommendations. See also, AI, p.4 and p.8.
- JS32, para. 2.12, p.10 and p.13. See also, ADFInternational, paras 21 and 23; CSW, para.22; JS4, paras. 7.1 and 8.1; JS15, paras. 29-32; JS24, p. 4 and p.9;

- JS27, para. 24; JS28, p.9; and JS14, paras. 73-75.
- JS32, pp.9-10 and endnote 23 and CSW, para. 18. See also, JS4 para. 5.3; JS15, paras. 33-37 and recommendations; JS24, pp.3-4; and JS14, paras. 73-75.
- JS32, p. 3, p.9 and p.12; JS24, pp.3-7; JS4, para. 5.3; JS15, paras. 23-25 and recommendations; JS27, para. 8 and recommendations, p.10; JS28, p 7 and p.17; and JS14, paras. 73-75.
- 150 JS32, p.11, para. 2.14; JS24 para. 5 p.8 and p.10; and JS14, para. 74.
- 151 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, para. 138.127 (Austria).
- 152 JS31, paras. 51 and 54.
- 153 ICJ para.28. See also, ICJ, para. 29.
- 154 Access-Now, paras. 2 and 8-11 and JS3, para. 49.
- 155 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.43 (Czech Republic), 138.67 (Spain), 138.68 (Norway) and 138.121 (Iraq).
- 156 JS38, paras. 3.1, 3.2, 3.7 and 7.1 and annex. See also JS33, section on human rights defenders.
- 157 AI, p.4. See also, CSW, para. 25; and JS25, paras. 13-14.
- 158 ICJ paras.28-29. See also, AI, pp.3-4, recommendation, p.7; CSW, paras. 28-30; HRW, p.3; ZIF, p.9; JS6, paras. 2.3.1.3, 2.3.1.4 and 3.2.7; JS13, para. 28; JS14, para. 79 and recommendations; JS25, paras. 11-14; JS27, paras. 25-26; JS28, para. 15; JS29, paras. 29 and 31; JS32, section 2, paras. 2.1, 2.7-2.9 and 2.15; JS38, paras. 2.3-2.7; JS44, p.5; and JS20, section 3.1.4, para. (xxiii).
- 159 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.5, 138.10, 138.26, 138.28, 138.40, 138.107-115, 138.128.
- 160 JS30 paras. 2-4 and 27-35. 5
- 161 JS34, paras. 5-6.
- JS14, paras 46-49 and recommendations.
- 163 JS30, para. 22.
- 164 JS34, recommendations, para. 33 (ii),
- 165 JS8, para. 26.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.40 (Canada), 138.107 (Islamic Republic of Iran), 138.108 (Ukraine) and 138.111 (Holy See).
- 167 JS17, section 5 on child trafficking, p.9. See also, JS30, para. 43 and section V, recommendations on the proposed trafficking law.
- JS18, paras. 1-33 and recommendations, paras. 34 and 37; JS9, paras. 1, 3, 8, 10-31 and recommendations paras 32-34; and CREA, paras. 6.1-6.2 and recommendations 1-3. See also, JS30, para. 43 and section V recommendations on the proposed trafficking law.
- 169 JS31, para 70.
- 170 Internet-D-P, p.7, recommendations in section B on Right to privacy, point 35.
- JS35, p. 14, para. 48, recommendations.
- 172 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.51

- (Greece), 138.78 (Holy See), 138.129 (Islamic Republic of Iran), 138.135 (Malaysia), 138.142 (Kuwait).
- 173 JS22, section 2 on gender architecture and budgeting, p.4, recommendation 3.
- 174 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.51, 138.74, 138.130, 138.134-138.145 and 138.148.
- 175 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.134 (Chad) and A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.10 (Algeria).
- 176 JS33, p.17, conclusion and JS14, paras. 3-6.
- 177 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.136 (Saudi Arabia) and 138.168 (Islamic Republic of Iran).
- 178 JS14, paras. 15-17 and recommendations. See also, JS42, p.7, recommendation 8; and CCL-NLSIU, recommendation para. 56.
- 179 JS16, annex, page 20.
- 180 A/HRC/23/10, para. 138.137 (Algeria) and A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.18 (Tunisia).
- 181 JS16, paras. 1, 3 and 5.
- JS16, para. 3; JS14, para. 12 and also paras. 7-1 and 13-14 and recommendations;
  JS9, paras. 20-21 and 29 and annex; JS8, paras. 41-59; JS18, para. 33; AI, p.5;
  HRW, p.3; ZIF, p.7; JS13, paras.8, 14-17; JS25, paras. 27, 51, 53, 55 and 60;
  JS29, paras. 24, 32, 38, 40, 44, 53-54; JS33, section I on housing, pp.3-4 and section VI on Indigenous Community People (Tribal), pp.10-11. See also, JS1, recommendation 18.3; JS7, section 4, pp.6-7; JS18, para. 33; JS19, p. 14 and p.17, recommendation 4; JS22, section 8 on labour and livelihoods, recommendation 4, p. 17; JS24, p.10, recommendation 3; JS28, para. 23; JS30, paras. 8 and 17; JS34, paras. 7, 10 and 14; JS38, paras. 5.3, 3.7 and 3.5.
- JS37, para.65 and JS16, para 77 recommendations.
- 184 JS16, para. 28, recommendations.
- 185 JS14, paras. 7-14 and recommendations and JS16, recommendations, para. 16.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.54, 138.130, 138.135, 138.146-159 and 138.168.
- JS14, section on right to health, recommendations.
- 188 LC, p.2, section on Urgent need for rights-based response to HCV and TB.
- 189 JS10, paras. 14, 16, 19, 21-22 and annexes.
- 190 JS36, para. 19 and recommendation 3.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 paras. 138.150 (Austria), 138.151 (Egypt), 138.152 (Norway) and 138.153 (Finland).
- 192 JS26, introduction. See also, JS42, introduction, p. 2 and JS37, paras 25 and 26, recommendations.
- 193 JS26, p.2 and CREA, paras. 5.1-5.3 and recommendations.
- 194 JS26, p.3 and p.7, recommendation 6. See also, CREA, paras. 5.1-5.3 and recommendations.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.52, 138.54-55, 138.104, 138.115, 138.135, 138.149, 138.157-158 and 138.160-166.

- 196 JS22, section on education, pp.13-15 and JS39, pp.2-15.
- For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10 and Add.1, paras. 138.52
   (Indonesia), 138.55 (Sri Lanka), 138.135 (Malaysia), 138.157 (Cuba), 138.158
   (Senegal), 138.160 (Greece), 138.161 (Slovakia), 138.162 (Ecuador), 138.165
   (Qatar) and 138.166 (Australia); and A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.115 (Ireland), 138.149 (Slovenia), 138.163 (Japan) and 138.164 (Mexico).
- 198 JS22, section 7 on education, pp.13-15. See also, JS39, recommendations 1-5.
- 199 JS17, section 7 on right to education, pp.13-15 and JS2, para. 36, recommendation 3.
- 200 JS22, section 7 on education, p.15, recommendation 2 and JS39, recommendation 1.
- 201 CCL-NLSIU, p.4, recommendation 43. See also, JS22, section on education, pp.13-15; JS17, section 7, pp.12-13; JS37, pp.4-5; and JS14, paras. 20-23 and recommendations.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.2, 138.19, 138.21-23, 138.31, 138.37-38, 138.41-42, 138.54, 138.64, 138.68, 138.71-72, 138.74-77, 138.79-88, 138.102, 138.105-106, 138.109 138.130, 138.144, 138.150-155. See also, A/HRC/8/26/Add.1, paras. 86.6, 86.11, 86.13 and 86.17.
- 203 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.152 (Norway) and A/HRC/21/10/Add.1, page 6 and A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.41 (Canada). See also A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.55 (Liechtenstein).
- 204 JS12, Executive Summary.
- 205 JS1, para. 17.
- 206 JS42, p.7, recommendation, 9. See also, JS42, p. 5 and p.7, recommendations, 2, 4, 8 and 11; and JS33, section II on health, recommendation 3.
- 207 JS3, paras. 12, 51-52 and 77. See also, Internet-D-P, paras. 39 and 42.
- 208 JS33, section IX on condition of minorities, recommendations.
- 209 AI, p.5 and p.1.
- 210 HRW, p.1 and pp.5-6.
- 211 AI, recommendations, p.8, section on violence against women. See also, HRW, pp.5-6.
- 212 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.10, 138.26, 138.28, 138.39-41, 138.46, 138.52, 138.61, 138.68, 138.75-76, 138.79, 138.85, 138.88, 138.102-106, 138.109, 138.112-116, 138.128, 138.130-133, 138.140, 138.144, 138.150-152, 138.160, 138.162-166. See also, A/HRC/8/26, para. 86.11.
- JS17, p. 18. See also, JS14, para. 57 and recommendations.
- 214 JS10, para. 25. See also JS17, p.9.
- 215 AI, p.5 and recommendation, p.8.
- 216 JS12, Executive Summary.
- 217 For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/21/10, and Add.1, para. 138.114 and A/HRC/21/10, 138.40 (Canada), 138.46 (Germany), 138.112 (Ireland), 138.113 (Norway), 138.115 (Ireland) and 138.128 (Hungary).

- JS40 para. 17, pp.4-5 and JS17, section on child labour, pp.3-5. See also JS17, section on children in mining areas, pp.15-16.
- 219 JS40, paras. 24-25 and recommendation, para. 26 part h.
- 220 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.164 and 138. 166-167.
- 221 HRW, p.1.
- JS5, para. 35, recommendations under general and violence against women sections, pp 10-11. See also CREA, section 4, paras. 4.1-4.6 and recommendations.
- 223 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/21/10, paras. 138.5, 138.26, 138.43, 138.47, 138.68, 138.71-73, 138.75, 138.87, 138.118, 138.125 and 138.131.
- 224 JS29, para. 8.
- JS33, pp.10-11, section VI on indigenous community people (tribals), recommendation 4.
- JS29, para. 14, recommendation. See also, JS29, para. 9.
- 227 JS1, para. 19.
- 228 JS14, para. 67.
- 229 JS29, paras. 8-16. See also, JS7, pp.6-7
- 230 JS13, paras. 39-41 and see also paras. 3, 6, 9, 14, 16, 21, 22, 24, 29, 32, 33, 35, 36 and 38; and JS29, paras. 34 and 36
- 231 CS, p.6, section C on Violations of Free, Prior and Informed Consent by Extractive Industries; and JS29, paras. 44-49.
- 232 JS14, paras. 66-69, JS29, paras. 39-43, ZIF, p. 7, JS7, section 4 on land alienation, JS2, para. 34.
- JS14, paras. 66-69 and recommendations. See also, JS29, paras. 12-13, 15-16 and 34; CS, p.5, Section C on Violations of Free, Prior and Informed Consent by Extractive Industries and p.8, recommendation 2; and JS1, paras. 19 and 21.1 and recommendations, paras. 14.2 and 14.5.
- JS29, para. 6. See also, INDIGENOUS1893, recommendation 1.
- 235 JS27, para. 30. See also, HRW, p. 1 and JS25, para. 40.
- 236 JS25, Section G, recommendation a) and JS2, para. 36, recommendations 7 and 6.
- For relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/21/10, para. 138.25.
- 238 JS41, pp.5-6, section on refugees, recommendations.
- JS14, para. 32. See also, PACTI, pp.1-8, including recommendations.
- 240 PACTI, executive summary, and pp.1-8.
- 241 KSAG, KIIR, PHR, APDP, JS45, ICJ, para. 27, AI, p.6 and HRW, p.3.
- 242 JS45, paras 5-12, APDP, pp. 5-8 PHR, pp.2-4 and ICJ, para 27.
- 243 PHR, pp. 5-6, section on recommendations.

# NHRC's Submission for UPR III

# NHRC, India Submission to the UN Human Rights Council for Third Universal Periodic Review of India

#### Introduction

An independent and active judiciary, a free media and a strong, watchful civil society are the sentinels guarding the human rights challenges in India which is a constitutional democracy. India is also a federal country with 29 States which have designated power under the Constitution. The way they perform either contributes or diminishes the protection of human rights.

2. For purposes of monitoring the implementation of UPR II recommendations, NHRC, India adopted a process, which is at **Annexure – I**.

# Status of Implementation of Recommendations in UPR II

3. Given below is the NHRC assessment on the progress made by the Government on the recommendations it accepted at the UPR II as per A/HRC/21/10/Add.1 dated 17.09.2012:

#### **CIVILAND POLITICAL RIGHTS**

#### **Recommendation: 21**

4. The Bill introduced in Parliament in 2010 to enable CAT ratification has lapsed with the dissolution of 15th Lok Sabha in May 2014. A mendacious view prevails in the Government that existing provisions with slight amendment in the IPC are sufficient to deal with torture. Delay in bringing out the changes in the law as a pre-requisite for ratification of CAT is disquieting as five years have passed without any significant change.

#### Recommendations: 39 & 40

- 5. "Human rights" is taught as part of the basic course for Constables, Sub-Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents of Police in 2 different States along with in-service training on "human rights" of 2-3 days duration. Sometimes, "gender" and "child rights" training is interspersed ranging from 2-5 days.
- 6. Training is uneven across States and needs assessment from the human rights perspective. The training modules need to include the new forms of human rights apart from civil and political rights. It remains low priority among Police Departments and other law enforcement officers.

# **Recommendation: 4**

- 7. The legal system continues to be dysfunctional with slow disposal of cases and inordinate delay in giving finality to both criminal and civil litigation. While paucity of Judges/Magistrates has often been put forth as a prime reason behind the slow moving system, the polity and judiciary also seem to have no appetite for reforms in court processes and appointment procedures of Judges and business process reengineering of an archaic system created during the colonial rule.
- 8. Functioning of legal aid authorities at all levels need to improve to reach the poor/marginalized who suffer long periods of incarceration as undertrials due to inadequate and free but less than quality legal assistance in a ponderously slow legal system.

#### ECONOMIC, SOCIALAND CULTURAL RIGHTS

# Women/Sexual and Reproductive Health & Rights

#### **Recommendations: 64 & 67**

9. Generally tardy in implementation otherwise, recently emphasis has increased on RCH programme under the NRHM. There are still close to 140

46,500 maternal deaths each year due to causes related to pregnancy, child birth and post-partum period. 8% of maternal deaths are attributed to unsafe abortions.

#### **Recommendations: 16 & 26**

- 10. Progress achieved in recent period is due to programmes like *JSY*, *JSSK*, *Dial 102 Emergency Ambulance Services*, nutrition coverage for pregnant and lactating mothers and reduction in anemia through iron and folic acid and vitamin tablets though the pace of decline is not uniform across States. The MMR remains high at 167 for the country as a whole during 2011-2013 as against MDG target of 109 by 2015.
- 11. IMR has come down to 39 per 1,000 live births in 2014 as against 50 in 2009 but it remains high for States like MP, Assam, Odisha and UP. In 2014, U5MR for the country was 45 against 49 in 2013. This may be viewed against the MDG-4 target of 42 deaths by 2015.

# **Recommendation: 60**

12. "Prohibition of Interference with the Freedom of Matrimonial Alliances Bill" to prevent honour killings was supported by several States. However, Government has not proceeded further, even with this anodyne Bill which steers clear of suggesting amendments to IPC for defining honour killings and proposing appropriate punishment. The Bill also does not propose amendment to the Special Marriage Act to remove the 30-day waiting period for registering a marriage. India does not have a law on compulsory registration of marriages. Hence, child marriage and forced marriage goes on with impunity.

# Recommendations: 63 & 65

13. 2011 Census indicates CSR at 914 girls against 927 recorded in 2001 Census. The overall rural CSR has also fallen steeply from 934 in 2001 to

#### **NHRC**

919 in 2011, whereas urban CSR has decreased from 906 in 2001 to 902 in 2011 Census indicating girl child being more at risk than ever before.

14. PCPNDT Act, 1994 is in operation to pre-empt sex selective abortions but it suffers from extremely poor implementation with only a few convictions in court of law. Government has initiated the *Beti Bachao Beti Padao* campaign to arrest this trend which appears to be yielding positive dividends.

# Women/Other Issues

# Recommendations: 11, 51 & 46

- 15. Government has initiated several steps to integrate gender perspective in various policies/programmes being implemented by its agencies. The approval procedure of Government schemes requires mandatory information pertaining to mainstreaming of gender perspective. Gender budgeting is an important component in this direction. Much more is required in terms of definite targeting across different sectors and geographies which stubbornly buck the trend of improvement.
- 16. Budgetary allocation from Central Government to schemes like ICDS has recently been reformatted with higher responsibility on the State Governments. This may have repercussions on MCH and nutrition services with the States showing reluctance to provide for their part.
- 17. While amendment to the SC & ST (PoA) Act, 1989 was made in 2015, insufficient efforts were made to review the legislations ITPA, 1956; DPA, 1961; ERA, 1976; and PWDV, 2005, resulting in nonfructification of amendment process. NCRB data shows that despite a strong law in place, 47,064 crimes against SCs and 11,451 crimes against STs were committed in 2014.

# **Recommendation: 52**

18. RTE, 2009 is being implemented in 25 out of 29 States guaranteeing education of children between 6-14 years till Class 8. Affirmative action in education has resulted in delayed marriages with accompanying dividends. However, women labour participation rates do not seem to show strong reversal.

19. The Reservation Bill for Women in Parliament continues to linger though several States have brought in reservation for women in Panchayats and State Legislative Assemblies.

# **Recommendations: 35, 49, 58 & 66**

- 20. The Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013 was enacted redefining rape and incorporating additional provisions on violence against women along with stringent punishments. Yet, VAW has not shown strong trends of abatement as NCRB statistics shows 3,37,922 crimes against women including 36,735 cases of rape in 2014. The POCSO, 2012; and SHWW, 2013 have been enacted. While legal regime stands strengthened, allegations of sexual offences against minors have not shown signs of abatement. The JJA, 2015 has also been amended. However, an allegedly retrograde provision has been added which enables adjudication of cases related to children between 16-18 years to courts.
- 21. Communal violence witnessed a 17% rise in 2015, with 751 incidents recorded across the country as against 644 in 2014. 'Prevention of Communal Violence (Access to Justice and Reparations) Bill, 2013' is yet to become a law.

#### **Recommendation: 29**

22. Appropriate mechanisms in terms of policies, acts and programmes for different categories of vulnerable groups are in place and monitoring responsibility is carried out by the Ministries. Ombudsman function is

#### **NHRC**

discharged by respective Commissions meant for Women, Minorities, Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Children both at the national and state level.

#### **Recommendations: 5, 17, 28 & 42**

23. Government's initiatives towards promoting gender equality include, enhanced maternity leave benefits for working women from 12 weeks to 26 weeks through amendment of the MBA, 1961 and allowing enhanced entry of women in Armed Forces. Gender sensitization programmes among Police and law enforcement agencies is being emphasized.

# **Child Labour**

#### **Recommendation: 13**

24. While NCLP project is continuing across 270 endemic districts in 20 States, rehabilitation of released children from labour is highly unsatisfactory. Many children after being released, return back to work for want of livelihood avenues to their households.

#### **Protection of Children**

# **Recommendation: 18**

25. While the NCPCR and respective State Commissions exist as also the ICPS including Childline services is being implemented, a large number of children continue to lead lives on streets and without families, devoid of dignity and adequate scope for development.

#### **Recommendation: 3 & 37**

26. Incidence of child marriage continues, inspite of the PCMA, 2006 being in place due to ineffective implementation and traditional customs and

practices. There is no survey to arrive at the base line to make a meaningful impact in eliminating child marriage.

27. Opportunities for consultations on child rights issues have increased due to initiatives taken by Government as well as concerned human rights institutions.

### **Children - Right to Education**

### Recommendations: 25, 31, 34, 44 & 57

28. RTE guarantees education to children in the age group of 6-14 years. Gaps persist in basic infrastructure in schools. Learning outcomes in both government and private schools also indicate a dismal picture as per the ASER conducted by an NGO.

### **Trafficking**

### Recommendations: 6,7 & 8

- 29. Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013 was brought into force wherein Section 370 and 370A IPC covers trafficking.
- 30. However, trafficking, both within the country and across the borders continues. ATUs established by States have been less than effective in preventing such activities. Rehabilitation activities as well as counseling and other services like legal aid are inadequate. GoI has been implementing *Ujwala* scheme for prevention, rescue and rehabilitation of trafficking victims with the help of NGOs.
- 31. ITPA too needs to be repealed by Government.

### **Vulnerable Groups**

### **Recommendation: 12**

32. Allocation of resources by Central Government for subjects touching economic/social rights assigned constitutionally for States has gone up by almost ten times during the period 1999-2000 to 2012-13 signifying serious efforts to accelerate social development. However, deprivation levels among vulnerable groups still remain high.

### Freedom of Religion

### **Recommendation: 32**

33. Freedom of religion to everyone is guaranteed by the Constitution of India. However, there is need for the federal and State Governments to be more vigilant in view of some of the recent happenings in a few States.

### **Social Welfare Programmes**

### Recommendations: 1, 10, 20, 22, 24, 41, 47 & 56

- 34. Efforts have been made towards poverty alleviation and incidence of poverty for the country has declined from 37.2% in 2004-05 to 21.9% in 2011-12. Though sharp decline in rural poverty has been witnessed, further work needs to be continued. Poverty alleviation programmes like MGNREGS, NSAP, NRLM, and NRuM require further improvement.
- 35. A comprehensive ICPS is being implemented across the country but problem areas persist among children homes, street children, out of school children, requiring urgent attention.
- 36. Agrarian crises in many parts of the country and inadequacy of Government safety net have driven poor farmers into debt traps resulting in large number of suicides.

### **Health, Education & Employment**

### Recommendations: 9, 23, 33, 45, 54 & 62

- 37. In India, total healthcare expenditure as a proportion of GDP is 4.7% as against 9.94% for the world. Out of this, Government share is 30% which converts to 1.4% of GDP. On an average, large percentage of family healthcare expenditure is met out-of-pocket as against global experience of pooling arrangement like insurance and State provided healthcare. Health emergencies often push families into poverty.
- 38. While RTE has come into vogue, with higher budgetary outlays, positive impacts are yet to be assessed.
- 39. Allocation to MGNREGS has been almost static compared to the previous couple of years. NRLM for reducing poverty by enabling poor households to access self-employment opportunities was allocated an amount of 4,000 crore rupees in 2014-2015 which was same in previous year.

### **Recommendation: 48**

40. SBA, a national cleanliness mission, is in place to address this area. Government has taken initiatives to accelerate sanitation coverage and access to safe and sustainable drinking water in rural areas. However, large number of habitations/households does not have access to safe quality drinking water sources and also suffer from problems of arsenic and fluoride contamination. Open defecation is still rampant especially in rural areas. Large projects in the pipeline, when implemented, will still leave huge areas with quality problems.

### **Food Security**

### Recommendations: 36 & 53

41. Significant progress has been achieved towards implementation of the NFSA, 2013 in the States. 34 States/UTs have implemented the Act in various measures. Efforts have also been made towards strengthening of the public distribution system in accordance with the provisions of the Act. However, identification of beneficiaries is a problem area as States use different methodologies leading to confusion. Net result is continued food insecurity in some tribal pockets.

### Right to Work & Labour

### **Recommendation: 30**

42. The entire country is covered except for municipal areas by MGNREGS, a wage employment programme. Richer States like TN and AP tend to have better absorptive capacity and these get more funds than poorer States like Bihar. The average number of days for which the households have been provided employment has been 50 days against maximum 100 days. Many studies also point to weaknesses like delays in wage payment and non-payment of unemployment allowance.

### **Recommendation: 38**

- 43. While Government has been taking initiatives to promote social security through schemes like PMSBY, PMJJBY, APY and RSBY, there is need to do much more as 93% of the workforce is in unorganized sector, without social security and safety net. The UWSSA, 2008, is in place, needs to be implemented more effectively by the States.
- 44. The implementation of the BLSA, 1976 is weak. More effective implementation is also needed for legislations like IMWA, 1979 and MWA, 1948.

### **Recommendation: 59**

45. Women, especially from vulnerable sections, continue to be discriminated both in terms of work and wages as are persons with disabilities despite legal and constitutional provisions.

### **Disabled and Elderly**

### **Recommendations: 55 & 15**

- 46. Implementation of the PWD Act, 1995 has not really been effective as substantial action needs to be taken by States. As a result, accessibility and equal opportunities for PWDs is still a far cry. Recently, GoI has launched a campaign for their accessibility. Nearly half of children with disabilities do not have access to specialized education. Illiteracy is particularly high for children with visual, multiple and mental disabilities. Share of children with disabilities in out of school children is high. Special schools are few and cater to limited number of children. Similarly, elderly face problems of financial security/personal safety, abuse and even abandonment.
- 47. Implementation of MWPSCA, 2007 falls far short of desired effect.

### **Cooperation with UN System/Special Procedures**

### **Recommendation: 43**

48. Government has taken positive steps. However, it needs to ratify the CED. It also should submit India country reports long due to UN Human Rights Committee and ESCR Committee.

### **Recommendation: 19**

49. The country had visits by UN Special Rapporteurs on Extra-judicial Killings, VAW and Right to Adequate Housing during recent years.

### **Miscellaneous**

### **Recommendation: 2**

50. Human rights issues are part of social-sciences syllabi of CBSE. Incorporation of HRE into education system in entirety, i.e., in the State Education Board's curricula requires systematic emphasis. Draft new Education Policy also does not mention about HRE.

### **Recommendation: 61**

51. Press Council of India under the PCA, 1978 is mandated to take immediate action on complaints of violence against journalists. However, incidents of violence against them have been reported.

### **Recommendation: 50**

52. Civil society in India, as on previous occasions, actively participated in present UPR process.

### **Recommendation: 14**

53. Section 377 IPC criminalizes same sex relations. Though the Delhi High Court had decriminalized these relations, it was overturned by the Apex Court. The Apex Court is seized of the matter again.

### **Recommendation: 27**

54. Several human rights institutions have been set-up at National and State level. There is need for better coordination among these institutions and Government on one hand and among human rights institutions on the other.

### Conclusion

- 55. The turmoil in Kashmir is on the spotlight now. It is augmented by trans-border terrorism and Jihadi funding from the neighbouring country. The use of plastic pellets by CAPFs is controversial. NHRC has taken up a case on the matter but withholds its comments now because human rights of both sides are involved, when young crowd pelt stones at the Police personnel.
- 56. The sporadic instances of violence concerning eating of beef have been reported in different parts of the country. The fringe of the right wing Hindutva Brigade is alleged to be behind these incidents which are few and far between. Though disquieting, it is too early to assess as to be a threat to secular and pluralistic structure of Indian society.

### Annexure - I

# Process Adopted by NHRC, India for Monitoring the Implementation of 67 Recommendations

First and foremost, NHRC, India developed a framework indicating action required on each of the 67 recommendations along with its monitorable outcomes as it felt this would not only provide information about the existing ground realities on a range of issues but also facilitate in providing a road map for improving the gaps therein. The 67 recommendations were grouped under 16 major heads<sup>1</sup>. This exercise was initiated in October 2012 and continued in 2012 and 2013 with significant stakeholders who included among others national human rights institutions and civil society organizations. Simultaneously, the NHRC wrote to the respective Ministers of all the relevant Ministries to inform the progress it had made towards implementation of UPR-1 and UPR-2 recommendations.

The framework was completed in February 2014 wherein it identified the specific Union Ministries<sup>2</sup>, 16 in all, on whose part action was required. The NHRC further ensured that the completed framework was forwarded to all these Ministries and other stakeholders besides posting it on its website (www.nhrc.nic.in) for wider dissemination. As reponse was received from only four Ministries (Minority Affairs, Food & Public Distribution, Justice and Rural Development), NHRC again addressed letters to the concerned

<sup>1</sup> Convention Against Torture, Police, Judiciary, Women/Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights, Women/Other Issues Concerning, Child Labour, Protection of Children, Children – Right to Education, Trafficking, Vulnerable Groups, Freedom of Religion, Social Welfare Programmes, Right to Work and Labour, Disabled and Elderly, Cooperation with UN System/ Special Rapporteurs, and Miscellaneous.

<sup>2</sup> Ministries of Home Affairs; Rural Development; Women and Child Development; Human Resource Development; Law & Justice; Health & Family Welfare; Minority Affairs; Labour & Employment; Social Justice and Empowerment; External Affairs; Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution; Drinking Water & Sanitation; Information & Broadcasting; Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation; Finance; and Tribal Affairs.

Secretary of each of the 16 Ministries including NITI Aayog calling for a meeting in the Commission. These meetings were convened by the Secretary General while some by the Joint Secretary (Training & Research) during the first half of 2015. In these meetings a brief orientation was given about the UPR along with the framework developed by NHRC. This was followed by a discussion on the action taken by their Ministry on the recommendation(s) pertaining to their work. Despite these efforts and reminders, exact information did not come forth from most of the Ministries, a handful of them failed to submit even this.

Thereafter, NHRC held five regional consultations and a national consultation with representatives of the government, human rights institutions including state human rights commissions (SHRCs), civil society, technical institutions, academics and experts from the viewpoint of perceiving actual ground realities across the country given the diversity of India. More than 500 people took part in these consultations and the information shared was valuable. In the first and fourth consultation held in Chandigarh and Mumbai, government participation was limited, whereas in the second and third held in Kolkata and Bengaluru, the participation of civil society was poor. The same was also true for SHRCs, substantiating the fact that nothing much had changed so far as they were concerned since 2012.

### Annexure-II

### **Abbreviations**

ASER : Annual Survey of Education Reports

AP : Andhra Pradesh

APY : Atal Pension Yojana

ATUs : Anti-trafficking Units

BLSA : Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act, 1976

CAPFs : Central Armed Police Forces

CAT : Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman

or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CBSE : Central Board of Secondary Education

CED : Convention on Enforced Disappearance

CSR : Child Sex Ratio

DPA : Dowry Prohibition Act, 1961

ERA : Equal Remuneration Act, 1976

ESCR Committee: Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Committee

GoI : Government of India

HRE : Human Rights Education

ICDS : Integrated Child Development Services Scheme

ICPS : Integrated Child Protection Scheme

IMR : Infant Mortality Rate

IMWA : Inter-State Migrant Workmen Act, 1979

IPC : Indian Penal Code

iTPA : Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956

JJA : Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act,

2015

JSY : Janani Suraksha Yojana

JSSK : Janani Shishu Suraksha Karyakram

MBA : Maternity Benefit Act, 1961

MCH : Maternal and Child Health

MDG : Millennium Development Goal

MGNREGS: Mahatma Gandhi Nation Rural Employment Guarantee

Scheme

MMR : Maternal Mortality Rate

MP : Madhya Pradesh

MWA : Minimum Wages Act, 1948

MWPSCA : Maintenance and Welfare of Parents and Senior

Citizens Act, 2007

NCLP : National Child Labour Project

NCPCR : National Commission for Protection of Child Rights

NCRB : National Crime Records Bureau

NFSA : National Food Security Act, 2013

NRHM : National Rural Health Mission (now known as National

Health Mission)

NRLM : National Rural Livelihoods Mission (Aajeevika)

NRuM : National Rurban Mission

NSAP : National Social Assistance Programme

PCA : Press Council Act, 1978

# Opening Statement of Attorney General for India at the Third Universal Periodic Review of India

Opening Statement by Attorney General for India at the Third Universal Periodic Review of India (Geneva, May 04, 2017)

May 04, 2017

## Thank you, Mr. President, Excellencies, Distinguished delegates, ladies and gentlemen

It is my privilege to welcome you all to India's Third Universal Periodic Review. India would like to compliment the UN Human Rights Council on the continued relevance of the process of UPR, which in the course of its two cycles, has emerged as a unique peer review mechanism. We remain convinced of its effectiveness in encouraging the promotion and protection of human rights in all parts of the world. We have been steadfast in adhering to the requirements of the process.

India's ancient wisdom sees the world as one family "Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam". This ethos is reflected in the Indian tradition of openness and diversity; co-existence and cooperation. Along with being the world's largest democracy, Indian polity also weaves in immense diversity with respect for tolerance and mutual understanding.

India believes that achieving human rights goals calls for constant dialogue, engagement and coordination among various stakeholders. As a responsible member of the United Nations, my country remains committed towards meaningful engagement with international organizations as well as other States in a spirit of reciprocity with a common desire for a better world.

The UPR national report drafting process has been treated by us as an opportunity to receive feedback on our laws and policies.

We followed a broad-based consultative approach. The report that is with you aims at enabling engagement, conversation, and dialogue on a whole range of themes and issues. To this end, the report highlights the achievements, challenges and constraints that we would like to share with you in India's human rights journey.

### Mr. President,

Supported by a rights oriented constitutional framework, secular polity, independent judiciary, free and vibrant media, vocal civil society, and a range of national and state level commissions that monitor compliance with human rights, India continues with its endeavours towards observance of human rights. Our government's motto of "Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas" that is All Together and Development for All is a true reflection of our commitment to achieve inclusive development in the spirit of 'leaving no one behind'.

We remain convinced that inclusive and equitable development is the key to securing a life of dignity, security, empowerment and freedom for all. Hence, we have been putting in place a set of robust socio-economic policies to address the various basic needs of people, including health, education, housing, poverty alleviation, women empowerment, food security, social security measures and the like. We have acknowledged the need for sustainable development and are aware of potential of conflict between competitive and inclusive growth. Keeping this in mind, we have been directing our development policies to ensure that the benefits reach all sections.

### Mr. President,

My government attaches utmost priority to poverty eradication and achieving inclusive sustainable development. India continues to maintain that sustainable lifestyles, and sustainable patterns of consumption and production, are key to this objective. Major initiatives like Smart Cities, Make in India, Beti Bachao Beti Padhao—Celebrate the Girl Child and Enable her Education, Swachh Bharat—Clean India, Jan Dhan Yojana—Bank Accounts for All, Digital India, Skill India, Start up India etc. mirror

the targets of the Seventeen Sustainable Development Goals for achieving the 2030 Agenda.

An important plank of India's development agenda, as well as of its push towards good governance and the creation of a knowledge society, has been the "Digital India" programme. This programme visualises transforming India into a digitally empowered society through increased connectivity, better access to knowledge, delivery of services, and e-governance through digital means.

We have widened the coverage of the Aadhaar Unique Identification Number, to prevent leakages and to ensure targeted delivery of scheme benefits. To further institutionalize the project, the Aadhaar Targeted Delivery of Financial and other Subsidies, Benefits and Services Act, 2016 was passed by Parliament. A crucial legislation for identification and to receive social benefits directly in the bank accounts. Over a billion Aadhaar cards have been issued so far.

Apart from improving governance structures, India's development policy focuses on ensuring social security, right to work with just and favourable conditions, and to a range of socio-economic entitlements to all citizens. For instance, India has taken various steps to eliminate all forms of malnutrition. The National Food Security Act, 2013 aims to provide food and nutritional security to up to 75% of the rural population and 50% of the urban population through improvement in the Public Distribution System. The Act also makes provisions to meet the nutritional requirements of pregnant women, malnourished children, and homeless and destitute persons. This law has now been implemented throughout the country. The Act also has a strong gender component, in keeping with our commitment to gender mainstreaming. The Act stipulates that the eldest adult woman member be designated the head of the household on the ration card for access to the public distribution system.

### Third Universal Periodic Rewview of India

We have also continued with our efforts in addressing child malnutrition. The coverage of the Integrated Child Development Scheme has been expanded for better nutrition, health, and overall development of children that are less than 6 years old. It also provides nutritional and health support to pregnant and lactating mothers. We continue to work towards effective implementation of the Mid-Day Meal scheme in government-run schools.

To secure the right to work, and the right to livelihood, the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme has been the flagship employment programme. It is an entitlement based law covering the entire country wherein citizens in the rural areas get the opportunity to have gainful employment at their doorstep. Allocation for this Scheme has increased consistently over years. The new feature is that the wages are compulsorily transferred directly in the bank accounts of the beneficiaries. I am pleased to share with you that women availed nearly 60% of the total work days created under this Scheme. We have also been encouraged by the employment generation through cooperative training programmes.

### Mr. President,

India remains a young nation with over 60% of the population below the age of 35. My government seeks to develop India into the "Skill Capital" of the world through the "Skill India Initiative." We are working with several other countries in a mutually beneficial manner and the youth are the main beneficiaries.

Education is a fundamental pillar of development in any society. India therefore prioritises inclusive and quality education for all. It continues to support various programmes and policies for universalising educational opportunities with special emphasis on the girl child.

We have also overhauled the mechanism for evaluating compliance with labour laws. Through a Unified Labour Web Portal, employers are required to file returns giving details of their compliance with labour laws. We believe

that the move from an inspection-based to a self-reporting mechanism should streamline nation-wide compliance with labour laws, and targeted inspection based on objective criteria should protect the rights of employees.

India has also taken various steps to promote equal participation by women in the workforce. To ensure a safe and dignified work environment, and to facilitate overall socio-economic empowerment of women, we have enacted a law requiring employers to provide effective redressal to women complaining of sexual harassment, and to take other measures necessary for fostering a gender sensitive, safe working environment for women.

Recognizing that women bear a large share of familial care- giving responsibilities, which adversely impacts their optimal participation in the workforce, the Government is committed to restructuring of workspaces to make them more sensitive to women's social circumstances. The Maternity Benefits Amendment Act, 2017 provides extended maternity leave, crèche facilities, and flexible working hours to facilitate women's equal access to employment opportunities.

### Mr. President,

In all its policies, India seeks to ensure inclusive development and the protection of rights of vulnerable groups. We have enacted a range of laws to address sexual assault and other gender based crimes. We have overhauled the legal framework for dealing with child sexual assault. To better protect children from exploitative conditions and to ensure that they have freedom, dignity and opportunity, the National Child Policy, 2013 has put in place a rights- based policy framework for addressing children's needs. Similarly, the Child Labour Prohibition Act protects children from exploitation.

We remain deeply committed towards reinforcing and accelerating the efforts towards combating human trafficking. Through amendments to criminal laws, we now provide stringent punishment for trafficking. Since we

recognise that a law enforcement response is only a partial step towards addressing the multiple human rights violations that a trafficked person suffers, we have been putting in place various schemes for rehabilitation of survivors of trafficking. To comprehensively address issues relating to human trafficking, the Government is in advanced consultations with stakeholders on a new Anti-Human Trafficking Bill.

### Mr. President,

India has been at the forefront of recognizing the equal rights of transgender persons. In April 2014 the Indian Supreme Court gave a landmark judgment directing the government to declare transgender persons as a 'third gender' and included them as an "Other Backward Class" entitled to affirmative action benefits. The Court also reinforced that they should have all rights under law, including marriage, adoption, divorce, succession and inheritance.

### Mr. President,

India has made significant progress in addressing the special needs of persons with disabilities through our Accessible India Campaign, and by overhauling our legislative framework on the rights of persons with disabilities and the rights of persons with mental health issues. My government remains committed to provide conducive environment to persons with special abilities to fulfill their potential.

India has amended its laws to provide more stringent punishment for atrocities against persons belonging to the Scheduled Castes and Tribes. In addition, as you will see from the National Report, a range of policy measures have been put in place to address issues of social exclusion, deprivation and disadvantage that may be faced by such groups.

### Mr. President.

India remains alert to the problem of Global Warming, and the necessity to factor in environmental sustainability in our development policies. The

Supreme Court of India has recognized the right to clean environment as a part of an individual's right to life guaranteed by the Constitution of India. India has been an active participant in the deliberations at the UNFCCC, and all international for with respect to the efforts to combat Climate Change. We have articulated our belief in ethical and people-centric approach to Climate Change by espousing "Climate Justice". India played a constructive role to aid the early entry into force of the Paris Agreement, and for the amendment to the Montreal Protocol. As part of the thrust towards fulfilling our people's right to a clean environment, India has launched the Swachh Bharat Abhiyan-Clean India Campaign. This is a nationwide programme that aims to facilitate collective behavioural changes regarding practices of sanitation through community-led initiatives. The success of the campaign is reflected in the fact that the sanitation coverage in rural areas that stood at 38.76% in 2012–13 went up to 63.68% by April 2017. Some States have enacted a law that makes having a toilet in the house a pre-requisite for a prospective candidate to contest local selfgovernment elections.

Apart from working towards socio-economic development, India continues to adhere to its robust constitutional framework for the protection of civil liberties. We are proud of our Constitution and are committed to safeguarding the fundamental rights and fulfilling the Directive Principles of State Policy enshrined therein. These Constitutional provisions underpin the national identity of 1.25 billion people. Modern India's commitment to Human Rights is the basic part of India's Constitution. The Constitution provides for several Fundamental Rights of citizens and even non-citizens. The most basic of these rights is the Right to Life and Liberty provided in Article 21. The substance of this right is that no person whether citizen or otherwise can be deprived of life and liberty except in accordance with procedure established by law. There can be no arbitrary arrests or detention. A person who is detained has a right to move to a court of law. Even the Supreme Court of India can be moved directly by any person by filing a writ of Habeas Corpus for infraction of his or her rights. There can be no detention in jail or police station without sanction of the court.

### Third Universal Periodic Rewview of India

Aberrations, if any, are dealt with by our internal processes that include our fiercely independent judiciary, autonomous Human Rights Commission at both national and State levels, vigilant and vocal media and a vibrant civil society. All these institutions ensure that authorities remain respectful of constitutional and human rights norms.

### Mr. President,

Concerns have been raised with regard to the Armed Forces Special Powers Act. However, this Act is applied only to disturbed areas where the law and order machinery is dealing with exigent circumstances like terrorism. These areas are very few and in proximity to some international borders. Whether this Act should be repealed or not is a matter of on-going vibrant political debate in my country. The Supreme Court of India has upheld the constitutionality of the Act and laid down strict guidelines. Recently, the Court held that the armed forces cannot use excessive force in the course of the discharge of their duties under the Act, which does not allow blanket immunity for perpetrators of unjustified deaths or offences.

### Mr. President,

India remains committed to ratify the Convention against Torture. We believe in peace, non-violence and upholding human dignity. As such, the concept of torture is completely alien to our culture and it has no place in the governance of the nation. The Government requested the Law Commission of India to examine and give a comprehensive report covering all aspects of criminal law so that necessary amendments can be made in Indian Penal Code, Code of Criminal Procedures and Indian Evidence Act etc. The Law Commission of India has been examining the changes required to domestic law prior to carrying out the ratification process. In the meantime, acts of torture remain punishable under various provisions of the Indian Penal Code. The higher judiciary also serves as a bulwark against violations. For instance, the Supreme Court of India has recognized that long periods of incarceration on death row pending a decision on clemency amounts to

torture, and has held that such delay is a ground for commuting the death sentence.

India remains cognizant of another aspect of civil liberties that relates to extra-judicial killings. The Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions has acknowledged drop in unlawful killings in India. India's National Human Rights Commission has in place a robust monitoring mechanism for cases of extrajudicial executions. In 2014, the Supreme Court of India issued extensive guidelines for effective and independent investigation of such deaths and the judiciary monitors investigation in specific cases.

### Mr. President,

I have also come across concerns raised regarding Indian judiciary's ability for redressal of rights violations due to barriers to access to justice. The Right to fair trial and free legal aid up to the highest court are enshrined as Fundamental Rights in the Constitution of India and thus guaranteed to all individuals. So much so that as the Attorney General of India, I was summoned by the Supreme Court at 2 in the morning to hear a last-ditch petition, after several rounds of litigation, by a convict who was guilty of terrorism to escape punishment. This shows the importance attached to upholding of human rights by India.

However, we remain conscious that the large backlog of cases often results in delays in their closure. The Law Commission's recommendations on institutional changes to facilitate timely justice are being considered by the Government and the Supreme Court of India. The Government is also coordinating with the judiciary to explore other avenues. The National Mission for Justice Delivery and Legal Reforms has been launched with the specific aim of reducing delays and arrears in the judicial system.

### Mr. President,

We are proud of our rich and diverse cultural heritage. Safeguarding the rights of minorities forms an essential core of our polity. The Indian Constitution enshrines various provisions for the protection of the rights and interest of the minorities. The State makes no distinction between caste, creed, colour or religion of a citizen. India is a secular State with no State religion. Article 16 guarantees that in matters of public employment, no discrimination shall be made on grounds of race, religion, caste or language etc. Article 25 of the Indian constitution guarantees freedom of religion to every individual. Article 30 gives the minorities the right to establish and administer educational institutions of their choice. Some of India's most famous institutions of academic excellence are minority institutions.

### Mr. President,

The right to free speech and expression occupies its rightful place in the core of our Constitution. As the world's largest multi-layered democracy, we fully recognize the importance of free speech and expression. Our people are conscious of their political freedoms and exercise their choices at every opportunity.

### Mr. President,

When India speaks, she does so not just for herself, but also for the larger cause of justice, dignity and human rights. With its living civilization, diversified culture, abundant natural resources, and skilled human capital, India is one of the fastest growing economies. We also acknowledge that we face challenges and issues including those that are unique to us but the indomitable spirit of our people continues to guide us. As an Indian saying goes 'If we are facing in the right direction, all we have to do is keep on walking'.

### I thank you all as I conclude my opening remarks.

Statement of Prof. (Dr.)
Ranbir Singh Vice Chancellor,
National Law University Delhi
at the Third Universal Periodic
Review of India

Statement of Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi On the Drafting Process for India's National Report

Mr. President, Excellencies, Distinguished delegates, Ladies and Gentlemen,

The National Law University, Delhi has been privileged to assist with the drafting of India's third UPR National Report.

The drafting process for India's national report began over a year ago at the behest of the Government of India. The UNHRC guidelines and the informal guidance note issued by the OHCHR were used extensively in preparing the report.

We followed a broad consultative process and organized a series of national level consultations with civil society representatives, national human rights institutions and commissions, and academicians to aid in the identification of issues, achievements, challenges and constraints in advancing human rights in India. We also attended and benefitted from a National Consultation on the UPR organized by India's National Human Rights Commission.

In a series of inter-ministerial meetings, the feedback received through this consultative process was relayed to the relevant ministries. Using the information provided by the various ministries and data gathered from these consultative processes, we put together this national report.

To enable even broader consultation, and in the spirit of complete transparency, a draft of the national report was also published online for public comments before the report was finalized.

### ST/VC/NLU/DPINR/IND/1

This report is, therefore, the product of intense and sustained efforts of all the participants in the various consultations, as well as the government ministries and officials with whom we worked closely to provide data and other inputs that went into drafting the report.

Thank you, Mr. President for your time.

# Report of the Working Group on India's UPR with List of Recommendations for India



### **General Assembly**

Distr.: General 17 July 2017

Original: English

### **Human Rights Council**

**Thirty Sixth session** 

11–29 September 2017 Agenda item 6 Universal Periodic review

Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\*

India

GE.17-12027(E)







<sup>\*</sup> The annex is being issued without formal editing, in the language of submission only.

### Introduction

- 1. The Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, established in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 5/1, held its twenty-seventh session from 1 to 12 May 2017. The review of India was held at the 8th meeting, on 4 May 2017. The delegation of India was headed by the Attorney General, Mukul Rohatgi. At its 14th meeting, held on 9 May 2017, the Working Group adopted the report on India.
- 2. On 13 February 2017, the Human Rights Council selected the following group of rapporteurs (troika) to facilitate the review of India: Latvia, the Philippines and South Africa.
- 3. In accordance with paragraph 15 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 and paragraph 5 of the annex to Council resolution 16/21, the following documents were issued for the review of India:
  - (a) A national report submitted/written presentation made in accordance with paragraph 15 (a) (A/HRC/WG.6/27/IND/1);
  - (b) A compilation prepared by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) (A/HRC/WG.6/27/IND/2);
  - (c) A summary prepared by OHCHR in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) (A/HRC/WG.6/27/IND/3).
- 4. A list of questions prepared in advance by Belgium, Czechia, Germany, Mexico, the Netherlands, Norway, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland was transmitted to India through the troika. These questions are available on the extranet of the universal periodic review.

### I. Summary of the proceedings of the review process

### A. Presentation by the State under review

- 5. The delegation of India stated that India remained convinced of the effectiveness of the universal periodic review process, and reiterated its commitment to meaningful engagement with international organizations and other States in a spirit of reciprocity, with a common desire for a better world. India continued with its endeavours towards observance of human rights. When drafting its national report, India had followed a broad-based consultative approach involving various stakeholders.
- 6. For India, poverty eradication and achieving inclusive sustainable development were utmost priorities. In that regard, major initiatives had been undertaken, including Smart Cities, Make in India, Celebrate the Girl Child and Enable her Education, Bank Accounts for All, and Startup India, which mirrored the targets of the 17 Sustainable Development Goals for achieving the 2030 Agenda.
- 7. An important plank of the country's development agenda, as well as of its push towards good governance and the creation of a knowledge society, had reportedly been the Digital India programme, which aimed at transforming India into a digitally empowered society.
- 8. The coverage of the Aadhaar Unique Identification Number had been widened to prevent leakages and to ensure targeted delivery of scheme benefits. To further institutionalize the project, the Aadhaar (Targeted Delivery of Financial and Other Subsidies, Benefits and Services) Act, 2016 had been enacted. Over a billion Aadhaar cards had reportedly been issued to date.
- 9. India had taken various steps to eliminate all forms of malnutrition, including child malnutrition, notably through the adoption of the

### A/HRC/36/10

National Food Security Act, 2013 and the A/HRC/36/10 expansion of the coverage of the Integrated Child Development Services Scheme for better nutrition, health and overall development for children under the age of 6.

- 10. The Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme was the flagship employment programme in India. It was an entitlement-based scheme covering the entire country; women had been the beneficiaries of nearly 60 per cent of the total work days created under the Scheme. Young people were the main beneficiaries of the Skill India Initiative.
- 11. India had prioritized inclusive and quality education for all by supporting various programmes and policies to universalize educational opportunities, with special emphasis on the girl child.
- 12. India had been making efforts to evaluate the level of compliance with labour laws through a unified labour and employment web portal, through which employers were required to file returns giving details of their compliance with labour laws. In addition, a law had been enacted requiring employers to provide effective redress to women who had been victims of sexual harassment.
- 13. In all its policies, India had sought to ensure inclusive development and the protection of the rights of vulnerable groups. To that end, the National Policy for Children 2013 had put in place a rights-based policy framework to address children's needs.
- 14. India was deeply committed to reinforcing and accelerating efforts to combat human trafficking. In that context, the Government was in advanced consultations with stakeholders on an anti-human trafficking bill to comprehensively address issues relating to human trafficking.

- 15. In April 2014, the Supreme Court had handed down a landmark judgment directing the Government to declare transgender persons as pertaining to a "third gender" and to include them in the category of an "Other Backward Class", which would entitle them to affirmative action benefits. The Court had also reinforced the point that they should have all rights under the law.
- 16. India had made significant progress in addressing the special needs of persons with disabilities through the Accessible India Campaign, and by overhauling the legislative framework on the rights of persons with disabilities and the rights of persons with mental health issues.
- 17. India had also amended its laws to provide more stringent punishment for atrocities against persons belonging to the Scheduled Castes and Tribes. In addition, a range of policy measures had been adopted to address issues of social exclusion, deprivation and disadvantage that such groups might face.
- 18. India had remained alert to the problem of global warming and the need to factor in environmental sustainability in its development policies. For instance, the Government had articulated its belief in taking an ethical and people-centred approach to climate change by espousing the principles of climate justice.
- 19. The delegation also referred to the country's constitutional framework for the protection of civil liberties and its commitment to safeguarding fundamental rights and fulfilling the Directive Principles of State Policy enshrined in the Constitution.
- 20. The independent judiciary, the autonomous human rights commissions at both the national and State levels, the media and civil society all ensured that the authorities remained respectful of constitutional and human rights norms.

### A/HRC/36/10

- 21. The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act had been applied only to disturbed areas to deal with exigent circumstances like terrorism. The Supreme Court had upheld the constitutionality of the Act and laid down strict guidelines, including that the armed forces could not use excessive force under the Act.
- 22. India was committed to ratifying the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. In that context, the Government had requested the Law Commission of India to prepare a comprehensive report covering all aspects of criminal law so that the necessary amendments could be made in the Penal Code, A/HRC/36/10 the Code of Criminal Procedure and the Evidence Act, prior to carrying out the ratification process.
- 23. Concerning extrajudicial executions, the Supreme Court issued extensive guidelines for effective and independent investigations, and the judiciary monitored investigations in specific cases.
- 24. In order to address the large backlog of cases that often resulted in delays in their closure, the Law Commission's recommendations on institutional changes to facilitate timely justice were being considered by the Government and the Supreme Court.
- 25. Safeguarding the rights of minorities formed an essential core of the polity of India, and the State made no distinction between a citizen's caste, creed, colour or religion.
- 26. The delegation stressed that the right to free speech and expression were at the core of the Indian Constitution and that people were conscious of their political freedoms and exercised their choices at every opportunity.

## **B.** Interactive dialogue

- 27. During the interactive dialogue, 103 delegations made statements. Recommendations made during the dialogue are to be found in section II of the present report.
- 28. Germany welcomed efforts to address poverty, including the issue of corruption, but was concerned about the social hardship endured by marginalized groups and about restrictions on civil society.
- 29. The Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela commended India for its efforts aiming to combat trafficking and poverty, promote the economic empowerment of women and provide social assistance to older persons, widows and persons with disabilities.
- 30. Greece welcomed efforts aiming at poverty eradication, creating an inclusive knowledge society and improving equal access to justice for all.
- 31. Guatemala was concerned about reports of discrimination against scheduled castes, women and religious minorities.
- 32. The Holy See made several recommendations.
- 33. Ghana urged India to finalize its ratification of the Convention against Torture and the Optional Protocol thereto.
- 34. Iceland commended India for the steps it had taken to combat violence against women, but regretted that violence persisted and women faced barriers to accessing justice.
- 35. Indonesia supported the efforts to provide continuous training for law enforcement officers and to raise their awareness of the need to respect human rights while performing their tasks.

- 36. The Islamic Republic of Iran welcomed the allocation of increased resources for the enjoyment of economic and social rights.
- 37. Iraq commended the increase in health expenditure and the health insurance plans for families living under the poverty line.
- 38. Spain welcomed the debate on the need to combat child labour and child marriage.
- 39. Israel commended India for enacting the 2005 Right to Information Act, launching the Digital India programme and setting up anti-human trafficking units.
- 40. Italy commended efforts towards socioeconomic development and poverty eradication, and steps taken to favour access to justice and fight human trafficking.
- 41. Japan welcomed the commitment of India to reforming its legal system with a view to protecting and promoting the rights of women and girls. A/HRC/36/10
- 42. Kazakhstan highlighted the policies India had adopted to address health, education, housing, poverty alleviation, food and social security.
- 43. Kenya commended India for its continued efforts to increase the protection and promotion of human rights.
- 44. Kyrgyzstan backed the efforts of India, inter alia, to empower women and eradicate discrimination against them.
- 45. The Lao People's Democratic Republic commended India for its socioeconomic policies to address people's needs.

- 46. Latvia encouraged India to continue its efforts to improve the protection of women against violence, particularly in rural areas, and to enhance women's political participation.
- 47. Lebanon commended the policies to promote freedom of expression and religion, strategies for poverty alleviation and the efforts to fight against human trafficking.
- 48. Libya commended the harmonization of development policies with the Sustainable Development Goals to make progress in the health and education sectors.
- 49. Liechtenstein made recommendations.
- 50. Lithuania commended India for reforming the Penal Code regarding the crimes of rape and sexual assault.
- 51. Madagascar welcomed progress regarding the promotion of food and health security and the willingness to intensify human rights training for security officials.
- 52. Malaysia viewed positively various development programmes to assist citizens to pursue upward socioeconomic mobility, such as the Stand-Up India scheme.
- 53. Maldives commended India for its continuous efforts to make education accessible to all children under the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act.
- 54. Mauritius lauded India for its efforts and actions aiming at poverty alleviation, food security, access to safe water, education, health and housing rights.

- 55. Mexico acknowledged the progress India had made since the previous cycle, particularly its cooperation with special procedures and its efforts to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals.
- 56. Montenegro noted positive steps regarding the use of capital punishment, such as the Supreme Court decision to commute 15 death sentences to life imprisonment.
- 57. Mozambique commended India for the strides made towards socioeconomic development and poverty eradication.
- 58. Myanmar applauded India for its legislative, institutional and policy initiatives to promote and protect human rights and achieve socioeconomic development.
- 59. Namibia applauded the efforts of India to implement the recommendations from its previous review and its standing invitation to the special procedure mandate holders.
- 60. Nepal commended the measures aimed at improving the welfare of the marginalized population and the socioeconomic policies addressing people's basic needs.
- 61. The Netherlands welcomed the steps taken to protect the rights of women and to enhance compensation to victims of communal violence.
- 62. Norway commended India for adopting the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act and ratifying the Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) of the International Labour Organization (ILO), as had been recommended during the previous review.
- 63. The delegation of India stated that many specific laws existed to address violence against women and to bring perpetrators to justice,

such as the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013, and the Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013. The draft National Policy for Women aimed at further strengthening the entire architecture to address violence against women. A/HRC/36/10

- 64. India did not discriminate against girls in terms of the right to education. Girls were actively encouraged to attend school and great emphasis was put on girls' enrolment. There had been encouraging results in terms of girls' retention in school, and the dropout rate for girls in middle school and beyond had fallen.
- 65. In addition to the anti-human trafficking bill, India had ratified several international human rights instruments pertaining to human trafficking.
- 66. The Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act prohibited acceptance and utilization of foreign contributions or foreign hospitality for any activities detrimental to the national interest. Any violation of the Act was a cognizable offence.
- 67. In addition to the commitment of India to ratifying the Convention against Torture, there were sufficient provisions in the domestic legal framework that prohibited torture, and the Supreme Court had laid down specific rules and guidelines that the police must follow when making arrests.
- 68. India was a secular country and every citizen had the right to practice and promote his or her religion peacefully. The Ministry of Minority Affairs, the National Human Rights Commission and the National Commission for Minorities investigated cases related to discrimination, including religious discrimination.

- 69. The Government had introduced the Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Bill, 2016, which provided for, inter alia, non-discrimination against transgender persons and the formation of a national council for transgender persons.
- 70. Consensual sexual acts conducted in private by adults of the same sex, which were criminalized under section 377 of the Penal Code, had been decriminalized by a High Court judgment. The judgment had later been overturned by the Supreme Court. However, the Supreme Court had agreed to re-examine the issue.
- 71. The Government's guidelines on communal harmony established the preventive and administrative measures to be taken to maintain communal harmony and the standard operating procedures to deal with situations of communal violence.
- 72. Oman appreciated the measures to improve the situation of women and persons with disabilities and the National Initiative on Care for the Elderly.
- 73. Pakistan made recommendations.
- 74. Peru highlighted the adhesion of India to the principles of climate justice and the progress made against serious diseases.
- 75. The Philippines lauded the efforts to eradicate poverty and to prioritize renewable energy for cleaner air in cities.
- 76. Portugal noted the amendment to criminalize rape and gang rape, while regretting that marital rape fell outside the scope of the amendment.
- 77. Qatar appreciated the efforts to implement the previous review recommendations regarding sustainable development, which had had a

positive impact on the enjoyment of human rights.

- 78. The Republic of Korea welcomed the "Save the Girl, Educate the Girl" campaign and efforts to eradicate poverty.
- 79. The Russian Federation welcomed, inter alia, the establishment of human rights training for law enforcement officers.
- 80. Rwanda encouraged India to enhance its efforts to combat racial discrimination and discriminatory practices against women.
- 81. Saudi Arabia commended the positive achievements made in the field of human rights and the efforts to implement accepted recommendations.
- 82. Senegal commended India for its government-wide approach to meeting the Sustainable Development Goals and its Housing for All programme. A/HRC/36/10
- 83. Sierra Leone was concerned about incidents of sexual violence against women and urged India to intensify its efforts to address them.
- 84. Singapore commended India for its success in halving the number of rural households without a drinking water supply.
- 85. Slovakia recognized actions taken by India to completely ban the employment of children under the age of 14.
- 86. Slovenia expressed concern about the negative consequences of the relaxation of the standards for environmental impact assessments.
- 87. South Africa welcomed the provision of the smart card-based cashless health insurance cover to families in poverty and workers in the informal sector.

- 88. Ireland urged India to review the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act and pay special attention to human rights defenders working on minority and children's rights.
- 89. The State of Palestine commended India for its commitment to addressing climate change by pushing for strong domestic climate action for a more sustainable development pathway.
- 90. The Sudan appreciated the recent legislative and institutional developments, especially the enactment of the anti-corruption law in 2013.
- 91. Sweden wished India every success in promoting an inclusive society where everyone's rights were equally respected.
- 92. Switzerland expressed concern about the increasing restrictions imposed on independent civil society actors, including those belonging to religious minorities.
- 93. Thailand welcomed the enactment of the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act and the implementation of the National Child Labour Policy and the Accessible India Campaign.
- 94. Timor-Leste noted with appreciation the 2014 Supreme Court decision to commute to life imprisonment the death sentences of 15 individuals.
- 95. Turkey encouraged India to strengthen the mandate of the National Human Rights Commission to allow it to address a greater variety of human rights issues.
- 96. Uganda commended India for attaching utmost priority to poverty eradication and achieving inclusive sustainable development.

- 97. Ukraine encouraged India to reconsider pending requests from OHCHR and a number of special procedure mandate holders.
- 98. The United Arab Emirates appreciated the fact that the Indian courts had considered the right to a clean environment to be a human right.
- 99. The United Kingdom requested that India provide an update on the steps taken to address the remaining challenges concerning women's and girls' rights.
- 100. The United States of America noted the lack of transparency and uneven application of the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act, which impeded the work of non-governmental organizations (NGOs).
- 101. The delegation of India stated that the Government aimed to reserve one third of the seats in the lower house of Parliament and the state legislative assemblies for women. There were currently 1.4 million directly elected women representatives. Women's digital literacy and financial inclusion were at the top of the Government's agenda.
- 102. India was committed to ensuring better health and well-being for its entire population through its National Health Policy. Improvements in institutional deliveries had reached 79 per cent in 2015-2016, from 29 per cent in 1992-1993. The infant mortality rate had dropped from 57 per 1,000 live births in 2005-2006 to 41 per 1,000 live births in 2015-2016. A/HRC/36/10
- 103. The Law Commission of India had not recommended the criminalization of marital rape in 2000. After a commission had handed down an opinion favouring that course of action, the Government had requested the Law Commission to deliberate upon the subject during its comprehensive review of the criminal justice system.

104. The Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act, 1989 had been amended with effect from January 2016, providing for the establishment of special courts for the speedy trial of cases.

105. The Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016 had been enacted in December 2016 and brought into force in April 2017. It contained special provisions on the rights of women with disabilities and on inclusive education for children with disabilities. The Accessible India Campaign had been launched in order to create a barrier-free environment for persons with disabilities.

106. The Government had launched the Swacha Bharat Mission in order to accelerate efforts to achieve universal sanitation coverage, improve cleanliness and eliminate open defecation by 2019. Similarly, the Government was implementing the National Rural Drinking Water Programme and the Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation to ensure water supply to households in rural and urban areas.

107. Referring to the current security situation in Jammu and Kashmir and the high number of casualties sustained by Indian security forces, the delegation stressed the zero-tolerance policy on terrorism and the active, constructive role played by several stakeholders in that region.

108. The death penalty was exercised in the "rarest of rare" cases, when the crime committed was so heinous that it shocked the conscience of society. Furthermore, Indian law provided for all requisite procedural safeguards, for suspension of the death penalty for pregnant women, and for prohibition of executions of persons with mental or intellectual disabilities and juvenile offenders.

109. Uruguay welcomed the draft law for the protection, well-being and social security of domestic workers.

- 110. Uzbekistan appreciated the efforts of India to eradicate poverty and protect vulnerable groups in society.
- 111. Honduras noted the advances in poverty reduction, but was concerned about the high incidence of violence against children, especially girls.
- 112. Viet Nam commended India for its achievements in, inter alia, access for all to quality education, eradicating poverty and protecting vulnerable groups.
- 113. Yemen commended the efforts to realize development and eradicate poverty, which were reflected in sustainable development plans and the poverty alleviation strategies.
- 114. Zambia noted with satisfaction the efforts of India in, inter alia, poverty eradication and achieving inclusive sustainable development.
- 115. Zimbabwe noted the socioeconomic policies of India to address people's basic needs.
- 116. Algeria welcomed the launch of the Digital India programme, aiming, inter alia, at increasing connectivity and access to knowledge.
- 117. Angola raised concerns about increased cases of violence and sexual harassment against women, and of child labour.
- 118. Argentina welcomed the inauguration of the Stand-Up India scheme.
- 119. Australia was concerned that certain legislative instruments, including the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act, might overly restrict the activities of civil society.

- 120. Bahrain appreciated the efforts made in the area of economic and social rights and noted challenges faced by women and children. A/ HRC/36/10
- 121. Bangladesh praised India for its socioeconomic development, including its measures for poverty eradication, improving nutrition, removing the urban-rural divide and addressing the sanitation and safe drinking water needs of its people.
- 122. Belarus welcomed the cooperation of India with international human rights mechanisms, including recent visits by Special Rapporteurs.
- 123. Belgium, while welcoming efforts to address violence and discrimination against women, stated that further progress could be achieved in that area.
- 124. Bhutan appreciated measures such as the Stand-Up India scheme, reforms to reduce delays in the judicial system and the steps taken to enhance the equality and empowerment of women.
- 125. The Plurinational State of Bolivia highlighted policies to improve living conditions in rural areas, especially with regard to water and sanitation.
- 126. Botswana noted that the socioeconomic development agenda of India was aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals and welcomed the focus on poverty eradication.
- 127. Brazil welcomed the commitment of India to poverty eradication and its initiatives in the field of health.
- 128. Brunei Darussalam noted that the Constitution of India guaranteed an individual's right to a clean environment.

- 129. Bulgaria noted the importance of the National Human Rights Commission and called for the extension of its mandate.
- 130. The delegation of India stated that the Government had mapped out all the central ministries, national missions and centrally supported development programmes regarding each specific Sustainable Development Goal, and national consultations on all the goals had been held, with broad participation of various stakeholders.
- 131. In order to address the agrarian crisis, India planned to develop a sense of income security by aiming for optimal utilization of water resources, conservation of soil fertility with balanced use of fertilizers and provision of connectivity between farms and markets.
- 132. The Government was committed to ensuring a safe working environment for all, including those engaged in promoting and protecting human rights, while stressing that human rights defenders' activities should comply with the domestic legal framework.
- 133. The right to housing remained a priority for the Government. It had launched the Housing for All by 2022 programme to provide better and affordable housing facilities to the rural poor, urban slum dwellers and other economically weaker sections of the society, including minorities.
- 134. The Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006 had vested the forest rights and occupation of forest land to Scheduled Tribes and other traditional forest dwellers.
- 135. India was committed to eradicating child labour. It had addressed the phenomenon through a multipronged strategy, which included the enactment of the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act, 2016, prohibiting the employment of children below 14 years of

age in any occupation, except after school work and when assisting in family enterprises.

- 136. Several legislative and policy measures had been taken to promote social, economic and emotional security for the elderly. In 2017, the Government had launched the Rashtriya Vayoshri Yojana, a scheme for providing physical aids and assisted-living devices for senior citizens.
- 137. Burkina Faso requested further information on the establishment of the crisis centres providing victims of sexual violence with legal aid.
- 138. Canada welcomed efforts to strengthen justice for victims of sexual assault, and commended the Supreme Court of India for its recognition of transgender persons. A/HRC/36/10
- 139. Chad welcomed the inclusive consultation process in the preparation of the national report and the cooperation of India with United Nations treaty bodies.
- 140. Chile wished to know whether specific measures existed to address violence and discrimination based on sexual orientation or sexual identity.
- 141. China noted the measures taken to fight corruption and reduce the backlog in court cases, and international cooperation to prevent human trafficking.
- 142. Colombia highlighted the Stand-Up India and Housing for All programmes and human rights training for law enforcement officials.
- 143. Côte d'Ivoire encouraged India to continue its actions regarding, inter alia, freedom of expression, gender equality and socioeconomic development.

- 144. Cuba welcomed the new legislation in the fields of persons with disabilities and child labour and the new policy on primary education.
- 145. Czechia encouraged a positive response to the report of the Law Commission of India recommending the abolition of the death penalty.
- 146. Denmark welcomed the acceptance of the recommendations from the previous review to ratify the Convention against Torture.
- 147. Egypt appreciated the culture of transparency, openness and accountability in the governmental functioning, as enacted in the Right to Information Act.
- 148. Estonia welcomed the efforts of India to improve access to financial services and pensions for economically marginalized persons.
- 149. Ethiopia noted progress in implementing the review recommendations relating to environmental policies.
- 150. Finland commended the adoption of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act in 2016.
- 151. France encouraged India to respect international standards during law enforcement operations, and the freedoms of expression and peaceful assembly.
- 152. Gabon welcomed efforts to eliminate violence and discrimination against women and to combat violence against, and exploitation of, children.
- 153. Sri Lanka requested India to elaborate on best practices and practical measures taken to encourage citizens to exercise their right to information.

- 154. Haiti noted the great focus on reducing poverty, especially extreme poverty, and increasing access to quality education.
- 155. The delegation of India stated that, in order to address child sexual abuse, a law had been enacted providing for child-friendly mechanisms for reporting a crime, recording of evidence, investigation, speedy trial of offences and in-camera trials through designated special courts.
- 156. Under the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015, giving a child into marriage was considered as cruelty and any child in that situation would be treated as a child in need of care and protection. District child protection units registered cases involving forced child marriage that had resulted in pregnancy.
- 157. The potential of reproductive and sexual health education was recognized by India and the Government had invested in partnerships to create and strengthen opportunities for young people.
- 158. The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act had been used only in exceptional circumstances, and several checks and balances had been introduced to ensure that there were strict guidelines for the armed forces and for monitoring alleged human rights violations by such forces.
- 159. Regarding recent incidents relating to members of the African community, the delegation stated that the Minister of External Affairs personally monitored the situation A/HRC/36/10 and had requested the Lieutenant Governor of Delhi to have the case investigated on a fast-track basis.
- 160. The delegation of India concluded by reiterating its commitment to leave no one behind and to ensure that all the policies and schemes in place reached the bottom of the pyramid.

# II. Conclusions and/or recommendations

161. The following recommendations will be examined by India, which will provide responses in due time, but no later than the thirty-sixth session of the Human Rights Council:

- 161.1 Ratify the Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (Estonia);
- 161.2 Consider adhering to the Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, aiming at the abolition of the death penalty, and abolish the death penalty (Portugal);
- Ratify the Optional Protocols to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (Guatemala);
- 161.4 Consider withdrawing the remaining declarations and reservations to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (Rwanda);
- 161.5 Ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, as previously recommended (Botswana);
- 161.6 Ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel,
  Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
  urgently and in accordance with its commitments from
  the 2012 universal periodic review (Norway);
- 161.7 Ratify, before the next universal periodic review cycle, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Czechia);
- 161.8 Finalize the efforts to ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, as well as other international instruments, as recommended by relevant treaty bodies (Bulgaria);

- 161.9 Ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel,
  Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
  (Greece) (Guatemala) (Italy) (Lebanon) (Montenegro)
  (Mozambique) (South Africa) (Sweden) (Turkey)
  (Ukraine) (United States of America);
- 161.10 Ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention against
  Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading
  Treatment or Punishment, the Optional Protocol to
  the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of
  Discrimination against Women, the Optional Protocol
  to the International Covenant on Economic, Social
  and Cultural Rights and the Optional Protocol to the
  Convention on the Rights of the Child on a
  communications procedure (Portugal);
- 161.11 Ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel,
  Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and
  ensure that the instrument of ratification is consistent
  with the Convention (Australia);
- 161.12 Swiftly ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and its Optional Protocol, ensure that domestic legislation defines torture in line with international A/HRC/36/10 standards, and extend an invitation to the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment for an official visit to the country (Germany);
- 161.13 Proceed with early ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, as well as the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Japan);
- 161.14 Ratify the Convention against Torture as soon as possible and further, ratify the Minimum Age

Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) of the International Labour Organization and the Optional Protocols to Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and abolish the death penalty as recommended by the Law Commission of India (Ireland);

- 161.15 Finalize the process of ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Kazakhstan);
- 161.16 Redouble its efforts to ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Republic of Korea);
- 161.17 Speed up the process for the ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Israel);
- 161.18 Advance towards the ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Chile);
- 161.19 Consider completing the process of ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Burkina Faso):
- 161.20 Complete the process of preparation for the ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Russian Federation);
- 161.21 Intensify efforts to ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Denmark);
- 161.22 Strengthen national efforts towards the ratification of

	the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel,
	Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
	(Indonesia);
161.23	Ratify the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel,
	Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and
	its Optional Protocol and swiftly move ahead with the
	Prevention of Torture Bill (Estonia);
161.24	Enact the Prevention of Torture Bill currently pending
	in the parliament in compliance with the Convention
	against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or
	Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Turkey);
161.25	Adopt the draft law on the prevention of torture and
	other forms of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment
	or punishment by complying with established
	international norms (Madagascar);
161.26	Adopt the draft law on the prevention of torture and
	ensure that it complies with the provisions of the
	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman
	or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Senegal);
161.27	Consider ratifying the International Convention on the
	Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and
	Members of Their Families (Uruguay); A/HRC/36/10
161.28	Promptly ratify the International Convention on the
	Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and
	Members of Their Families and the Convention against
	Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading
	Treatment or Punishment (Guatemala);
161.29	Expedite efforts to ratify the International Convention
	for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced
	Disappearance and the Convention against Torture and
	Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or
	Punishment (Sierra Leone);
161.30	Ratify the International Convention for the Protection
	of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Greece)

(Ukraine);

- 161.31 Consider ratifying the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Burkina Faso);
- 161.32 Accede to and implement the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and article 7 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child to end statelessness and guarantee nationality for affected children (Kenya);
- Accede to and fully implement the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness and the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees (Slovakia);
- 161.34 Ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Estonia);
- Accede to and fully align its national legislation with the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Latvia);
- 161.36 Consider ratifying the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Uruguay);
- Develop a national strategy to tackle exploitative labour practices and to ratify the ILO Protocol of 2014 to the Forced Labour Convention, 1930, and continue to strengthen protections for children (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
- 161.38 Ratify the Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) of the International Labour Organization (Slovenia);
- 161.39 Consider ratifying the ILO Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189) (Uruguay);

161.40	Consider acceding to the ILO Worst Forms of Child
	Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) (Uruguay);
161.41	Ratify the international conventions to which it has
	committed itself (Madagascar);
161.42	Ratify other human rights conventions to which India
	is not yet a State party (Philippines);
161.43	Ratify the international human rights instruments to
	which India is not a State party yet (Côte d'Ivoire);
161.44	Adopt an open, merit-based selection process when
	selecting national candidates for United Nations treaty
	body elections (United Kingdom of Great Britain and
	Northern Ireland);
161.45	Respond positively to visit requests by the special
	procedures of the Human Rights Council (Latvia); A/
	HRC/36/10
161.46	Put in place a specific mechanism for implementing
	previous accepted recommendations (Uganda);
161.47	Request all necessary technical assistance enabling the
	Government to meet its international commitments
	(Côte d'Ivoire);
161.48	Accede to and adapt its national legislation to the Rome
	Statute, including incorporation of dispositions to
	swiftly and fully cooperate with the International
	Criminal Court (Guatemala);
161.49	Bring into law the Prevention of Communal and
	Targeted Violence bill (2013) (United Kingdom of
	Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
161.50	Accede to and adapt its national legislation to the Arms
	Trade Treaty (Guatemala);
161.51	Criminalize marital rape (Portugal) (Sweden);
161.52	Include a provision in its Penal Code criminalizing
	marital rape (Australia);
161.53	Remove the exception relating to marital rape from
	the definition of rape in the Indian Penal Code and

	criminalize "honour crimes" (Slovenia);
161.54	Remove the exception relating to marital rape from
	the definition of rape in section 375 of the Indian Pena
	Code (Belgium) (Iceland);
161.55	Consider removing the exception relating to marita
	rape from the definition of rape in section 375 of the
	Indian Penal Code (Namibia);
161.56	Remove the exception of marital rape from the
	definition of rape in article 375 of the Penal Code, in
	line with the efforts already undertaken for the
	protection of women (France);
161.57	Criminalize all forms of sexual abuse of girls under 18
	years of age, including marital rape and "honour
	crimes" (Zambia);
161.58	Take additional steps in criminalizing marital rape
	(Lithuania);
161.59	Consider introducing laws to specifically prevent and
	prosecute "honour" killings and prosecute those tha
	order or sanction violence against women (Namibia)
161.60	Continue efforts to eradicate child and forced marriage
	(Peru);
161.61	Continues its endeavours in promoting and protecting
	the human rights of all its citizens in an inclusive
	manner (Nepal);
161.62	Adopt a national plan on human rights (Kenya);
161.63	Expand the scope of the Right of Children to Free and
	Compulsory Education Act and promote human rights
	education in the school curriculum (Slovakia);
161.64	Include human rights education in the draft new
	education policy (Zambia);
161.65	Continue and step up national efforts to train and guide
	security staff and other law enforcement officials in
161.66	the field of human rights (Egypt);
161.66	In the spirit of its Constitution, which guarantees equa

rights to all minorities, further invest in dedicated human rights training of police officials to register and investigate cases of discrimination and violence and to hold them accountable when they fail to do so (Finland):

- Provide systematic training on women's rights to all law enforcement personnel, medical staff and judicial officials (Belgium); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.68 Strengthen capacity-building with regard to human rights for civil servants involved in the protection of women and girl and boy victims of violence and sexual abuse (Mexico);
- Adopt a comprehensive national plan on inclusion in order to combat persisting inequality, paying particular attention to persons in vulnerable situations such as women, children, persons with disabilities and minorities (Honduras);
- 161.70 Strengthen the national framework to reduce all kinds of discrimination (Iraq);
- Intensify efforts to guarantee equality and non-discrimination in line with its international obligations by developing public human rights awareness programmes and taking concrete steps to advance the rights of women and girls, members of religious minorities, and lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons and to combat caste-based discrimination, including to: criminalize marital rape; decriminalize consensual same-sex relations; and establish appropriate policies and practices for registering, investigating and prosecuting violence against women, girls and members of religious minorities (Ireland);
- 161.72 Ensure that laws are fully and consistently enforced to provide adequate protections for members of

religious minorities, scheduled castes, tribes and other vulnerable populations (United States of America); 161.73 Take effective measures to combat rising instances of religious intolerance, violence and discrimination (Kazakhstan): 161.74 Enact the Prevention of Torture Bill (South Africa); 161.75 Adopt laws and implement policies to supress all forms of de facto discrimination against any person or group (Guatemala); 161.76 Repeal section 377 of the Indian Penal Code and ensure that consensual same-sex relations are not criminalized (Iceland); 161.77 Take steps to end the criminalization of same-sex relations (Israel); 161.78 Amend or revoke section 377 to decriminalize samesex relations (Norway); 161.79 Repeal section 377 of the Indian Penal Code, which criminalizes same-sex conduct between consenting adults, and enact legislation consistent with the Supreme Court's recognition of the rights of transgender persons (Canada); 161.80 Adopt measures to effectively protect transgender persons, including the implementation of the Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Bill (Israel); 161.81 Continue the fight against discrimination, exclusion, dehumanization, stigmatization and violence suffered by scheduled castes (Peru); 161.82 Take urgent measures to repeal the norms that discriminate against castes, and investigate and sanction the perpetrators of acts of discrimination and violence against them, in particular against the Dalits (Argentina);

161.83

Take the necessary measures to ensure effective implementation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled

	Tribes Act, notably through the training of State
	officials (France);
161.84	Establish a national action plan for combating hate
	crimes, racism and negative stereotypes against people
	of African descent inside its territory, including
	appropriate programmes of public awareness that will
	address the A/HRC/36/10 problem of racism and Afro-
	phobia, in full consultation with those particularly
	affected (Haiti);
161.85	Consolidate the progress made towards reaching the
	Sustainable Development Goals and in the
	improvement of human development indicators
	(Islamic Republic of Iran);
161.86	Continue efforts in the implementation of sustainable
	development strategies for the year 2030 (Sudan);
161.87	Allocate adequate resources to realize the Sustainable
	Development Goal targets to reduce maternal mortality
	and end preventable deaths of newborns and children
	under 5 (Norway);
161.88	Continue facilitating equal access to justice for all and
	provide legal aid, in particular to vulnerable groups,
	minority groups and marginalized people (Angola);
161.89	Further promote equal access to justice for all,
	especially by providing more legal aid to the poor and
	marginalized (Ethiopia);
161.90	Establish and implement regulations to ensure that the
	business sector complies with international and national
	human rights, labour, environment and other standards
	(Uganda);
161.91	Continue its efforts in relation to its environmental
	policies (State of Palestine);
161.92	Provide access to clean and modern energy to all its
	people and develop climate-friendly green cities (United
	Arab Emirates);
	′′

161.93	Continue implementing its international commitments
	to achieve its nationally determined contributions under
	the Paris Agreement of 2015 (United Arab Emirates)
161.94	Continue its efforts to effectively enforce its
	environmental policies and further increase the growth
	of forest cover in the country (Brunei Darussalam);
161.95	Take appropriate measures to avoid the excessive use
	of force by security officers (Greece);
161.96	Deepen the respect about principles of proportionality
	and necessity for armed forces and police (Peru);
161.97	Revise the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act to bring
	it into compliance with the obligations under the
	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
	with a view to fighting impunity (Switzerland);
161.98	Review the Code of Criminal Procedure as regards
	the use of force by law enforcement officials, in
	particular section 46 (Sierra Leone);
161.99	Prevent and pursue through the appropriate judicial
	means all violent acts against religious and tribal
	minorities, Dalits and lower castes (Holy See);
161.100	Strengthen efforts for the prevention of cases of
	intercommunal violence (Russian Federation);
161.101	Step up its efforts against caste-based violence
	discrimination and prejudice, including by eradicating
	all forms of caste-based discrimination in the
	educational system (Czechia);
161.102	Prohibit forced sterilization in line with requests by
	the Special Rapporteurs on torture, violence against
	women, and the right to health, and in line with the
	National Population Policy (Iceland);
161.103	Take concrete steps to prevent coercive, unsafe and
	abusive sterilization and create greater accountability
	for these practices, including A/HRC/36/10 ensuring
	free and full consent prior to conducting the procedure

	and compliance with international standards (Sweden)
161.104	Abolish the death penalty (Mozambique);
161.105	Consider the abolition of the death penalty (Greece);
161.106	Consider imposing a moratorium on the application of
	the death penalty with a view to abolishing it (Namibia):
161.107	Consider imposing a de facto moratorium on the use
	of the death penalty with a view to its total abolition
	(Rwanda);
161.108	Establish a moratorium on executions as a first step
	towards the abolition of the death penalty (Belgium);
161.109	Introduce an official moratorium on the death penalty
	(Lithuania):
161.110	Establish a de jure moratorium on capital executions
	and commute the existing death sentences with a view
	to fully abolishing the death penalty (Italy);
161.111	Consider establishing a moratorium on the death
	penalty with a view to its abolishment (Spain);
161.112	Establish a formal moratorium on the death penalty
	with a view to ratifying the Second Optional Protocol
	to the International Covenant on Civil and Political
	Rights (Australia);
161.113	Consider the establishment of a moratorium or
	executions during the process of consideration by the
	Government of the recommendations of the Law
	Commission of India on the issue of the abolition of
	the death penalty (Montenegro);
161.114	Consider establishing a moratorium on the death
	penalty (Timor-Leste);
161.115	Introduce a moratorium on executions with a view to
	abolishing the death penalty (France);
161.116	Improve prison conditions in order to ensure the rights
	and dignity of all those deprived of their liberty
	(Zambia);
161.117	Continue with relevant consultations and adopt a law

- on combating trafficking in persons (Belarus);
- 161.118 Continue the consultation process with all concerned parties to elaborate a new draft of the law against trafficking in persons (Cuba);
- 161.119 Continue and redouble its efforts to combat trafficking in persons and modern slavery, including through better law enforcement to end impunity for human traffickers and through initiatives aimed at destignatizing and rehabilitating victims of trafficking (Liechtenstein);
- 161.120 Continue to implement measures to stop the flow of trafficking in persons (Holy See);
- 161.121 Strengthen the national mechanisms to combat human trafficking and support victims and their rehabilitation (Lebanon);
- 161.122 Accelerate efforts towards combating human trafficking, particularly by protecting and rehabilitating victims (Philippines);
- 161.123 Continue combating human trafficking (Senegal);
- 161.124 Continue efforts to improve social services that provide support to victims of human trafficking, forced labour and those who have been sexually exploited (Maldives); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.125 Continue improving the national legislative framework on the rehabilitation of victims of trafficking (Ukraine);
- 161.126 Strengthen efforts to guarantee freedom of religion and belief, especially by retracting so-called anticonversion laws (Holy See);
- 161.127 Take all necessary measures to protect the rights of persons belonging to religious minorities, and repeal laws which restrict religious conversion (Netherlands);
- 161.128 Abolish anti-conversion laws and grant access to justice to victims of religious violence and discrimination (Italy);
- 161.129 Repeal the requisite legislation to stop violence and

- discrimination against religious minorities (Kenya);
- 161.130 Take visible policy and other measures to ensure the freedom of religion and belief and address the alarming trend of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance including mob violence committed, incited and advocated by right-wing parties and affiliated extremist organizations against minorities, particularly Muslims, Christians, Sikhs and Dalits (Pakistan);
- 161.131 Ensure that any measure limiting freedom of expression, assembly and association on the Internet is based on clearly defined criteria in accordance with international law including international human rights law (Sweden);
- 161.132 Continue to develop laws and make efforts to ensure freedom of religion and belief (Lebanon);
- 161.133 Guarantee freedom of religion or belief by implementing existing laws to better protect individuals belonging to minority groups from hate speech, incitement to religious violence, discrimination on religious grounds and forcible conversions (Canada);
- 161.134 Enact a law for the protection of human rights defenders (Lithuania);
- 161.135 Amend the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act to ensure the right to freedom of association, which includes the ability of civil society organizations to access foreign funding, and protect human rights defenders effectively against harassment and intimidation (Germany);
- 161.136 Revise the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act to ensure benign working conditions for civil society in India (Norway);
- 161.137 Improve the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act so that it could fund a broader scope of non-governmental

- organizations (Republic of Korea);
- 161.138 Ensure consistent, transparent application of the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act regulations to permit full exercise of the right to freedom of association (United States of America);
- 161.139 Review and amend the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act, which may restrict the access of NGOs to foreign financial assistance and lead to their arbitrary shut-down (Czechia);
- 161.140 Lift legal restrictions or hurdles to the work of civil society individuals or organizations and ensure that they can undertake their legitimate activities without fear of reprisals (Switzerland);
- 161.141 Carry out independent investigations in all cases of attacks against journalists (Lithuania);
- 161.142 Put an end to all curbs on freedom of expression and association (Pakistan); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.143 Guarantee freedom of expression, association and peaceful assembly for all individuals and promote meaningful dialogue that embraces and allows freely organized advocacy of diverging views by civil society (Canada):
- 161.144 Continue its efforts to protect religious freedom and the rights of minority groups based on its Constitution and other relevant laws (Republic of Korea);
- 161.145 Bring all legislation concerning communication surveillance in line with international human rights standards and especially recommend that all communication surveillance requires a test of necessity and proportionality (Liechtenstein);
- 161.146 Take the necessary steps to ensure that all operations of intelligence agencies are monitored by an independent oversight mechanism (Liechtenstein);
- 161.147 Continue efforts to reduce corruption and increase

accountability (Sudan);

- 161.148 Strengthen the independent functioning of the judiciary in order to reduce delays in judicial proceedings, enhance transparency of the processes and guarantee the right to speedy trial (Estonia);
- 161.149 Allocate appropriate resources to reducing backlog and delays in the administration of cases in courts (Ethiopia);
- 161.150 Promote and facilitate universal access to birth registration, especially for people living in extreme poverty, belonging to religious minorities or living in remote areas of the country, through the implementation of mobile units and carrying out awareness-raising campaigns (Mexico);
- 161.151 Ensure children's rights to acquire a nationality in accordance with article 7 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, regardless of the parents' legal status or ethnicity (Slovakia);
- 161.152 Remove barriers prohibiting scheduled castes and schedule tribes from registering their children's births and obtaining birth certificates (Bahrain);
- 161.153 Continue strengthening efforts aimed at promoting food security and eradicate all forms of malnutrition, in particular among children under the age of 5 (Libya);
- 161.154 Continue its programmes for the promotion of socioeconomic development, with a particular focus on the country's rights-based approach to food security targeting the most vulnerable groups (Sri Lanka);
- 161.155 Implement a human rights-based, holistic approach to ensure access to adequate housing as well as to adequate water and sanitation, including for marginalized groups, Dalits, scheduled castes, the homeless, the landless, scheduled tribes, religious and ethnic minorities, persons with disabilities and women

(Germany);

- 161.156 Expand the Housing for All scheme to realize the right to adequate housing for vulnerable people and eliminate homelessness by 2030 (South Africa);
- 161.157 Continue the Housing for All policy led by the Government to eradicate by 2030 the problem of homelessness, in conformity with Sustainable Development Goal 11 of the 2030 Agenda (Algeria);
- 161.158 Ensure the systematic functioning of all mechanisms for the delivery of financial and other forms of assistance to those in need which have been established within the framework of the National Social Assistance Programme (Russian Federation); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.159 Ensure that the implementation of a set of socioeconomic policies, such as the Stand-Up India scheme, is targeted, accountable and transparent, so that their benefits reach all sections of society (Singapore);
- 161.160 Continue efforts and measures aimed at enhancing social security and labour policies, and expand the development model in rural areas (Egypt);
- 161.161 Continue studying the possibility of a universal basic income as a way to further reduce poverty levels with a view to possibly phasing out the existing social protection system, in full consultation with all stakeholders (Haiti);
- 161.162 Continuously improve its endeavours to eradicate poverty in the country (Indonesia);
- 161.163 Continue its efforts towards socioeconomic development and poverty eradication (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 161.164 Further strengthen its efforts towards socioeconomic development and poverty eradication (Myanmar);
- 161.165 Continue efforts to realize social and economic

	development and eradicate poverty (Saudi Arabia);
161.166	Continue efforts to reduce poverty, improve the well-
	being of the people, protect and enforce the rights of
	vulnerable groups of the population (Uzbekistan);
161.167	Continue its efforts to achieve sustainable development
	and eradicate poverty (Yemen);
161.168	Continue its fight against poverty, lack of adequate
	food, safe water and sanitation, while paying special
	attention to the need to introduce a child rights-based
	approach in all policies (Bulgaria);
161.169	Continue national efforts to realize social and economic
	development and eradicate poverty, and achieve
	comprehensive sustainable development for all
	(Egypt);
161.170	Continue to increase access to safe and sustainable
	drinking water in rural areas and to improve sanitation
	coverage, especially for women and girls (Singapore);
161.171	Carry on its efforts and action in the promotion of
	social security and labour policy (Islamic Republic of
	Iran);
161.172	Implement further actions in promoting social and
	work security, as well as efforts to spread the country's
	growth model in rural areas (Uzbekistan);
161.173	Continue promoting sustainable economic and social
	development and raising the living standard of its people
	so as to lay down a firm basis for the enjoyment of
	human rights by its people (China);
161.174	Accelerate the process of consolidating existing labour
	laws to, inter alia, promote the right to equal
	opportunities for work and at work, as well as to
	achieve occupational safety (Zimbabwe);
161.175	Increase public spending on the health sector in
	accordance with the 2017 National Health Policy and
	take further steps to strengthen health facilities

(Kazakhstan);

- 161.176 Continue to provide access to health services for the elderly under the National Programme for Health Care of the Elderly (Colombia);
- 161.177 Take steps towards improving access to health, especially access to maternal health and to adequate obstetric delivery services so as to reduce maternal and child mortality (Zimbabwe); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.178 Continue its efforts to ensure that the universal health-care scheme covers disadvantaged groups, including persons with disabilities and persons living in remote rural areas, who still face obstacles in accessing basic health-care services (Lao People's Democratic Republic);
- 161.179 Continue furthering the sexual and reproductive health and rights of all women by immediately putting an end to camp-based sterilization operations in accordance with the Supreme Court order of 14 September 2016, by ensuring all women access to counselling on and access to the full range of modern contraceptives in a voluntary, safe and quality manner, and by providing comprehensive sexuality education (Finland);
- 161.180 Redouble its efforts in maternal health, sexual and reproductive health and comprehensive contraceptive services (Colombia);
- 161.181 Increase the government expenditure in the field of education (Iraq);
- 161.182 Continue its efforts to ensure that all children have access to education at all levels and all categories (Lao People's Democratic Republic);
- 161.183 Continue to take steps to provide inclusive and quality education for all (Myanmar);
- 161.184 Continue its efforts in implementing its comprehensive

- policies to ensure quality education for all children (Qatar);
- 161.185 Promote children's right to education, especially education on climate change adaptation and mitigation (Viet Nam);
- 161.186 Step up its efforts to carry out the second phase of its Education for All programmes to focus on providing affordable and quality secondary education in the country (Brunei Darussalam);
- 161.187 Increase investment in universal, mandatory and free education by giving priority to measures to eradicate discrimination and exclusion that affect girls, children with disabilities, Dalits and marginalized persons (Mexico);
- 161.188 Accept more efforts to increase girls' secondary education, including ensuring that schools are girlfriendly in all parameters (Kyrgyzstan);
- 161.189 Continue to ensure access to education for all, especially children of scheduled castes and tribes (Holy See);
- 161.190 Strengthen the integration of the gender perspective in the formulation and implementation of policies (Colombia);
- 161.191 Ensure implementation of the Gender Budgeting Scheme in all states and union territories (South Africa);
- 161.192 Continue incorporating the gender perspective in the design and implementation of policies, and guarantee that the development agenda pays equal attention to the concerns of women (Cuba);
- 161.193 Redouble efforts on ensuring gender equality and take measures to prevent gender discrimination (Timor-Leste):
- 161.194 Continue its efforts to ensure women's equal participation in the workforce and generate

- employment opportunities for women in rural areas (State of Palestine);
- 161.195 Take urgent measures to put an end to harmful traditional practices such as so-called "honour killings", selective abortion on the basis of the sex of the fetus, sati, devadasi, early and enforced marriage, bringing the perpetrators to justice and guaranteeing assistance for victims (Argentina); A/HRC/36/10
- 161.196 Implement existing laws on all forms of violence and sexual violence against women and girls, including "honour" crimes, female feticide and female infanticide; expand the definition of rape and sexual assault to include marital rape; and end harmful practices such as child, early and forced marriage (Canada);
- 161.197 Improve the enforcement of the legal provisions prohibiting harmful and discriminatory practices against women and girls, in particular child marriages, dowry-related murders and honour killings, and ensure that all women, without discrimination, have access to public services (Czechia);
- 161.198 Step up efforts for comprehensive protection of women and girls, in particular against sexual violence (Greece);
- 161.199 Combat violence against women through effective legislation and law enforcement measures (China);
- 161.200 Take more effective measures to protect and promote the rights of women and girls, as they continue to be subjected to widespread violence, discrimination and exploitation (Japan);
- Take additional serious measures to eliminate violence against women and children, including sexual violence (Kyrgyzstan);
- 161.202 Continue and strengthen measures to prevent and

	repress offences and violence against women and girls,
	including through early childhood education,
	awareness-raising and enhancing effective mechanisms
	of reparation (Viet Nam);
161.203	Eliminate traditional harmful practices, such as the
	rising number of deaths due to dowry and burning of
	widows (Bahrain);
161.204	Continue its efforts to promote the empowerment of
	women and to combat violence against women, in line
	with the recommendations of the Verma Committee
	(Brazil);
161.205	Continue strengthening institutions to eliminate
	discrimination and violence against women, in particular
	sexual violence, and adopt specific measures to achieve
	gender equality in the labour market (Chile);
161.206	Increase the resources so that female survivors of
	violence and domestic abuse can denounce the crimes
	with guarantees they will be not repeated (Spain);
161.207	Punish domestic violence, as well as promote
	awareness-raising campaigns on gender violence,
	including "honour" crimes (Spain);
161.208	Reinforce the legal framework for the prevention of
	violence against women, including running a national
	awareness campaign and ensuring comprehensive
	investigation and prosecution in cases of domestic
	violence (Italy);
161.209	Adopt a comprehensive law to combat all forms of
	violence against women, including domestic violence
	and marital rape (Honduras);
161.210	Strengthen the protection of women's rights in
	accordance with the Protection of Women from
	Domestic Violence Act and other relevant laws
	(Republic of Korea);
161.211	Ensure effective implementation of the law on the

	protection of women against domestic violence (Gabon);
161.212	Further the implementation of relevant laws and
101.212	policies as well as training for public officials, to tackle
	sexual offences and unfair treatment to women
	(Thailand); A/HRC/36/10
161.213	
101.213	Redouble its efforts to enforce its legal provisions
	prohibiting harmful and discriminatory practices that
161 014	violate the rights of women and girls (Liechtenstein);
161.214	Strengthen legislation to combat sexual offences against
	children and women (Timor-Leste);
161.215	Enhance activities aimed at eliminating discrimination
	against women, which particularly affects women from
	lower castes (Kyrgyzstan);
161.216	Implement the Protection of Children from Sexual
	Offences Act to increase the protection of children
	from sexual abuse (Kenya);
161.217	Ensure that legislation defining the minimum legal age
	of marriage at 18 is enforced at all levels, everywhere
	in the country (Iceland);
161.218	Step up its efforts to eradicate child marriage and so-
	called "honour crimes" (Israel);
161.219	Step up efforts to combat and eliminate child, early
	and forced marriages (Sierra Leone);
161.220	Adopt legislative measures and policies to prevent early
	or forced marriages (Honduras);
161.221	Continue and intensify the actions to prohibit child
	marriage (Gabon);
161.222	Strengthen the adoption of socioeconomic programmes
	which promote the empowerment of women and their
	participation in public and political life (Angola);
161.223	Enact the Women's Reservation Bill providing for the
	reservation of seats for women in the parliament and
	legislative assemblies, in order to enhance the political
	105101411 to appoint office, in order to children the political

	participation of women (Netherlands);
161.224	Adopt the law on quotas which aims to reserve at
	least 33 per cent of seats in legislative bodies of the
	central and state governments for women (Senegal);
161.225	Adopt the law on quotas which aims to reserve seats
	for women in legislative bodies of the central and state
	governments (Algeria);
161.226	Accelerate work on the protection of the rights of
	children and women in particular (Turkey);
161.227	Prohibit child labour in family enterprises and extend
	the list of dangerous activities in line with the
	recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of
	the Child (Spain);
161.228	Consider repealing the provision that allows children
	to work in family-based occupations (Slovakia);
161.229	Continue strengthening national strategies to combat
	child labour (Brazil);
161.230	Continue to take all necessary measures to enhance
	the effectiveness of the protection of children, in
	particular in cases of sexual violence against children
	(Portugal);
161.231	Continue strengthening institutions to protect children
	and adolescent girls and boys, with a view to eradicating
	child labour, sexual exploitation and the practice of
	child marriage (Chile);
161.232	Develop specific guidelines for protection and support
	for victims of child sexual abuse and their families
	undergoing trial (Slovakia); A/HRC/36/10
161.233	Introduce legislation to prohibit corporal punishment
	of children in the home and in all other settings, including
	as a sentence under traditional forms of justice
	(Liechtenstein);
161.234	Introduce comprehensive and continuous public
	education, awareness-raising and social mobilization

- programmes on the harmful effects of corporal punishment (Liechtenstein);
- 161.235 Establish a database of all cases of violence against children and explicitly prohibit all forms of corporal punishment of children under 18 years of age in all settings (Zambia);
- 161.236 Increase efforts to improve the rights of the child, notably through the effective application of the prohibition of child labour, as well as the rights of women (France);
- 161.237 Establish a monitoring mechanism to oversee the effective implementation of the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Amendment Act, the National Child Labour Policy and the Accessible India Campaign to prevent exploitation of children and protect the rights of persons with disabilities (Thailand);
- Take all appropriate measures in the implementation of the 2015 Juvenile Justice Act to give children aged 18 years and below an opportunity for rehabilitation (Botswana);
- 161.239 Continue efforts to promote opportunities for persons with disabilities to benefit from development gains (Libya);
- 161.240 Continue efforts aimed at improving the access of persons with disabilities to education, vocational training and health care (Oman);
- 161.241 Expand the integration of persons with disabilities into programmes and plans for sustainable development (Qatar);
- Take holistic measures to protect the rights of persons with disabilities, the elderly and other vulnerable groups (China):
- 161.243 Continue policies aimed at ensuring the enjoyment of the rights and freedoms of persons with disabilities

- and access to resources and services under the Accessible India Campaign (Colombia);
- Ensure that girls with disabilities are afforded the same right to education as all children (Australia);
- 161.245 Continue strengthening the policies in favour of the rights of peasants and other persons working in rural areas (Plurinational State of Bolivia);
- 161.246 Continue the endeavour to facilitate the access of elderly persons to preventive services and necessary treatment (Oman);
- 161.247 Immediately stop its atrocities and violations of human rights against the Kashmiri people, and allow them to exercise their right to self-determination through a free and fair plebiscite in accordance with the United Nations Security Council resolution (Pakistan);
- 161.248 Repeal the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act and the Public Safety Act and take credible actions to end the prevailing culture of impunity in "Indian-Occupied Kashmir" (Pakistan);
- 161.249 Immediately ban the use of pellet guns and hold accountable perpetrators who have used lethal force against unarmed civilians in "Indian-Occupied Kashmir" (Pakistan);
- 161.250 Provide unhindered access to the United Nations and other international organizations, and accede to the call of the High Commissioner for Human Rights to allow an OHCHR fact-finding mission to "Indian-A/HRC/36/10 Occupied Kashmir" to investigate and report on the human rights situation there (Pakistan).
- 162. All conclusions and/or recommendations contained in the present report reflect the position of the submitting State(s) and/or the State under review. They should not be construed as endorsed by the Working Group as a whole. A/HRC/36/10

#### Annex

#### Composition of the delegation

The delegation of India was headed by the Attorney General, Mukul Rohatgi, and composed of the following members:

- H.E. Ms. Ruchi Ghanashyam, Vice Minister for Foreign Affairs of India:
- H.E. Mr. Rajiv K. Chander, Ambassador/Permanent Representative of India;
- Mr. P. S. Patwalia, Additional Solicitor General of India;
- Dr. Virander K. Paul, Deputy Permanent Representative of India;
- Prof. Ranbir Singh, Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi;
- Mr. Manish Chauhan, Joint Secretary (UNES), Ministry of External Affairs;
- Ms. Uma Sekhar, Joint Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs;
- Ms. Bina Prasad, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs;
- Mr. Chetan B. Sanghi, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development;
- Mr. Vikram Singh Gaur, Joint Secretary, NITI Aayog;
- Mr. K. C. Samria, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Minority Affairs;
- Mr. Alok Ranjan Jha, Counsellor (Political), Permanent Mission of India to the United Nations Office in Geneva;
- Dr. A. Sudhakara Reddy, Counsellor (Legal), Permanent Mission of India to the United Nations office in Geneva;
- Mr. Priya Ranjan, Director, Ministry of Rural Development;
- Mr. Khagesh Garg, Director, Ministry of Social and Justice Empowerment;
- Dr. Yumnam Arun Kumar, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs;
- Ms. Nabanita Chakrabarti, Under Secretary in the Ministry of External Affairs of India;
- Ms. Ridhi Sahni, Consultant in the Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India;
- Mr. C. G. Naidu, Office of Attorney General of India.

## India's Response to Recommendations made at UPR III



#### **Advance version**

Distr.: General 6 September 2017

Original: English

#### **Human Rights Council**

#### Thirty-sixth session

11-29 September 2017 Agenda item 6

**Universal Periodic Review** 

Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic  $Review^*$ 

India

Addendum

Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review

### List of recommendations proposed to be accepted/noted by the Government of India

A/HRC/36/10	Recommendation made by	Response by
		the Government of India
161.2	Portugal	Noted
161.3	Guatemala	Noted
161.4	Rwanda	Noted
161.5	Botswana	Accepted
161.6	Norway	Accepted
161.7	Czechia	Accepted
161.8	Bulgaria	Accepted
161.9	Greece, Guatemala, Italy, Lebanon,	
	Montenegro, Mozambique, South Africa,	
	Sweden, Turkey, Ukraine,	
	United States of America	Accepted
161.10	Portugal	Noted
161.11	Australia	Accepted
161.12	Germany	Noted
161.13	Japan	Noted
161.14	Ireland	Noted
161.15	Kazakhstan	Noted
161.16	Republic of Korea	Accepted
161.17	Israel	Accepted
161.18	Chile	Accepted
161.19	Burkina Faso	Accepted
161.20	Russian Federation	Accepted
161.21	Denmark	Accepted

<sup>\*</sup>The present document was not edited before being sent to the United Nations translation services.

161.22	Indonesia	Accepted
161.23	Estonia	Noted
161.24	Turkey	Noted
161.25	Madagascar	Noted
161.26	Senegal	Noted
161.27	Uruguay	Noted
161.28	Guatemala	Noted
161.29	Sierra Leone	Noted
161.30	Greece, Ukraine	Noted
161.31	Burkina Faso	Noted
161.32	Kenya	Noted
161.33	Slovakia	Noted
161.34	Estonia	Noted
161.35	Latvia	Noted
161.36	Uruguay	Noted
161.37	United Kingdom of Great Britain	
	and Northern Ireland	Noted
161.38	Slovenia	Accepted
161.39	Uruguay	Accepted
161.40	Uruguay	Accepted
161.41	Madagascar	Accepted
161.42	Philippines	Noted
161.43	Côte d'Ivoire	Noted
161.44	United Kingdom of Great Britain	
	and Northern Ireland	Accepted
161.45	Latvia	Accepted
161.46	Uganda	Accepted
161.47	Côte d'Ivoire	Accepted
161.48	Guatemala	Noted
161.49	United Kingdom of Great Britain	
	and Northern Ireland	Noted
161.50	Guatemala	Noted
161.51	Sweden, Portugual	Noted
161.52	Australia	Noted

161.53	Slovenia	Noted
161.54	Belgium, Iceland	Noted
161.55	Namibia	Noted
161.56	France	Noted
161.57	Zambia	Noted
161.58	Lithuania	Noted
161.59	Namibia	Accepted
161.60	Peru	Accepted
161.61	Nepal	Accepted
161.62	Kenya	Accepted
161.63	Slovakia	Accepted
161.64	Zambia	Noted
161.65	Egypt	Accepted
161.66	Finland	Accepted
161.67	Belgium	Accepted
161.68	Mexico	Accepted
161.69	Honduras	Accepted
161.70	Iraq	Accepted
161.71	Ireland	Noted
161.72	United States of America	Accepted
161.73	Kazakhstan	Noted
161.74	South Africa	Noted
161.75	Guatemala	Accepted
161.76	Iceland	Noted
161.77	Israel	Noted
161.78	Norway	Noted
161.79	Canada	Noted
161.80	Israel	Accepted
161.81	Peru	Accepted
161.82	Argentina	Accepted
161.83	France	Accepted
161.84	Haiti	Noted
161.85	Islamic Republic of Iran	Accepted
161.86	Sudan	Accepted

161.87	Norway	Accepted
161.88	Angola	Accepted
161.89	Ethiopia	Accepted
161.90	Uganda	Accepted
161.91	State of Palestine	Accepted
161.92	United Arab Emirates	Accepted
161.93	United Arab Emirates	Accepted
161.94	Brunei Darussalam	Accepted
161.95	Greece	Accepted
161.96	Peru	Accepted
161.97	Switzerland	Noted
161.98	Sierra Leone	Noted
161.99	Holy See	Accepted
161.100	Russian Federation	Accepted
161.101	Czechia	Noted
161.102	Iceland	Accepted
161.103	Sweden	Accepted
161.104	Mozambique	Noted
161.105	Greece	Noted
161.106	Namibia	Noted
161.107	Rwanda	Noted
161.108	Belgium	Noted
161.109	Lithuania	Noted
161.110	Italy	Noted
161.111	Spain	Noted
161.112	Australia	Noted
161.113	Montenegro	Noted
161.114	Timor-Leste	Noted
161.115	France	Noted
161.116	Zambia	Accepted
161.117	Belarus	Accepted
161.118	Cuba	Accepted
161.119	Liechtenstein	Accepted
161.120	Holy See	Accepted

161.121	Lebanon	Accepted
161.122	Philippines	Accepted
161.123	Senegal	Accepted
161.124	Maldives	Accepted
161.125	Ukraine	Accepted
161.126	Holy See	Noted
161.127	Netherlands	Noted
161.128	Italy	Noted
161.129	Kenya	Noted
161.130	Pakistan	Noted
161.131	Sweden	Noted
161.132	Lebanon	Accepted
161.133	Canada	Noted
161.134	Lithuania	Noted
161.135	Germany	Noted
161.136	Norway	Noted
161.137	Republic of Korea	Noted
161.138	United States of America	Noted
161.139	Czechia	Noted
161.140	Switzerland	Noted
161.141	Lithuania	Noted
161.142	Pakistan	Noted
161.143	Canada	Noted
161.144	Republic of Korea	Accepted
161.145	Liechtenstein	Noted
161.146	Liechtenstein	Noted
161.147	Sudan	Accepted
161.148	Estonia	Noted
161.149	Ethiopia	Accepted
161.150	Mexico	Accepted
161.151	Slovakia	Noted
161.152	Bahrain	Noted
161.153	Libya	Accepted
161.154	Sri Lanka	Accepted

161.189	Holy See	Accepted
161.190	Colombia	Accepted
161.191	South Africa	Noted
161.192	Cuba	Accepted
161.193	Timor-Leste	Accepted
161.194	State of Palestine	Accepted
161.195	Argentina	Noted
161.196	Canada	Noted
161.197	Czechia	Accepted
161.198	Greece	Accepted
161.199	China	Accepted
161.200	Japan	Accepted
161.201	Kyrgyzstan	Accepted
161.202	Viet Nam	Accepted
161.203	Bahrain	Noted
161.204	Brazil	Accepted
161.205	Chile	Accepted
161.206	Spain	Noted
161.207	Spain	Accepted
161.208	Italy	Accepted
161.209	Honduras	Noted
161.210	Republic of Korea	Accepted
161.211	Gabon	Accepted
161.212	Thailand	Accepted
161.213	Liechtenstein	Accepted
161.214	Timor-Leste	Accepted
161.215	Kyrgyzstan	Accepted
161.216	Kenya	Accepted
161.217	Iceland	Accepted
161.218	Israel	Accepted
161.219	Sierra Leone	Accepted
161.220	Honduras	Accepted
161.221	Gabon	Accepted
161.222	Angola	Accepted

161.223	Netherlands	Noted
161.224	Senegal	Noted
161.225	Algeria	Noted
161.226	Turkey	Accepted
161.227	Spain	Noted
161.228	Slovakia	Noted
161.229	Brazil	Accepted
161.230	Portugal	Accepted
161.231	Chile	Accepted
161.232	Slovakia	Accepted
161.233	Liechtenstein	Accepted
161.234	Liechtenstein	Accepted
161.235	Zambia	Accepted
161.236	France	Accepted
161.237	Thailand	Accepted
161.238	Botswana	Accepted
161.239	Libya	Accepted
161.240	Oman	Accepted
161.241	Qatar	Accepted
161.242	China	Accepted
161.243	Colombia	Accepted
161.244	Australia	Accepted
161.245	Plurinational State of Bolivia	Accepted
161.246	Oman	Accepted
161.247	Pakistan	Noted
161.248	Pakistan	Noted
161.249	Pakistan	Noted
161.250	Pakistan	Noted

# The Universal Periodic Review Process: A Critical Appraisal

### Volume-16, 2017 The Universal Periodic Review Process; A Critical Appraisal

#### Ranbir Singh and Aparna Chandra\*\*

#### **Abstract**

The Universal Periodic Review is the result of wide ranging reforms to the UN human rights mechanisms carried out in the first decade of the 21st century. The UPR process seeks to review the human rights record of each UN member every 4 years. India has undergone three cycles of review since the inception of the mechanism. This article describes and evaluates the UPR process and India's engagement with it.

- \* Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh is the Vice-Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi.
- \*\* Dr. Aparna Chandra is an Assistant Professor of Law and Research Director, Centre for Constitutional Law, Policy and Governance, National Law University, Delhi.
  - Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh has assisted the Ministry of External Affairs, Government of India in the preparation of India's National Reports for all three UPR cycles. Dr. Aparna Chandra was involved in the preparation of India's National Report for the third cycle. The views presented here are their own and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of any institution or entity with which they are, or have been, associated.
- 1 UN General Assembly, In Larger Freedom: Towards Development, Security and Human Rights for All: Report of the Secretary-General, 21 March 2005, A/59/2005, p.48; UN General Assembly, Note [transmitting report of the High-level Panel on Threats, Challenges and Change, entitled "A More Secure World: Our Shared Responsibility"], 2 December 2004, A/59/565, pp. 88-90. For a general discussion on the issues that triggered the reform process see Maximilian Spohr, "United Nations Human Rights Council: Between Institution Building Phase and Review of Status," Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law, Volume 14, 169-218 (2010); Sarah Joseph & Joanna Kyriakakis, "The United Nations and Human Rights," in Sarah Joseph and Adam McBeth (eds.), Research Handbook on International Human Rights Law (Edward Elgar, 2010).

© NHRC, India Journal of the National Human Rights Commission, 233-241

#### The UPR Process

Until 2006, the United Nations Commission on Human Rights (UNCHR) was the principal human rights body of the UN. However, it increasingly came under criticism, including, amongst other things, for "declining credibility and professionalism..." As a result, in 2006 the UN undertook wide-ranging reform of its human rights machinery. The Commission on Human Rights was replaced with the Human Rights Council (HRC). In establishing the Council, the UN General Assembly mandated this new body to "undertake a Universal Periodic Review, based on objective and reliable information, of the fulfillment by each State of its human rights obligations and commitments..." A year later, the Human Rights Council adopted an institution building package, which included modalities for the working of the Universal Period Review (UPR) mechanism. Through a series of subsequent resolutions and decisions these modalities have been further refined and clarified.

The UPR mechanism seeks to review the human rights record of each member of the United Nations once every four and a half years. Each member of the United Nations is reviewed for compliance with the Charter of the United Nations; the Universal Declaration of Human Rights; Human rights instruments to which that State is party; voluntary pledges and commitments made by the state, including those undertaken when presenting their candidatures for election to the Human Rights Council; and applicable international humanitarian laws. Together these instruments form the standards of the review.<sup>5</sup>

- 2 UN General Assembly, Resolution 60/251, Human Rights Council, 15 March 2006. A/RES/60/251. (emphasis added).
- 3 Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1, Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, 18 June, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1.
- 4 Human Rights Council, *Decision 6/102, Follow-up to Human Rights Council Resolution 5/1,* 27 September, 2007, ; Human Rights Council, *Resolution 16/21, Review of the work and functioning of the Human Rights Council,* 25 March, 2011, A/HRC/RES/16/21; Human Rights Council, Decision 17/119, *Follow-up to the Human Rights Council Resolution 16/21 with regard to the Universal Periodic Review,* 19 June 2011, A/HRC/DEC/17/119.
- 5 Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1, Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, 18 June, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1.

The review is based on three documents presented to the Human Rights Council. First the state under review prepares a national report on its human rights record. Second, the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) prepares a compilation of information contained in the reports of treaty bodies, special procedures and in other official United Nations documents. Third, other stakeholders, including civil society organizations and national human rights institutions, may also submit reports to the OHCHR, which summarizes this information in the form of a report.

As per the resolution establishing the HRC, the UPR was conceived as a "cooperative mechanism, based on an interactive dialogue, with the full involvement of the country concerned, and with consideration given to its capacity-building needs; such a mechanism shall complement and not duplicate the work of treaty bodies…" According to the HRC Resolution 5/1 which laid down the principles upon which the UPR mechanism was to operate, the UPR is to be conducted in a constructive, non confrontational and non politicized manner. Furthermore, the HRC has mandated that the UPR process should not become overly burdensome for states under review or for the Council, and therefore should not be overly long or take up too much of the resources of states and the Council.

These principles have influenced crucial design elements in the UPR mechanism. For example, recommendations made by states on the human rights record of a country are not binding on the country. It can choose which recommendations to accept, and which to merely note.<sup>8</sup> So, in order to keep the process limited in terms of time and effort, the HRC has placed strict word limits on the length of reports to be submitted as part of the UPR Process.<sup>9</sup> It also adheres to a strict schedule for the interactive session

- 6 UN General Assembly, Resolution 60/251, Human Rights Council, 15 March 2006. A/RES/60/251.
- 7 Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1, Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, 18 June, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1.
- 8 Human Rights Council, 8/PRST/1, Modalities and Practices for the Universal Periodic Review Process, April 9, 2008, para 10.
- 9 Human Rights Council, *Resolution 5/1, Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council*, 18 June, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1 ("the written presentation summarizing the information will not exceed 20 pages, to guarantee equal treatment to all States and not to overburden the mechanism").

where the country under review presents its record and engages in an interactive dialogue on it. $^{10}$ 

A state under review sits through a three and a half hour review session, <sup>11</sup> where it presents its own report and is asked questions and is given recommendations by other UN member states. The country under review can decide which questions to respond to, and which recommendations to accept. <sup>12</sup> The outcome of the review process is a report that summarizes the proceedings, the recommendations made, and whether or not the state under review has accepted each recommendation.

Since the UPR is a state driven mechanism, the national report prepared by the state under review is the most crucial document in the UPR process. The focus of the national report is required to be on the normative framework of laws, and equally on the implementation of human rights obligations on the ground; the advances and achievements as well as the challenges and constraints in meeting the human rights obligations of the state. <sup>13</sup> For the second and subsequent cycles, states are required to focus their report on the extent of implementation of accepted recommendations from past review cycles, as well as new developments in human rights in the country concerned. <sup>14</sup>

- 10 Human Rights Council, *Decision 17/119, Follow-up to the Human Rights Council Resolution 16/21 with regard to the Universal Periodic Review,* 19 June 2011, A/ HRC/DEC/17/119 ("The duration of the review shall be extended to three hours and thirty minutes for each country in the Working Group, so as to be within existing resources and with no additional workload, during which the State under review shall be given up to 70 minutes to be used for initial presentation, replies and concluding comments in line with President's statement PRST/8/1 of 9 April 2008").
- 11 This was initially a three-hour session, but was increased to three and a half hours *vide* Resolution 17/119. See id.
- 12 Human Rights Council, 8/PRST/1, Modalities and Practices for the Universal Periodic Review Process, April 9, 2008.
- 13 Human Rights Council, *Decision 6/102, Follow-up to Human Rights Council Resolution 5/1*, 27 September, 2007.
- 14 Human Rights Council, Resolution 16/21, Review of the work and functioning of the Human Rights Council, 25 March, 2011, A/HRC/RES/16/21; Office of High Commissioner for Human Rights, 3rd Cycle Universal Periodic Review National Report Guidance Note, 2017, available at http://www.ohchr.org/ Documents/ HRBodies/UPR/3rdCycle\_GuidanceNotePreparationReports\_EN.docx

#### **India's Engagement with the UPR Process**

India was one of the first countries to undergo review under the UPR mechanism. As of this writing, India has gone through three cycles of review; in 2008, 2012, and recently in 2017. The national report for the first cycle provided a descriptive account of the normative and institutional framework for the protection and promotion of human rights in India. Of the 18 recommendations received by India in this cycle, it accepted 5 and provided responses to the others. 15 The second national report focused on the status of implementation of the accepted recommendations from the first cycle as well as human rights developments since 2008. An interesting feature of this report was an annexure detailing the inclusion of contributions made by the judiciary towards the promotion of human rights. The second round of review resulted in 169 recommendations being made to India, 16 of which it accepted 67.17 In the third round of review, as per the guidance note issued by the OHCHR, the report focused on the status of implementation of previously accepted recommendations. India received 250 recommendations as part of the interactive process. <sup>18</sup> As of this writing, the outcome of the review has not been completed, hence the number of accepted recommendations is not yet available.

In each of these three cycles, the Ministry of External Affairs (the nodal ministry) has sought the assistance of academic institutions to prepare its national report. <sup>19</sup> It has also conducted consultations with other stakeholders,

Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: India – Addendum, 25 August, 2008, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/ UNDOC/GEN/G08/161/58/PDF/G0816158.pdf?OpenElement

Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: India,9 July 2012, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G12/ 167/57/PDF/G1216757.pdf? OpenElement

<sup>17</sup> Human Rights Council, *Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review*: India – Addendum, 17 September 2012, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G12/167/57/PDF/G1216757.pdf?OpenElement

<sup>18</sup> Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: India, 17 July, 2017, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G17/ 193/56/PDF/G1719356. pdf?OpenElement

<sup>19</sup> NALSAR, Hyderabad in 2008, and National Law University, Delhi in 2012 and 2017.

primarily civil society organizations, to receive their inputs in the formulation of the reports. Through a series of inter-ministerial meetings, the Ministry has gathered the data required to report on the implementation of accepted recommendations. Drafts of the second and third national reports were also made available online for public review and comments.

#### Concerns with the Working of the UPR Process

The then UN Secretary General, Ban Ki-Moon had proclaimed that the UPR "has great potential to promote and protect human rights in the darkest corners of the world."<sup>20</sup> However, the UPR process has not lived up to this promise, for a variety of self-inflicted reasons.

First, states are free to accept recommendations, and to ignore (technically 'note') the ones they do not approve. In subsequent cycles their reports are required to focus primarily on the implementation of accepted recommendations.<sup>21</sup> This allows states to evade international accountability by simply ignoring those recommendations that deal with the most egregious and controversial human rights issues facing the country. The state under review is under no obligation to provide justification for rejecting a recommendation.

Further, recommendations vary in quality; from the very precise to the quite vague. A study of the first UPR cycle found that countries were more likely to accept recommendations that placed the least burden on them in terms of requiring specific actions. For example, they were more likely to accept vague, aspirational recommendations to 'continue efforts towards' a particular goal, rather than a precise recommendation to ratify a particular

- 20 United Nations Secretary General, Secretary-General's Video Message for the Opening of the Fourth Session of the Human Rights Council, 12 March 2007, available at https://www.un.org/sg/en/content/sg/statement/2007-03-12/secretary-generals-video-message-opening-fourth-session-human-rights
- 21 Human Rights Council, *Decision 17/119, Follow-up to the Human Rights Council Resolution 16/21 with regard to the Universal Periodic Review,* 19 June 2011, A/HRC/DEC/17/119

treaty or repeal a specific law.<sup>22</sup>

Second, while the word limits on national reports, which currently stands at 10,700 words,<sup>23</sup> was introduced to manage time and resources, this tight leash, again, allows states to evade the responsibility of fully explaining their position on a particular issue. Given the breadth of human rights concerns that all nations face, the limited word space allows states to get away with very cursory statements on controversial issue. This limits meaningful engagement on any given human rights issue. Therefore, the attempt to develop a mechanism that covers the breadth of human rights concerns comes at the cost of deep engagement with any issue.

Third, the Guidance Note issued by the OHCHR in advance of the 3rd cycle of review, asked states to classify previously accepted recommendations under headings such as 'fully implemented', 'partially implemented', 'in the process of implementation,' and 'not implemented yet.' With respect, realizing human rights is a work in progress, there is always scope for improvement in the conception and implementation of human rights standards. Furthermore, as stated above, many recommendations are so vaguely worded that there is no meaningful way to fully implement them. Therefore, categorizing recommendations relating to human rights as fully or partially implemented makes little sense other than giving states an easy means of superficially complying with a recommendation and then claiming that it has met its human rights obligation with respect to the relevant recommendation.

Fourth, the UPR foundational documents all state that the outcome of the review has to be implemented by the state concerned. There is no follow

<sup>22</sup> See Edward McMahon, "Herding Cats and Sheep: Assessing State and Regional Behavior in the Universal Periodic Review Mechanism of the United Nations Human Rights Council," Working Paper, University of Vermont, July 2010 (dividing recommendations into 5 categories on a scale from those that place the least amount of burden on a state, to the more precise recommendations that require specific state action."

<sup>23</sup> Office of High Commissioner for Human Rights, 3rd Cycle Universal Periodic Review National Report— Guidance Note, 2017, available at http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/UPR/3rdCycle\_GuidanceNotePreparationReports\_EN.docx

up between cycles on the status of implementation of recommendations. States can voluntarily choose to update the Council on the progress made.<sup>24</sup> However, this is not mandatory. While the Council cannot monitor the implementation of UPR recommendations in each state, it can definitely mandate certain follow up mechanisms, the least of which might be to require states to report on the institutions and structures they have created to implement the recommendations. This reporting requirement will at least push states towards creating such structures in the first place.

Finally, the interactive dialogue process is often hijacked by political wrangling and alignments. Countries often lobby allies to praise their efforts or to put forward 'soft' recommendations that are easy to accept.<sup>25</sup> Due to strict time limits, such interventions end up reducing the space for more meaningful engagement with a state's human rights record. Rather than a platform for critical self-assessment and peer review of a country's human rights record, UPR often devolves into an international arena for grandstanding.

#### The Indian Experience

India is a significant actor on the global stage and has engaged vigorously with international laws and institutions. In the field of human rights as well, India has participated actively in the development and working of the global human rights regime. India has been a member of the Human Rights Council since its inception, except for a one statutorily mandated break. It was one of the first countries to be reviewed under the UPR process.

However, many of the limitations of the UPR process are visible in India's engagement with the mechanism. The Indian government routinely ignores recommendations that do not align with state ideology. It accepts very few recommendations relating to civil and political rights, or on any sensitive or

<sup>24</sup> Human Rights Council, Resolution 16/21, Review of the work and functioning of the Human Rights Council, 25 March, 2011, A/HRC/RES/16/21.

<sup>25</sup> Human Rights Watch, UN: Nations Show True Colors at Rights Review, 13 February 2009, available at https://www.hrw.org/news/2009/02/13/un-nations-show-true-colorsrights-review

controversial issue. The bulk of the recommendations accepted by India relate to socio-economic rights, which are subject to progressive realization. More worryingly, the bulk of these recommendations are so vaguely worded as to put very little obligation on the state to take any concrete steps towards their implementation. It is therefore difficult to hold the Indian state accountable for non-implementation of accepted recommendations.

India also requires more meaningful follow up to the UPR process domestically. Once recommendations are accepted in Geneva, they are not translated into policy goals domestically. There is little to no follow up on the modalities and roadmap for implementing the recommendations. These recommendations do not form part of governmental deliberations in deciding state priorities and policies. India is yet to conduct a mid-term review of recommendations or to seek from its various ministries any updates on the status of implementation of the recommendations. Instead, at the time of the subsequent review, attempts are made to re-purpose ongoing schemes and projects, and showcase them as advances towards the implementation of UPR recommendations. The disconnect between recommendations accepted in Geneva and domestic policy and legislative priorities is most starkly evident with respect to torture. India agreed, both in 2008 and in 2012, to ratify the Convention Against Torture. However, despite repeated assurances, India has yet to implement this recommendation.

Finally, UPR is designed to be a consultative and collaborative process aimed at broad based involvement of stakeholders in determining ground level realities relating to a country's human rights obligations. As per the HRC, "[s]tates are encouraged to prepare the [national report] through a broad consultation process at the national level with all relevant stakeholders." However, such consultation is often perfunctory and one-off. Also, consultations are often Delhi centric due to insufficient resource and time allocation for broad based consultation. As a result, many crucial voices are not afforded any meaningful opportunity to engage with the UPR process.

<sup>26</sup> Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1, Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, 18 June, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1.

#### Conclusion

Despite its many drawbacks the UPR process provides an important peer review mechanism for the public and international scrutiny of a country's human rights record. This enables stakeholders to hold the country accountable for the commitments it makes and has the potential of changing state behavior because of the fear of international naming and shaming.

However, in order to be an effective vehicle for the implementation of human rights obligations, the UPR mechanism needs to align its operational protocols with its stated objectives and principles. Asking states to provide specific, precise and concrete recommendations; requiring the state under review to justify why it is rejecting a particular recommendation; requiring states to put in place institutional mechanisms for implementation of accepted recommendations and mandating periodic follow up to the HRC – might all aid in making the Universal Periodic Review a more robust mechanism for the global protection of human rights.

\*\*\*\*