

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNANCE: ISSUES AND CHALLENGES

13-14 October, 2012
CONFERENCE PROCEEDING

Vol. 2



॥ न्यायस्तत्र प्रमाणं स्यात् ॥



ORGANISED BY
NATIONAL LAW UNIVERSITY DELHI
Sector-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110078, India

**INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TRANSPARENCY
AND ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNANCE: ISSUES
AND CHALLENGES**

CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

NATIONAL LAW UNIVERSITY PRESS

© National Law University Delhi Press 2012

No part of this publication can be reproduced in any form or by any means without the prior permission of the publisher.

Note:

The papers included in this publication have been directly reproduced, with minimum editorial intervention, from the files sent by the respective authors. Any intellectual rights deferred arising out of papers published in the conference proceedings shall be liable directly to the author(s) of the said paper. The views and comments are absolutely personal and shall not be bound for any legal liability to the publisher and partners.

Published by:

National Law University, Delhi
Sector – 14, Dwarka, New Delhi – 110078
+91-11-28035-818

ISBN: 978-81-923638-7-5

For further copies please contact:

Registrar, National Law University, Delhi
Sector – 14, Dwarka, New Delhi – 110078
+91-11-280-34-255, +91-280-34-4254
www.nludelhi.ac.in

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNANCE: ISSUES AND CHALLENGES

ORGANISING COMMITTEE

Patron-in-Chief

Prof. (Dr.) Ranbir Singh

Vice Chancellor, National Law University Delhi

Advisory Committee

Prof. (Dr.) N.L. Mitra, Chancellor, KIIT University, Orissa

Prof. (Dr.) M.P. Singh, Chairman, Delhi Judicial Academy, Delhi

Prof. (Dr.) K.N. Chandrasekharan Pillai, Director, National Judicial Academy, Bhopal (Madhya Pradesh)

Prof. (Dr.) Veer Singh, Director, Punjab and Haryana State Judicial Academy

Prof. (Dr.) Paramjit S. Jaswal, Vice Chancellor, RGNUL, Patiala, Punjab

Prof. (Dr.) V. Vijayakumar, Vice-Chancellor, Tamil Nadu Dr. Ambedkar Law University, Chennai

Prof. Sachidanandham, Visiting Professor of Law, National Law University Delhi

Prof. (Dr.) Amar Singh Sankhyan, Professor of Law, National Law University, Delhi

Patron

Prof. (Dr.) Srikrishna Deva Rao, Professor of Law and Registrar, National Law University, Delhi

Conference Convener

Dr. Jeet Singh Mann, Assistant Professor of Law, National Law University, Delhi

Conference Co-convener

Dr. Vishal Mahalwar, Assistant Professor of Law, National Law University, Delhi

Editorial Committee

Dr. Jeet Singh Mann

Sarvatrajit Singh

Saral Minocha

Sanjeev Kumar

Nidhi C.

Chinmay Kanojia

Akshay Shreedhar

Media Partner

WITNESS

INDIA'S FIRST MAGAZINE ON LEGAL
AND CORPORATE AFFAIRS

www.witnesslive.in

THEMATICS SESSIONS

THEMATIC SESSION 1:

Public Accountability, Ethics in Governance, Public Hearing

THEMATIC SESSION 2:

Judicial Accountability and Standards

THEMATIC SESSION 3:

E-Governance, Right To Services, Citizens Charter

THEMATIC SESSION 4:

**Right to Information (Including Disclosure of Information and
Protection to Whistleblower)**

THEMATIC SESSION 5:

Lokpal and Lok Ayukta

PREFACE

The National Law University, Delhi is organizing its first International Conference on International Conference on Transparency and Accountability in Governance: Issues and Challenges at its state-of-the-art campus at Dwarka. The main objective of the conference is to discuss various issues concerning right to information activism, judicial standards and accountability, implications of the Lokpal and Lokayuktas (Ombudsman), citizen's charter on public services, whistleblower protections and quality governance, e-Governance and public hearings on public interest matters.

Globalization is a challenge and also an opportunity in the present times. We require the convergence of Economics, Technology and Law. India had a long history of business and technology. The potential has been unleashed through the process of liberalization. Yet the smooth sailing requires the compass called Rule of Law. We have mixed track record on this count. India has established itself as a democracy which is a success on the macro participative process of governance. Yet, there are other crucial issues of internal dimension.

There is a complex task of assimilation of the fractured social classes for centuries in such participation.

1. Cumulative economic progress needs to reach the various layers to create a development index which is fair and equitable.
2. Most importantly a transparent and speedy justice administration system which reinforces the faith in Rule of Law.

Good governance is a tool to help governments, businesses, and civil societies to fight corruption. Corruption can be curbed by systematic changes in governance through introducing participation, transparency, accountability and probity in administration. The right to good governance is also considered as an essential part of the citizen's rights that one can expect from the government.

Transparency and accountability are two of the central pillars of good governance. Transparency and accountability are current buzzwords of governance being used unsparingly not only in India, but by governments and international institutions all over the world. Transparency is also a necessary prerequisite for the exercise of accountability. Transparency and accountability are also significant for the efficient functioning of a modern economy and for fostering social well-being

On May 12, 2011, India became the 152nd country to ratify the United Nations Convention against Corruption, which was originally adopted by the UN General Assembly on October 31, 2003, and entered into force on December 14, 2005. India's ratification is characterized as a reaffirmation of

India's commitment to fight corruption and to undertake vigorously administrative legal reforms.

Accordingly, a number of initiatives have been taken by the government to incorporate citizen's concerns as inputs in the formulation of policy as well as in the quality and reliability of services. These can be brought through various tools, including the Citizens' Charters, Right to Information, e-Governance, and institution of ombudsman. These tools, for ensuring transparency and accountability, are powerful and have captured the attention of many activists, academics, and policy-makers around the world.

Our sincere endeavor will be to make legal education as justice education, as an instrument of social, political and economic change, and to prepare Lawyers who will be competent in the art of advocacy both at the trial and the appellate level and also skilled in judicial administration. The students of the National Law University, Delhi will be shaped as agents of change as the country mandates to achieve its developmental goals for future generations. The primary mission of the University will be to create Lawyers who will be professionally competent, technically sound and socially relevant, and will not only enter the Bar and the Bench but also be equipped to address the imperatives of the new millennium and uphold the Constitution of India. The aforementioned professional competency will be achieved as the Conference is going to be presided by prestigious scholars like Dr. T.K Vishwanathan, Justice J.S Verma, Shri PP Rao, Prof (Dr) B.B. Pande, Prof (Dr) Veer Singh, Shri Soli Sorabjee, Shri Wajahat Habibullah, Prof (Dr) Faizan Mustfa, Prof (Dr) Vijayakumar, Justice Santosh Hegde, Ms. Kiran Bedi, and Prof (Dr) M.P.Singh whose presence will stimulate intellectual debates on the topics of contemporary relevance. It is one of the first conferences in our country where the above mentioned stalwarts culminate to discuss on these issues. We are thankful to all of them for chalking a time out of their busy schedule to address the students of the college as well as others present on these coeval topics.

We are also grateful to our Vice Chancellor Prof (Dr) Ranbir Singh for his constant support, encouragement and guidance, without which this programme would have not been possible.

The Conference will provide an international platform to all stake holders to address contemporary issues pertaining to accountability and transparency in governance. The Organizing Committee received an overwhelming 266 abstracts for consideration for the proceedings of the Conference. After thorough evaluation, both in terms of quality of research and variety of research the Abstract Screening Committee selected 115 abstracts and their full papers for publication. This book is a compilation of these full papers.

Editorial Committee

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME TWO

THEMATIC SESSION 4: RIGHT TO INFORMATION (INCLUDING DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION AND PROTECTION TO WHISTLEBLOWER)

Exemplifying The Independence Of Judiciary From The Contradicting R.T.I. Act 2005 <i>Avinash Jain</i>	1
Right To Information As A Tool Of Good Governance <i>Dr. Komal</i>	12
Transparency In Administration: An Impact Study Of Rti Act, 2005 <i>Dr. Rajbir Singh Dalal</i>	27
RTI Activism: Malefic Pessimism Or Benefic Optimism <i>Dr. Rakesh Mohan Sharma</i>	35
Empowering Freedom Of Information Endeavour To Ensure Transparency And Accountability In Governance Of Public Authority <i>Dr. Jeet Singh Mann</i>	49
Right To Information And Role Of Media <i>Antara Basu & Ujjawal Bhushan</i>	67
Right To Information Activism <i>Amrit Subhadarsi & Akhil Peddinti</i>	76
Synchronisation Of Official Secrecy And Access To Information: A Myth Or Reality? <i>Dr. Mini S</i>	90
Right To Information Act, 2005: A Critical Analysis <i>Jay Datt Bhatt</i>	98
Emergence Of RTI At The Dawn Of Environmental Awareness And Accountability <i>Sanjeev Menon & Sumalya Goswami</i>	103
Evolving Jurisprudence Of Information Right <i>Dr. Vishal Mahalwar</i>	120
Disclosure Of Information Of Patent Specification During Patent Pending – A Critical Analysis	125

Dr. R Srinivasan

Right To Information Act 2005: Operational Issues And Major Concerns <i>Manish Kumar Khunger</i>	133
Journey Of RTI Act: A Story Of Reform <i>Rohit Agarwal</i>	140
Right To Information: What Is Still Missing? <i>Anju Sarah Abraham & Ayushi Gaur</i>	146
Right To Information: Loopholes And Probable Solutions <i>Dhananjay Khashyap & Vipul Yash</i>	155
Right To Information: Evolution, Scope And Solutions <i>Payal Lamba</i>	165
Whistle-Blower Protection: Vision To Maintain The Potency Of The Blowing Trumpet <i>Kazim Rizvi</i>	179
Whistle Blower Law As A Tool To Prevent Corruption <i>Devi Shri R & Arsha V</i>	195
Role Of Central Vigilance Commission (Cvc) & Its State Level Counterparts In Protection And Emancipation Of Whistle-Blowers <i>Shashaank Bhansali</i>	207
A Critical Study On The Exclusion Of The State Government Officials And SPG (Special Protection Group) from the Ambit of the Whistleblower Protection Bill 2011 <i>Heli Pathak & Ferzin Batliwala</i>	221
Whistle Blower Protection Regime In India And Outside: With Special Reference To Whistle Blower Protection Bill <i>Arunima Tiwari & Saurabh Mishra</i>	230
Medium Of Whistleblowing And The Protection For Gentlemen 'Whistleblowing' <i>M Milad & C S Dhanya</i>	244
Corporate Frauds & Whistle Blowing <i>Deepankar Sharma</i>	256
Whistleblower Laws: Is The Scapegoat Safe? <i>Ali Amerjee & Naseeruddin Ahmad</i>	266

Whistleblower Protection Bill: Invitation Or Insurgency? <i>Megha Chandhiokis & Dr. G L Sharma</i>	281
A Comparative Analysis Of The Whistle Blower Protection: Mechanisms In India And The USA <i>Pankhuri Mehndiratta & Shriyani Datta</i>	288
Whistleblowers – The Artist Without Hands <i>S Nandini Pahari & Sanjeev S</i>	299
Whistleblower Protection: Issues And Challenges <i>Sarvatrajit Singh & Sanjeev Kumar</i>	313
The Public Interest Disclosure And Protection To Persons Making The Disclosures Bill, 2010: Comparative Analysis With International Best Standards For Ensuring Better Accountability <i>Anchit Tripathi & Kshitiz Sharma</i>	329
Whistleblower Law: A Step Towards Good Governance <i>Chaitra R Beerannavar</i>	344
Blowing The Whistle On Protection For Whistleblowers <i>Saman Naseem & Shiva Bhasin</i>	359
An Effective Whistle Blower Protection In India: Need Of The Hour <i>N Sudarshan</i>	371
Protection Of Whistle Blowers - A Step Towards Good Governance, Transparency And Accountability: An Indian Perspective <i>Dr. Sunitha Abhay Jain</i>	378

THEMATIC SESSION 5: LOKPAL AND LOK AYUKTA

Implications Of The Lokayuktas (Ombudsman) Vis-À-Vis Transparency And Accountability On Governance: A Special Case Study Of Delhi's Lokayukta <i>Dr. Ritu Gupta</i>	392
A Critical Study Of Lokayuktas And Lokpal Vs Jan Lokpal Bill <i>Shreyali Srivastava</i>	401
Lokpal: Where It Is All Going Wrong? <i>Aditi Bajaj & Vasudha Gupta</i>	408

Good Governance- A Precursor To The Lokpal Movement <i>Jenifar Zaman & Akansha Seth</i>	420
Lokpal Bill And Its Implication In Combating Corruption <i>Dilip Sharma</i>	429
Lokpal To Hopepal: Let's Make Opaque Archaic <i>Madhuri Sharma</i>	441
The Lokpal And Lokayukta Bill 2011: An Overview Of The Power To Investigate And Prosecute Public Servants Without Sanction <i>Prashant Kumar Tahiliani & Manas Vibhu</i>	451
Functional Analysis Of The Lokayukta System <i>Madhulika Sharma</i>	461
Lokpal -No Magic Wand For Transparency And Accountability In Governance <i>Gurpreet Kaur Wadhwa & Archika Gupta</i>	472
Lokpal - A Scarecrow or Cure of Corruption <i>Dr. Madhu Soodan S. Rajpurohit</i>	485